SWIMMING SLOWLY, IN THE SEA, AT SAN SEBASTIAN:

CONVALESCENCE, MEMORY, AND THE BODY IN ERNEST

HEMINGWAY'S THE SUN ALSO RISES

by

JEREMY COLLINS

(Under the direction of Dr. Carolyn Medine)

ABSTRACT

‘‘Emotion,” Spinoza writes, “which is suffering, ceases to be suffering once we form a clear picture of it.” The Sun Also Rises by Ernest Hemingway is the story of Jake Barnes struggle to form a clear picture of his suffering amongst the Lost Generation of post-World War One Europe. In this thesis, we will take a thorough look at Hemingway's use of the images of football, youth, and war in relation to the characters of Robert Cohn and Jake Barnes. We will find through looking at the relationship of these characters and these images, where to locate meaning in the novel. The thesis will also use the larger body of Hemingway's work, fiction and non-fiction, biography, and letters. Through looking closely at the novel and its greater context, we can see how Hemingway offers a protagonist who overcomes both his personal disaster and the crisis of the age: nihilism.

INDEX WORDS: Hemingway, Nihilism, The Sun Also Rises, Memory, Sports, Existentialism.

SWIMMING SLOWLY, IN THE SEA, AT SAN SEBASTIAN: CONVALESCENCE, MEMORY, AND THE BODY IN ERNEST HEMINGWAY'S THE SUN ALSO RISES

by

JEREMY COLLINS

B.A., The University of Georgia, 2000

A Thesis Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of The University of Georgia in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree

MASTER OF ARTS

ATHENS, GEORGIA

2002

SWIMMING SLOWLY, IN THE SEA, AT SAN SEBASTIAN: CONVALESCENCE, MEMORY, AND THE BODY IN ERNEST HEMINGWAY'S THE SUN ALSO RISES

by

Jeremy Collins

Approved:

Major Professor: Carolyn Medine

Committee: Hubert McAlexander
Carolyn Medine
William Power

Electronic Version Approved:

Gordhan L. Patel
Dean of the Graduate School
The University of Georgia
August 2002

DEDICATION

In front of a classroom of about twelve students, in a voice that was neither northern nasal or southern drawl, but somewhere in the middle, somewhere in between, the Virginia coast maybe, chesapeake accents, a mid-Atlantic state, Dr. Steven Harvey read from The Sun Also Rises.

> I took the trout ashore, washed them in the cold, smoothly heavy water above the dam, and then picked some ferns and packed them all in the bag, three trout on a layer of ferns, then another layer of ferns, then three more trout, and then covered them with ferns. They looked nice in the ferns, and now the bag was bulky, and I put it in the shade of the tree.

He spoke with a soft, unhurried intensity. He spoke with reverence. When he was done, the room was slightly altered and charged. The world was somehow more real and Hemingway's account of a fishing trip was now a part of our own experience. This is what Hemingway intended. This is how Dr. Harvey read. I left his classroom and headed for the library to find this book that sounded like poetry.

In gratitude to his passion and commitment to the written word and the ordeal of the soul, this thesis is dedicated to my teacher, Dr. Steven Harvey, who is also unquestionably the most gifted banjo player/English professor at Young Harris College. He demanded, pushed, and prodded, without ever having to demand, push, or prod. Instead, he ceaselessly taught, read, smiled, and questioned. In short, he opened my life to the reflective and transforming power of literature. For this, I owe him immensely. "Teaching," he once wrote, "is the knife." The knife—a tool to cut through the

unessential, a tool to puncture and open, a tool to perform surgery, a tool to carve and fashion out of a block of wood a simple, hard-won, creation.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank Dr. Hubert McAlexander whose mentoring and friendship has been one of the most valuable and rewarding experiences I have had at the University. Dr. McAlexander has been a part of this project since the thesis began as a five-page paper in the spring of 1998 in his undergraduate class. His expertise in American letters and Modernism as well as his guidance and encouragement has been invaluable for this thesis and beyond.

I also want to thank Dr. Theodore Lewis, a first-rate scholar in Hebrew Bible/Old Testament, Semitic Languages, and Ancient Near Eastern Studies, who always went out of his way to take an interest in the lives of students around him outside of his own field. Dr. Lewis might have been in the process of writing an article on Cults of the Dead in Ancient Israel, but was always curious to know what was happening in the world of religion and literature. Dr. Lewis has been an inspiration to many throughout the University and I count myself lucky to have been touched by his example of professionalism, scholarship, and humanity.

I would also like to thank Dr. Carolyn Medine for all of her patience, grace, and insight that she has given me over the past two years. Dr. Medine's talented and careful eye within the field of religion and literature gave much of this project form and shape.

A necessary thank you is needed for Dr. William Power for his biting wit, his acumen in the world of Theology, and the patience he has shown in having to read paper after paper on Nietzsche.

Also I would like to thank, Dr. Thomas Slater for his help in making the experience of graduate school and its day to day activities more pleasurable and adding an international flair to the experience.

And a special thanks is due to Dr. Glen Wallis who, in a very brief time, provided an example of a life that is lived out of the material one studies. He encouraged us as graduate students to dig deeper, find more, and then to keep digging.

I also want to thank the three class sections and students of Religion 1001 who were receptive, questioning, and insightful on the themes of Hemingway and Religion.

How can I not acknowledge *meinen Brudern* Eric Covington and Sonam Kachru? Both of who...have paid their dues.

Finally, I would like to thank my sister Laura Collins, who made my last year here, her first, an even more rewarding, and enriching experience. I wish her all the best. Numbers 6:24-26.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

CHAPTER 1

IMPOTENCY, NIHILISM, AND THE SEARCH FOR "HOW TO LIVE IN IT."

> Nihilism, then, is the recognition of the long waste of strength, the agony of the 'in vain,' insecurity, the lack of any opportunity to recover and to regain composure—being ashamed in front of oneself, as if one had deceived oneself all too long.[1]
>
> -Fredrich Nietzsche
> The Will to Power

"Love life again," a recent full-page magazine advertisement for sildenafil citrate encourages us. Featured on the glossy page is a middle-aged man wearing blue jeans and an unbuttoned flannel shirt exposing an olive, earth toned tee shirt underneath. The man sits on a barstool in what appears to be either a garage or a painting studio. He is caught leaning slightly forward. The background of the room is unclear and out of focus as sunlight pours through the window behind the man, filling and clouding the table, the workbench or easel, in the background with light. The man with thinning hair in front combed back, exposing a high forehead with horizontal lines is smiling. His sleeves are rolled up, almost to his elbows. There is a glimmer of sorts in his eyes. His grin is slightly to the side, exposing a few white teeth.

Sildenfil citrate is more commonly known as Viagra. And in fine print, we are told that it is not for everyone. Women should not take it. Men should consult their doctors first. There is a free trial-offer available. A 1-800 number is given. A web-site too and in larger print, at the bottom of the page, the reminder and encouragement, "Love life again."[2]

---

[1] Fredrich Nietzsche. The Will to Power, translated by Walter Kauffman.(Vintage Publishing, New York. 1968),12.

[2] *Sports Illustrated Magazine*, 16 July 2001, 35.

Ernest Hemingway was not the first or the last Modernist writer to capture the prevailing need for romantic love after the crisis of the First World War. Like all wars it produced a certain need for physical intimacy because of prolonged sexual deprivation on the field and at home. Within the human experience there seems to be something about the sudden and prevalent threat of death that creates an increased need for acts of physical intimacy. War, it has been said, heightens and quickens life; and in an atmosphere where everything is charged, closeness to another takes on greater depth and meaning. W.H. Auden writes, "In times of war even the crudest kind of positive affection between persons seems extraordinarily beautiful, a noble symbol of the peace and forgiveness of which the whole world stands so desperately needed."[3] Auden was writing in 1947, basing most of his observation not only on the Second World War, but also on his experience of growing up in the aftermath of the First.

War and love are intrinsic parts of the life of a community. In literature, both oral and written, from Odysseus to David of Israel, the Crusaders of Europe to Native American tribes on the American plains, various communities have captured their own attempts to create structures and support for returning soldiers and their transitions back into society. The First World War and the birth of modern warfare, signal the modern collapse of this structure.[4] Part of this collapse was due to the fact that its civilians fought the war itself: entire segments of Europe's male population were destroyed, thus

---

[3] Paul Fussell. The Great War and Modern Memory, (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1975,) 175.

[4] The successful return of a soldier to home and integration back into society has been a complex and universal motif in Western Literature, beginning as early with Homer's Odyessy and 2nd Samuel in the Hebrew Bible. Within the American context, returning home from war presents with it a range of responses depending on the type of conflict and the political situation within the States. The First World War introduced such new concepts as "shell-shock" which would later become in Vietnam, "Post-Traumatic-Stress-Syndrome." This "disorder" is found throughout Hemingway's works and is especially prevalent in The Sun Also Rises. There are a number of psychological parallels between the experience of the First World War and the experience of Vietnam. Both were fought in surrealist-like landscapes, in hellish conditions, with new weapons of mass destruction, and in zones where the enemy was less of an actual, constant physical force

consuming the fabric of many of the communities. But even if these men had returned in larger numbers, the horror of the First World War would still be felt. Survivors would be faced with not so much what they had to return *to* but what they had *returned from*. The nature of the modern warfare and the gruesome and massive ways in which men died changed the entire course of our modern experience. After the war, those who did make it back home were never completely home; a part still lived within the tortured echoes of the war.[5]

The bedroom did not escape the lingering effects of modern warfare. For D.H. Lawrence the fascination with modern impotency and empty sex was shown through male characters who are somehow psychologically shell-shocked into impotence. In the poetry of T.S. Eliot, we are given glimpses of sterility between lovers and the mechanization, the routine, and the failure of sex to provide anything more than "distraction." We see this in "The Wasteland" for example:

> She turns and looks a moment in the glass,
> Hardly aware of her departed lover;
> Her brain allows one half-formed thought to pass:
> "Well, now that's done: and I'm glad it's over."
> When lovely woman stoops to folly and
> Paces about her room again, alone,
> She smoothes her hair with automatic hand,
> And puts a record on the gramophone.

In this post-war world where the interaction of intimacy is little more then the playing of assigned roles, narcissism, and the continuation of the cognitive state of being unaware, we find that for many, love had turned sour.[6] In the crisis of the age, Modernists, who

---

and more of an enigma. These parallels and others are explored in Jonathan Shay's Achilles in Vietnam: Combat Trauma and the Undoing of Character, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 1995).

[6] Consider Lawrence's poem "Sex Won't Work," dealing with sex and modern existence. "Sex won't work in captivity. /Man is one of those beasts that will breed in a cage. / He can copulate and beget children/but without desire, without joy, without release. /The cage, which does not kill the mechanism of sex/kills entirely the true experience of sex." D.H.Lawrence. The Collected Poems, (Penguin Publishers, New York, 1977), 843.

could not turn to the church or to political causes looked to the question of love, community, and friendship, finding for the most part, that even these venues had been tainted, fast-eroding and corrupted by the war. The mechanization of love had occurred, and sex was infected; instead of being a liberating experience from modern chaos, it became another form of this chaos. A particularly modern form of chaos: a routine both silent and desperate.

Ernest Hemingway captured this conflict in such a way that his novels The Sun Also Rises and A Farewell to Arms have come to stand as the foremost accounts of this tension within his generation. For Hemingway, the capacity to love and find meaning in love, despite the horror of modern existence, is crucial. It is a religious experience for Hemingway. Love comes to occupy a place and position in the heart formerly given only to God. In A Farewell to Arms, Fredric finds love with Catherine despite and maybe even because of the war, only to have it taken away at the end. But before her death, their love acts as the replacement of religion while duty to the state becomes commitment to each other. At one point, Catherine tells Fredric, “You are my religion.” However, we see in the end with Catherine’s death, the fragile, mortal nature of love. Neither story ends happily; most did not after the war. But on one level, A Farewell to Arms is a success story. Fredric finds love. He has the memory of love and a story to tell and shape his future no matter how painful it is. Jake Barnes on the other hand, in The Sun Also Rises is caught in a quite different pain. His pain is a type of continual living death. He knows life’s fragility. He knows love’s sacredness. And he knows he will never know romantic love again. Jake is impotent.

It has become easy for some critics to dismiss Hemingway as either too simple or banal because of his emphasis on the body, its needs, its pleasure, and its potential for meaning. Hemingway was something of a “naturalistic aesthetic and his attraction to the human body and nature is not the love of the primitive savage, nor is it a Thoreau-

like escape. As we will see later, Hemingway's training as a naturalist was intense. His father, a medical doctor, brought Ernest up in the Agassiz method of natural observation. As a child, Hemingway spent the summers in the wilderness of northern Michigan, swimming, hunting, fishing, and hiking at the incredibly young age of four. To make a comprehensive sweep of moments in the Hemingway canon expressing his reverence for the land would be a undertaking. But from the earliest *in our time* stories until The Old Man and the Sea we see this reverence for not only enjoying the land, but also understanding the physical geography, biological life, and conservation of the land.[7] Despite this, Hemingway's reverence for the outdoors and its spiritual potentialities is often overlooked and the name most often associated with conservation and the outdoors in the American literary consciousness is Henry Thoreau. In reality, Thoreau's 'experiment' at Walden Pond was simply that, "an experiment." Hemingway lived in both worlds, societal and natural, quite well. Albert Murray captures this in The Blue Devils of Nada:

> He [Hemingway] knew too much about its [nature's] complexity to become over sentimental about it...Thoreau, on the other hand, was a man trying to prove a point. He went into the (nearby) woods to get away from the complexity of society. His two-year residence in the thickets was part experiment and part protest demonstration and he spent most of that time reading, puttering about, theorizing, behaving for all the world like a decadent intellectual dabbling in petit trianon primitivism. Thoreau was a Harvard boy playing boy-scout games—as if the whole country had already been settled and overcivilized. In 1845![8]

Hemingway takes a similar tone when discussing Thoreau and his "Naturalism" in The Green Hills of Africa. He writes, "There is one [Naturalist] at that time that is supposed to be really good, Thoreau. I cannot tell you about it because I have not been able to read

---

[7]. For a good overview see Susan F. Beegel's "Eye and Heart: Hemingway's Education as a Naturalist," from A Historical Guide to Ernest Hemingway, ed. Linda Wagner Martin (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2000), 53-93.

[8] Albert Murrary. The Blue Devils of Nada, (Pantheon Books, New York, 1996), 196.

it...I can not read other naturalists unless they are being extremely accurate and not literary." Earlier, in the same passage, Hemingway comments on Emerson, Hawthorne, and the Transcendentalists, in a passage that reveals to us the importance Hemingway of the search for meaning as being both a mental and physical undertaking. He writes, "They did not use the words that people always have used in speech, the words that survive in language. Nor would you gather that they had bodies. They had minds, yes. Nice, dry, clean minds."[9]

For Hemingway, the body provided rich and complex means for men and women to overcome the nihilism and meaninglessness of the age. The Sun Also Rises is a novel that locates questions of axiology in the domain of the body, the memory, and interaction with and in the natural world. Throughout the novel as well as his career, Hemingway echoed Ecclesiastes and its proverbial non-metaphysical and concrete instruction on finding meaning within the world:

> So I commend enjoyment, for there is nothing better for people under the sun then to eat, and drink, and enjoy themselves, for this will go with them in their toil through the days of life that God gives them under the sun...Go, eat your bread with enjoyment, and drink your wine with a merry heart...Enjoy the life with the wife you love, all the days of your vain life that are given you under the sun.[10]

For a writer concerned with manhood, virility, and the theme of the sexual body as a source of meaning, Hemingway created perhaps his most complex character in Jake Barnes. Hemingway's protagonist, like Hemingway himself, has been injured on the Italian Front during the First World War and like the seventeen- year-old war-veteran from Oak Park, Illinois, Jake Barnes has come close to death. However, unlike

[9] Ernest Hemingway. The Green Hills of Africa, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 1935), 21.
[10] Ecclesiastes 8:15, 9:7-9

Hemingway, and perhaps closer to Hemingway's fears, Jake has been rendered impotent by the war.

Impotency is what gives Jake his compounded tragic nature. He is a part of the ''Lost Generation,'' which has seen the most gruesome warfare known to man, only to come home and see the collapse and disintegration of society around him. To add to this loss, Jake has lost his sexual capacity. With the death of God and the birth of modern warfare, romantic love, perhaps the last chance for a life heightened and life deepened has been removed.

The novel, arguably Hemingway's most enduring, is the story of Jake's paradoxical survival and transition into ex-patriate life in Europe after the war. How is Jake Barnes survival *paradoxical*? Or in a larger scope, in light of the twentieth century and its mass destructiveness in what sense is every "survival" somehow paradoxical? Maurice Blanchot delicately captures the tension in surviving we will find in Jake Barnes. "The disaster," Blanchot writes, "ruins everything, all the while leaving everything intact."[11]

A paradox: the disaster, an event that ruins everything, yet leaves everything intact. A world in which everything has changed, but nothing seems to have changed at all. For Fredric, at the end of A Farewell to Arms, life as he has known it is changed and he knows it. For Jake, life as he has known it has changed but the change is so severe, total, that he can not begin to see how he should live or what he should do or if there is anything to do.

The Sun Also Rises is the slow unfolding of Jake Barnes disaster. He is still in the world, but has yet to recognize how his world is irrevocably changed. While Jake finds pleasure in the simple acts of eating, fishing, and drinking with friends, there is a

[11] Maurice Blanchot. The Writing of The Disaster, translated by Ann Smock, (University of Nebraska Press, Lincoln, 1995), 1.

shadow, a dis-ease, that fills these experiences. This sense of life, in which things are not quite right, exerts itself consciously and subconsciously on Jake at different times in the novel. The shadow, the phallic injury, the permanent sexual wound are the constant reminders of death and his embodied mortality. The "death" Jake must confront is on many fronts. Death is in his wound, which is a complex reminder of the death Jake has escaped, the death of his generation on battlefields in Europe, his own immanent death, and somehow, the death of the future and the children, who will never live or out live him.

Jake's impotence is, therefore, also a larger paradigm for the age and the birth of Modernism and the 'Lost Generation.' Jake's inability to deal with his wound and recognize its limitations reaches beyond the scope of frustrated nights and beyond the closed doors of Spanish and Parisian bedrooms. Jake's "incapacity to consummate" romantic love ultimately becomes a more general and more pervasive incapacity. This is found in his inability to sleep, his inability to maintain the bullfighting code of honor with Montoya, the inability to pray, all of which lead back to the overall inability to come to terms with what has happened in the war. What "happened" in the war is still a presence for Jake. It is still "happening." This disjunction between past and present creates fragmentation and this fragmentation yields insomnia, "sentimental" dinners with prostitutes, reading Turgeneff and trying to sketch himself into the story, trying to pray and trying, above all else, not-think about *it*, the injury.

Jake's injury is real and his paradox is severe. Hemingway tells us that Jake is not castrated but instead, "he had been wounded in quite a different way and his testicles were *intact and not damaged*. Thus he was *capable* of all normal feelings as a man but *incapable* of consummating them."[12] This paradox, on another level, is echoed

[12] Ernest Hemingway, interview with George Plimpton, in Modern Critical Views: Ernest Hemingway, ed. Harold Bloom, (Chelsea House Publishers, New York, 1985), 191.

early in the novel as Jake reflects on lying wounded in a hospital bed and being visited by an Italian colonel and liaison. The officer bemoans Jake's fate, "'You, a foreigner [an American]...have given more than your life...*Che mala fortuna! Che mala fortuna! {the terrible fortune, the terrible fortune!}*.'"[13]

The paradoxes of Jake Barnes: capable, yet incapable, everything as ruined, while everything is intact. Another part of the colonel's statement gets at the paradoxical question of survival and our reasoning for seeing Fredric in A Farewell to Arms as more capable of recovering then Jake. How can one give more then one's life? Are there instances when the demands of living after the disaster are worse than death?

For Jake to be able to re-orient his life in a meaningful way, he must be able to posses and use the powers of negation and affirmation with equal and skillful force. This ability will be his key to bring about a way of being in the world. Jake is caught throughout the novel between the forces of "not thinking" about the wound and attempting to move through his pain into something affirmative. The existential situation Hemingway gives Jake is articulated during one of Jake's late night struggles with insomnia. Jake surrenders the false stoic stance, the empty laughter, and allows the wound and the trauma of the past to become a more pressing, more urgent, necessity. Jake thinks,

> I did not care what it was all about. All I wanted to know was how to live in it. Maybe if you found out how to live in it you learned from that what it was all about.[14]

The tension between *what* and *how*, surrendering the search for *what* as the starting point (essence) and letting the means, the *how* (existence) shape reality is Jake's

[13] Ernest Hemingway. The Sun Also Rises, from The Hemingway Reader, ed. by Charles Poore, (Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1960), 39. From this point, The Sun Also Rises will be refereed to with the abbreviation TSAR.

ultimate need. The *hows* will allow Jake to see *what* to live for. This tension also shows Hemingway's anticipation of Existentialism and the shifting scales of meaning and values within the Western world.[15] For Jake, learning how to live *in* it, the world, is synonymous with learning how to live *with* it*,* the wound. For Jake, this question and method of focusing on *how* begins with relinquishing any illusions about *what* life now has in store. This understanding is directly related to Brett, the past, desire, function, letting go, and letting be. For Jake, as we will see, it also involves moving into a more fluid understanding (the hows) of his existence instead of a static conception (the whats, the essences) of the world. Throughout most of the book, we see these tensions pulling at Jake. Within these tensions, Jake's knowledge, if he is to achieve it, will ultimately be tragic.

Tragic realization for Jake must come in two stages. The first is for Jake to come to the grim conclusion, that for him, the opportunity for romantic love is dead. The need to recognize this limitation will in turn give the other aspects of his life a newness, a sharpness, and focus. This sharpness in perception and understanding of values and knowing "when you got your money's worth" is the second essential aspect of Jake's realization. While Jake negates what is no longer possible, a space is created where he can find something to affirm in a deep and meaningful way. Jake must create some type of activity or code or style that can see him through the absence of physical love and through the rest of his life.[16] This primary impetus of this work is to see how Jake Barnes comes to his tragic knowledge through the process of affirmation and negation, and how Jake's victory is Hemingway's response to overcoming nihilism.

---

[14] ibid. 152
[15] Hemingway's passage predates Sartre's "Existence preceding essence" by almost thirty years.
[16] Edmund Wilson's famous essay "Hemingway: Gauge of Morale" from: The Wound and the Bow, (Ohio University Press. Columbus, 1997), shows how the creation of a code or way of living is most often the goal for Hemingway's protagonists.

The term ‘nihilism’ will appear throughout our look at Hemingway’s work and his time, but here we should clarify what we mean by the notorious slippery term ‘nihilism.”[17] Here, and throughout the following chapters, it is used, unless noted otherwise, in the Nietzschean sense. Because Nietzsche uses Nihilism at least three different ways to denote behavior, forces, and thought from such fields as morals, history, philosophy, religion, art, reading, writing, diet, and climate, we should be clear about the two main forms of our use of Nihilism here.

The first usage of the term is in the historical movement Nietzsche uncannily foresaw and predicted. Nietzsche writes in The Will to Power on, what we can call the “collective threat” of nihilism in the West:

> What I relate is the history of the next two centuries. I describe what is coming, what can no longer come differently: the advent of nihilism...For some time now, our whole European culture has been moving as toward a catastrophe, with a *tortured tension* that is growing from decade to decade: restlessly, violently, headlong, like a river that wants to reach an end.[18]

It is interesting to note that Nietzsche wrote this sometime between 1883-1888. The second form and perhaps most misunderstood is when Nietzsche refers to himself as a nihilist. Critics of Nietzsche seem to enjoy picking on these phrases to try to show the connection between Nietzsche and the notorious bad readers that came after him. Overall, when Nietzsche refers to himself as a nihilist it is in reference to his age and the cultural situation he is in. He is a “transitional nihilist” in the sense that as one structure of values in the west is collapsing, for there to be another, the collapse must come about completely. Nietzsche did not advocate political revolution. Rather, he was speaking of a revolution of ideas. This “transitional nihilism” is referred to when Nietzsche speaks of philosophizing with a hammer. The hammer serves three purposes. It acts as the

sounding instrument to test the soundness of the gods and our values. It also provides the hammer blow to destroy these objects if they are found lacking, and finally, the hammer is the constructive tool by which a new system and ideals can be constructed.

The third way nihilism is used in the Nietzschean sense is in reference to an "original nihilism." This is an experience that all men and women throughout time and place have been capable of experiencing. It is the seeing of the void, of the nothing, the "cold breath of empty space," a universe without ultimate grounding, meaning, or self-sustaining, independent God. Nietzsche believed that the Greek response to suffering, particularly in the Pre-Socratics and Homer, were honorable because they embraced mortality, suffering, and the unknown. This was Nietzsche's major criticism of the Judeo-Christian metaphysical systems. He saw in their response to Nihilism resentment and avoidance of the transient reality of life. Because these systems avoid the harsh realities of existence, they create an imaginary structure of a fallen world in need of redemption, a messiah, and a God who seeks revenge. This is a far cry of the Greek notion of embracing the earth and suffering. "Suffer into truth," Aeschylus tells us. Nietzsche holds that if we seek to find imaginary other worlds and imaginary heavens, we will ultimately devalue this world and this life. Therefore, for Nietzsche, Platonism, and the otherworldly metaphysics of monotheism represent a nihilistic response to nihilism.

As we will see throughout the following chapters, Hemingway response to all three of these manifestations of nihilism, either directly in his work or through his aesthetic methodology. In Jake Barnes, we find the historical catastrophe of nihilism and the First World War and the subsequent void left by the emptiness of the church. Despite this, in the end, Jake Barnes eventually does find a way to live within the modern world and with his wound. He discovers a way in which to live on good terms with what life can and can not offer him. At the end of the novel, we see Jake Barnes at a new beginning.

---

[18] Nietzsche, The Will to Power, (Vintage Publishing, New York. 1968), 678.

The end, Jake's goodbye to Brett, is Jake's moment of tragic knowledge of both negation and affirmation. Commentators and critics have longed argued about the seemingly ambivalent ending that Hemingway leaves us with. The end, like the beginning, gives us Jake and Brett in the backseat of a car, traveling together. We will look in detail at this section later, but it is worth keeping in mind these last lines,

> "Oh, Jake," Brett said, "we could have had such a damned good time together. "
> Ahead was a mounted policeman in khakis directing traffic. He raised his baton. The car slowed suddenly pressing Brett against me.
> "Yes," I said, "Isn't it pretty to think so."
>
> THE END

This moment, as we will see, represents Jake Barnes acceptance of the fact that romantic love is no longer a reality for him. In the end we see that Jake has learned his own conditions to establish what can only be termed, "peace of soul." Jake's victory takes place in the depths and silences of his own self. The 'peace of soul' Jake *creates* can be called Nietzschean. Arguably the first modernist, Nietzsche, shared Hemingway's suspicion of language, and sought to develop new conceptions of the body, the soul, and peace, arguing that such peace(s), which we usually only associated with traditional religious devotion within the church, are found in many ways. Nietzsche, writes in Twilight of the Idols of a 'peace of soul' that aptly describes the realization of limitation that leads to affirmation for Jake Barnes,

> 'Peace of soul' is merely a misunderstanding---something else that simply does not know how to give itself a more honest name...'peace of soul' can for example be...the appearance of a certainty, even a dreadful certainty, after the *protracted tension and torture* of an uncertainty.[19]

Despite Jake's tension and torture throughout the novel, there are moments, hints, that life can again hold richness and fullness. These scenes and glimpses take place in the world of the outdoors and in the realm of sports, finally culminating in Jake's swim in the waters of San Sebastian. In the fishing and bullfighting scenes throughout the novel, Jake seems most alive and it is through this engagement in sports that Jake will begin to encounter his wounded memory. As we will see, Jake finds the tremors and fault lines of his wounding and through an initial memory of football, which, in turn brings an increased awareness of the need for a healing. These connections, as we will see, are shown through the connection of swimming and water with youth and injury. The realm of sports is an active field of psychological complexity and memory for Jake and the values he learns through his interaction in this world gradually gain a momentum that led to a 'peace of soul.' This peace is particularly modernist; it is earned through a simultaneous process of negation, (the recognition of a dreadful certainty), and affirmation.

SPORTS AND THE POTENTIAL FOR MEANINGS IN HEMINGWAY

"Romero had the old thing."

-Jake Barnes watching the bullfighter Pedro Romero

The interpretative framework of sports in The Sun Also Rises revolves around three central sports scenes and their relationship with Jake's effort to live with his wound: the fishing scene with Gorton and Harris at Burguete, the toreo and its revelation of code through Romero, and the swimming scene at San Sebastian. A critical

[19] Friedrich Nietzsche. The Twilight of The Idols, trans. R.J. Hollingdale, (Penguin Books, London,

consensus has been reached that these scenes are centers of meaning for Jake in the novel; the interpretation of these scenes, however, varies intensely. The fishing scene at Burguete, for example, has been interpreted both as Jake coming to a sacred place of healthful rejuvenation[20] *and* as a percussive sign of the degenerative losses Jake will soon experience at the fiesta.[21]

In this chapter, we will not propose a new interpretive means to read the classical Hemingway sports of fishing or the bullfights. These sports receive the most coverage in criticism on the novel in relation to Jake's personal "code" as pragmatically heroic, faithful Catholic neo-orthodox, or battle-weary nihilist. This territory has been covered in Hemingway criticism, and in the final analysis, the text and Jake avoid such distinctions as devout Catholic, Code hero, or skeptical Nihilist. The essence of Jake's dilemma, rather is that he is a *collection* of these descriptions as well as others. A complication certainly perhaps even a contradiction, but as such, he exemplifies the age: the birth of Modernism in a post World War One generation.

Instead of focusing on the fishing and bullfighting scenes, we will later explore throughout this thesis, particularly in chapter three and four Jake's dilemma by looking at a sport that has direct relation to Jake, his era, his wound, and ultimately his healing. American Football appears only three times in the text but its importance is central to understanding the complex reality of Jake. The first appearance of the sport in the novel is in a piece of passing conversation in which Jake mentions that Robert Cohn played football at military school. The next more important passage builds on the first. In conversation, Cohn somewhat pathetically reveals that if he could do anything in the

---

1990), 54.
[20]Jane E. Wilson. "Good Old Harris in The Sun Also Rises," Critical Essays on Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises, ed. James Nagel, (Prentice Hall International, London, 1995), 185-191.
[21]Warren Wilden. "Trout Fishing and Self-Betrayal In The Sun Also Rises," *Arizona Quarterly* 37, no. 1 (1981): 66.

world, he would like to play football again. This incident early in the novel is forgotten, until football reappears again. In this final scene involving football, Jake relives his own memory of football and an injury he had. This link, as we will see, is essential to the novel. The injury Jake experiences as a young boy, which made everything "new and changed," is related directly to his current wounding. These three instances, when linked together with the overarching thematic structure of the novel, provide insight into the nature of Jake's wounded memory but also and most importantly, this sequence of memories when linked with the swimming scene in San Sebastian reveal the conditions which Jake will effect his healing.

American football has been understudied and overshadowed by other sports, predominately fishing, and bullfighting, in the criticism of the novel. From In Our Time, Death in the Afternoon, The Old Man and the Sea, and The Dangerous Summer, fishing, hunting, and bullfighting seem to dominate the thematic concerns of Hemingway's work. Because of this, Hemingway scholarship has attempted to sort out and define some of the ethical, existential, and phenomenological roles of sports found in Hemingway's life and fiction. In 1952, Phillip Young introduced an influential model that has dominated Hemingway scholarship since. Young believed that it was necessary to read Jake Barnes in relation to the context of Hemingway's earlier short stories and the various youthful traumas of Nick Adams. With such a model, fishing, its moral associations, and its aesthetic-ritualistic retreat from society in The Sun Also Rises takes on added dimensions and depths when compared with earlier stories like "Big Two Hearted River" and later stories like "Now I Lay Me." [22] Both the novel and the short stories share similar thematic concerns of wounding, a prevailing sense of emptiness, and the need to create a healing of one's own.

[22] Criticism also examines these outdoor sports more closely because of their central importance throughout Hemingway's life and his consistent active participation in them.

What we might see in sport, 'game,' 'play,' or 'recreation,' Hemingway sought in sports living metaphors and experiences to express man's ultimate struggle and potential for either defeat or victory. In sport, Hemingway saw existential and religious undercurrents. Most of these sports involved violence and risk. Perhaps nowhere did Hemingway express this struggle of sports and man more poetically and more fanatically than in his descriptions of bullfighting.

Commentators have identified the central place of bullfighting in the overarching work of Hemingway. Allen Joseph, in his essay "*Toreo: The Moral Axis of* The Sun Also Rises" places the ritualistic, religious ceremony of the bullfight and each characters reaction to it as the litmus test for each one's moral substance. In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway himself offered an esoteric interpretation on the meaning(s) inherent in the "tragedy of bullfighting," which affirms much of Joseph's reading. Hemingway saw links between mythic historical, ritualistic tragedy and the realm of sport, all within the universe of bull fighting. This he argued was a religious event and was more closely associated with the impulse of the ancient-mystery-religion sacrifices then with pleasurable afternoon entertainment. Hemingway writes, "The bull fight is the one thing that has, with the exception of the ritual of the church, come down to us intact from the old days."[23] The whole experience intrigued Hemingway: the community in ritual and religious celebration, focusing their energy, their passion, their hopes, in short, themselves, as a people, projecting it onto the individual in the ring facing the bull.

In Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway states that his initial attraction to the event was his curiosity about mortality, death, and how man relates himself to this process of dying. Death and its danger create the tension and the drama of the bullfight, a dramatic tension Hemingway had probably only experienced in the atmosphere of the war. It is

this element, the inevitable mortal nature of bullfighting, which makes it unique. Bullfighting is not a game that someone plays at and Hemingway writes of this cultural difference, "We, in games, are not fascinated by death, its nearness and avoidance. We are fascinated by victory and we replace the avoidance of death by the avoidance of defeat."[24]

Bullfighting was not a subject Hemingway studied from a critical distance; rather, he was literally in the arena,[25] with the people involved in the sport, from the inside. He lived with them, listened to their stories, watched the rituals, the reactions, and produced a vision, though blinded at times by his obsession, that rendered the *feeling* of what the entire cultural and religious experience meant to the people involved. The rituals formed an expression of a culture's health and were profoundly connected on a moral level for participant and fan. Hemingway writes:

> Bullfighting is the only art in which the artist is in danger of death and in which the degree of brilliance in the performance is left to the fighter's honor. In Spain honor is a very real thing. Called *pundonor*, it means honor, probity, courageous, self-respect, and pride in one word.[26]

What is primary for us is that Hemingway saw the sport as an expression of a culture's values and collective depths. Within criticism on The Sun Also Rises, there has

---

[23] Ernest Hemingway in a letter to Maxwell Perkins 12/6/26, from Selected Letters of Ernest Hemingway 1917-1961 ed. by Carlos Baker, (Charles Scribner's and Sons, New York, 1981), 237-238.

[24] Ernest Hemingway. Death in the Afternoon, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 1960,) 23.

[25] In a trip to Pamplona with friends, Hemingway took part in the amateur bullfights against the young or defective bulls with other excited members of the community. "I appeared in the bull-ring on 5 different mornings was cogida [tossed] 3 times—accomplished 4 veronicas in good form and one natural with the muleta," Hemingway writes in a letter to Ezra Pound. Two of his friends were injured but at home on the front pages of the Chicago Tribune and in the Toronto Daily Star, it is the young journalist and war hero, Ernest Hemingway who risked life and limb and was "gorged." This, of course, was an exaggerated and showed that Hemingway could even benefit from the pain of others. His fascination with the experience of bullfighting made him wish "...to hell that I was 16 and had art and valor." He thought the bullfighter was a more noble, more physical artist then the writer. For a detailed reading of the trip and how Hemingway later used it in his fiction see James Mellow. Hemingway: A Life Without Consequences, (Perseus Books Group Publishing, New York, 1993), 259-264.

been considerable attention to the allegorical sexual nature of the bullfights and the characters of the novel. However, as commentators focus primarily on the elaborate details of the fishing and bullfighting scenes, we lose something in the discussion of fishing poles and phallic symbols, bullhorns and phallic symbols, phallic symbols and phallic symbols. The primary loss we experience is the absence of seeing Hemingway's use of football in the text. Like the other sports, it gives us essential information about the psychological makeup of Jake, but unlike the other sports, we do not see any active participation in the sport. We have only Cohn's wistful longing and Jake's memories. In other words, it is only in longing, in memory, and in wounding, do we see football in the novel. These locations, are the very places of Jake's impotency, his tensions, and the forces he must find a way to overcome.

[26] Death in the Afternoon, 91.

CHAPTER 2
THE FIRST WORLD WAR:
THE GAME, THE HORROR, THE IRONY

> For some time now, our whole European culture has been moving as toward a catastrophe, with a *tortured tension* that is growing from decade to decade: restlessly, violently, headlong, like a river that wants to reach an end.
>
> -Nietzsche, The Will to Power

> Humanity is mad! What a massacre! What scenes of horror and carnage! *I cannot find words* to translate my impressions. Hell cannot be so terrible. Men are mad!"
>
> --French infantry lieutenant Alfred Joubarie
> an entry in his journal, weeks before his death

> *"...*unspeakable, godless, hopeless*."*
>
> -Paul Nash, a soldier tuned painter after the war, describing the "Front"

> *Depression was generated by a sense of impotence*—the beating of one's head against a concrete wall, the waste of effort and lives thrown away...
>
> -A British Divisional history, normally a document which used professional military jargon and understatement, describing the loss of morale by the end of the third battle of Ypres.

The Sun Also Rises is one of the first novels which attempts to show the impact of the "Great War" on language and the ways individuals could and could not find meaning within the collapsing societal structures of Europe and America. Any serious discussion on the novel and modernism must note the significance of the First World War on the cultural and religious legacy of Western civilization. This all too-brief sketch will look to show the war in broadest terms in order to understand how for Western Civilization the war represented a moment of crisis and paradoxically, the dawning and darkening of a new era.

It is almost impossible to begin talking about something as cataclysmic on such a large scale as the First World War with justice and prudence. Its horror and destruction in the name of causes that remain unclear, brought about the bitterness, and revenge of Europe which led to totalitarian regimes, fascism, the Second World War, the Holocaust, revolutions, and re-revolutions. This whole scale descent into collective world violence was triggered by the single event of the assassination of Duke Ferdinad and his consort in Sarajevio. Here in this chapter, we will emphasize the absurdity of warfare within this age and look at two distinct rhetorical stances to the war. The two approaches show the initial innocence of the war's participants and how for many soldiers, that innocence, in order to survive, became, in turn, ironical.

In one sense, Hemingway's declaration that every generation is lost is profoundly correct.[27] In thinking about the larger scope of time, there is nothing new as every generation is somehow lost in its unique set of problems, questions, and situations. Yet, in another very fundamental way, the world had yet to experience anything quite like modern warfare and Hemingway's generation was the first to endure mankind's new collective destructive capabilities.[28] For this generation, the war presented a new realm of sensory experience previously unknown in human interaction and behavior.

War and violent death are perhaps mankind's oldest instinct and activity, but what sets the First World War apart from any other form of battle were *the ways* in which individuals and groups of men died. It was the first full realization that war was not an

[27] As we will see, Hemingway's juxtaposition of Stein's quote "You are all a 'Lost Generation'," with the verses from Ecclesiastes was to show how each generation faces a reality in which "nothing is new under the sun." Hemingway later writes in A Moveable Feast that the title of "'Lost Generation'" was easy, quick, and cheap.

[28] The American Civil War (1861-1865), the Franco-Prussian War (1870-1872), the Boer War (1899-1902) can also be considered 'modern' because of the advances and uses of technology, communication, artillery, and transportation. However, these conflicts were somewhat contained or local and did not involve complex international alliances on a world stage.

honorable sport, but to quote the general who perhaps first seized upon the coming reality of modern warfare, William Tecumseh Sherman, "War is hell."[29]

On the experiential level, the conflict involved large numbers of massive troop movements, the use of mustard gas, the domination of machine guns, barbed wire, and the surreal experience of underground, all-ready made graves of trench warfare. Out of this four year (1914-1918) collision of technology and an unprepared European civilization, inarticulation reigned. Men and women did not have the means to express what they had experienced. Much of this was due to the feeling that no one was exactly sure *what* they had experienced. Reality itself lacked a discernible quality, essence, or tactical concrete basis in language. This struggle for finding a form of expression lead to the modernist revolution in art through minimalism, cubism, surrealism, and imagism. The gruesome nature of the war initially stifled and paralyzed attempts in language to convey what was happening and what soldiers saw, and out of this struggle came the movement of Modernism.

A strong segment of European culture entered the war still holding vague tenants of the Napoleonic conception of warfare. For many in various European nation states, martial conflict, and warfare was "not a bad way to spend an afternoon." War was an affair between gentleman with rules that were governed by such notions as decency and honor. This moral naivete also translated into a sheer practical ignorance of the coming conflict in Europe. Before the war began, British General Sir Douglas Haig, the commander of British forces, believed that two machine guns should be enough for an entire battalion. Haig also predicted the bullet's ability to stop a horse in a calvary charge

[29] Sherman understood the concept of 'total war' and that military success was not necessarily won on the battlefield, but in breaking the enemies will to wage war. Within this mode of warfare, the case can be made that the American War Between the States as the first modern war. The use of railroads to move troops, rifles with interchangeable parts, conscription, heavy artillery, and towards the end of the conflict, the Spencer repeating rifle and the Gattling Gun, all make the case for the modernity of the conflict. However, it was local in the American context and

as “greatly overrated.” Clearly, Haig and others did not anticipate exactly what was in store in modern warfare. As we will see, this ignorance had dire consequences.

For many, throughout Europe, who were still under the strange, suicidal mixture of optimism from the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries and the belief in scientific progress of social Darwinism, war was seen as an essential, vital, and even healthy part of the human experience. By 1910, many newspapers throughout Europe called the prospect of war in Europe “inevitable.” The reasons for this are complex but a few of them include: various vying imperialist interests, the rise of Industrialism, Social Darwinism, complexity of the political situation of Austria-Hungry, and a burgeoning sense of Nationalism and paranoia throughout Europe. In his 1912 book, Germany and the Next War, former German Calvary officer, Fredrich von Bernhardi, suggests in his title and throughout the book, that war is a necessity of human experience. He writes, “The natural law upon which all the laws of nature rest, is the law for the struggle of existence. War is a biological necessity.”[30]

The “enthusiasm” for battle was not just a German and Prussian phenomenon, instead, such a feeling permeated much of Europe. In May 1913, a 26 year-old conservative member of the English Parliament who had seen military action in India, the Sudan, and in the Boer War, commented on the rampant calls throughout the country to commit to war. He writes, “I have frequently been astonished to hear with what composure and how glibly Members and *even ministers*, talk of a European War.”[31] The young Member of Parliament was Winston Churchill. Modern war would not be the same of traditional conflicts in the past that had been fought by small regular or professional armies. In possible future conflicts, according to Churchill, “mighty

---

represented political and social issues that had boiling under the surface of American political structures for some time.

[30] Martin Gilbert. The First World War, (Henry Holt and Company, New York, 1994), 2.

[31] ibid, 3.

populations impelled on each other" would fight wars. This type of war, from the almost clairvoyant Churchill, created a scenario where a conflict in Europe could end, "in the ruin of the vanquished and the scarcely less fatal commercial dislocation and exhaustion of the conquerors...The wars of peoples will be more terrible than those of the kings."[32] Churchill foresaw a conflict that would exhaust any cause and render any "victory" hollow.

Churchill's voice was a minority in his own country and throughout Europe. Disputes and perceived disputes over territory, pride, national sovereignty, imperialistic interests, all led to the atmosphere of the war. However, despite this atmosphere, others like Churchill voiced hesitancy and argued that war was not a biological necessity or any other form of necessity. Voices of dissent pointed to the fact that international markets, European trade, and tourism had made countries interdependent with each other. The Great Illusion, by Norman Angell, first published in 1909, stressed that the great industrial countries, Britain, the United States, Germany, and France were,

> losing the psychological impulse for war, just as we have lost the psychological impulse to kill our neighbors because of religious differences. How can modern life, with its overpowering proportion of industrial activities and its infinitesimal proportion of military, keep alive the instincts associated with war as against those developed by peace?[33]

Those "instincts developed by peace" were largely brought about by the commercial revolution which opened borders to trade, culture, and tourism. Out of this interdependence, a state of cohesiveness and transnational community seemed to be rising in Europe. Because of the revolution of the railroad, traveling became a middle class phenomenon and out of this revolution came the development of the hotel industry across Europe. Europeans were coming to know the 'other' through trade and the

[32] ibid

growth of travel. Another factor that made one optimistically believe that war could be avoided was the strange wonder that almost every European head of state was related to another through marriage seemed to point to the possibility that conflict could be averted. In fact, two of the major national leaders, the German Kaiser and Russian Tsar, were related directly by marriage as cousins.

The potential for peace was not only a by-product of commercial and market forces. Rather, some national leaders, like Churchill, saw the threat of war and tried to prevent it. In 1899 Tsar Nicholas of Russia, who was disenchanted at the rapid race of military build-up throughout the industrial countries of the world, called for an international conference to meet in the Hague. Out of these meetings, Nicholas stated, "the accelerating arms race is transforming the armed peace into a crushing burden that weighs on all nations and, if prolonged, will lead to the very cataclysm it seeks to prevent."[34]

As Nicholas encouraged national powers to slow the race to war, there were other signs of international co-operation with international humanitarian work laws. By 1914, many states had entered bilateral treaties protecting workers rights and the rights of women and children from unfair industrial labor. Human rights violations of oppressive governments were also the targets of many liberal European states. A coalition of European states intervened internationally in Greece in 1827 and Lebanon in 1860 because of abuses by the Ottoman Empire. By 1841, Britain, France, Russia, Austria, Prussia, had signed an anti-slavery pact, which eventually led to the end of colonial exploitation, while at the same time bringing to light Europe's own humanitarian abuses abroad. Humanitarian agreements between vying powers were common. British, Russian, French, Italian, German, Japanese, and U.S. forces mounted a full-scale

---

[33] ibid, 12.
[34] John Keegan. The First World War, (Vintage Books, New York, 2000,) 17.

international relief aid in 1900 to Peking in light of the boxer rebellion. Clearly, it was possible not only for peace in Europe, but a pro-active, humanitarian peace of liberal forms of governments and human rights to continue the liberal traditions of self-government.

Culturally, though segments of Europe seemed bent on war, deeper and wider sources of shared common interests seemed to point to a cohesive European culture. Europeans, culturally, spoke and heard the same language as throughout Europe, Mozart and Beethoven were the favorites for opera, while the art of the Italian and French Renaissance was prized, and the architecture of the Middle Ages was evident throughout the continent. Europeans, by and large, read similar, international literary giants: Tolstoy, Hugo, Balzac, Zola, Dickens, Shakespeare, Goethe, and Dante. Within this common language of literature, almost every European in high school was taught Latin, German, Italian, and French. Europe's university graduates shared a core set of values, tastes, and perspectives and this shared outlook pointed to a single, shared, European culture.

In short, the 'Great War' became the manifestation of the darker impulses of man. This has been the case throughout history and the recent manifestation of man's blindness was found in the guise of the Enlightenment Nationalism, Industrialism, the scientific impulse, and the deep paranoia and neurosis that is sometimes evident only in "families."

In his monumental work, The Great War and Modern Memory, Paul Fussell thoroughly considers the terror the war produced in the collective psyche of the West. By capturing the essential difference of the First World War to anything that had come before it, Fussell shows the means, or the lack of means, modern society had in culture, religion, and art, to be able to conceptualize and cope with the terror it had witnessed and participated in. Fussell is valuable for us, as he provides insight to the basic

incongruent realities of the war and the rhetoric that emerges from these tensions. This rhetoric is primarily forged between two sets of tensions. The first set is the naive expectations of the war and the actual experience of modern battle; the second set of tensions is in the ironical depictions of the war and the actual experiences of the war.

As noted earlier, the war began in the traditional context of Napoleonic concepts of war being a type of "enthralling afternoon adventure." Because of this and the relatively long span of time that Europe had gone without a major war, the reality of war had lost its gruesome edge. A.J.P Taylor, the English war historian notes, "there had been no war between the Great Powers since 1871. No man in the prime of life knew what war was like. All imagined that it would be an affair of great marches and great battles, quickly decided."[35] The optimism of the Enlightenment was about to come head to head with the materialism of the 20th century and the results would prove cataclysmic. Fussell synthesis the collision of romantic nationalism and technological industrialism, "Out of the world of summer, 1914, marched a unique generation. It believed in Progress and Art and in no way doubted the benignity even of technology. The word *machine* was not yet invariably coupled with the word *gun."*[36]

The destruction and devastation of the war was felt immediately and consistently throughout the war. Over 6,000 people were killed every day for the first 1,500 days of the war. This number would eventually rise to a total death count of around ten million at the end war. Civilian societies of both Allied and Central Powers were outfitted with weapons of unprecedented destructiveness in a highly organized, systematic synthesis of industry and population.

In July of 1916, Haig saw the Battle of the Somme as a potential turning point in the war. He devoted his entire resources to breaking the German line at any cost and at

[35] Paul Fussell, 21.
[36] ibid, 24.

the end of the first day, British losses were at nearly 60,000 including half of the officer corps. This did not deter Haig. He continued to attempt to break the German line throughout the year. At the end of 1916, British forces had moved at total of six miles. Those six miles cost the lives of over 400,000 British, 500, 000 Germans, and 190, 000 Frenchmen. Men reduced to numbers, reduced to nothing, but Haig had his paper victory, and a very bloody six miles of Northern French territory. What separated Haig's decisions from his counterpart German General Erich Von Falkenhayn who was also accused of needless and headlong forays against impenetrable positions? Not much, as history Richard Rubenstein points out, "Both the British and the German generals made the same decision: their country's young men were expendable."[37]

Wilfred Owen, a British poet who experienced the Somme as a young enlisted man, used his fictional writing as the means to process his traumatic war experience. Before the volumes of Owen's fiction, two letters survive which point the radical, sudden, and indescribable nature of modern warfare. The letters, like most teenaged, inexperienced soldiers write, are addressed to home and to his mother. Before his first action in battle, Owen writes, "There is a fine heroic feeling about being in France, and I am in perfect spirits." Sixteen days later, after the mud and blood and mass destruction of the Somme, Owen writes home again, "I can see no excuse for deceiving you about these four days.[38] I have suffered seventh hell. I have not been at the front. I have been in front of it."[39] Letters such as these that mark a sudden change in perspective and reality are common. English soldier Charles Greenwell, writes home after a month of service in

[37] Richard L Rubenstein. The Cunning of History: The Holocaust and the American Future, (Harper and Row, New York, 1975). Rubenstein draws on the First World War in his first chapter "Mass Death and Contemporary Civilization" as the foundation for the mass violence that would later reign throughout the 20th century.

[38] There is reason to suppress and lie about information and the nature of battle. Because the letters home were filled with vivid descriptions of what battle was like, the atmosphere at the British home front was one disheartenment, confusion, and anger. The British authorities began censoring all mail from soldiers and gave special instructions to soldiers about what was allowed and what was not permissible in the letters home.

1915, “It is so delightfully fresh after England that the unpleasant side of it doesn’t strike me, though all my friends have been trying to instill into me the gospel of frightfulness.” The gospel would take hold a month later as Greenwell experienced battle for the first time. In the next letter home he writes, “I shall never look at warfare as *fine* or *sporting* again. It reduces men to shivering beasts.”[40]

The “logic” of modern warfare might best be seen in the battle of Verdun in 1916. The strategic goal of Von Falkenhayn was similar to Haig as victory was often measured in terms of how many losses, deaths, one could inflict upon an enemy.[41] In the nine-month battle of Verdun, German and French loses combined were over 100, 000, and when it was over the battle lines were more or less at the same location they had been from the beginning. Fussell notes that to describe these hostile military actions between two sides as “battles” is “to imply an understandable continuity with earlier history and to imply that the war makes sense in a traditional way.”[42] The war, fought primarily in trenches, against unseen enemies, with Generals who had yet to understand the reality of modern defensive warfare, meant the term ‘battle’ was going to have to be redefined.

As noted, at the end of the war, over ten million soldiers and civilians would be dead. The toll was staggering. The male population in some English, French, and particularly German, villages and towns was infinitesimal. The Western world paid an incredible price—wholesale destruction of human life, the emotional torture of millions and the collapse of traditional, societal values. At the end of the war, no one was exactly sure what the causes of the war were or what its intended purposes had been. In fact, perhaps the real legacy of the war was that it paved the way and created the conditions

---

[39] Fussell, 31.
[40] John Ellis. Eye-Deep in Hell: Trench Warfare in World War, (John Hopkins University Press, Baltimore), 175.
[41] This emphasis on statistical victory, again, is another parallel between European generalship in the First World War and American leadership in Vietnam.
[42] Fussell, 9.

for the second, which would prove to be even more horrible. Military Historian, John Keegan notes in his recent work, The First World War,

> The First World War is a mystery. Its origins are mysterious. So is its course. Why did a prosperous continent, at the height of its success as a source of global wealth and power and at one of the peaks of its intellectual and cultural achievements, choose to risk it all it had won for itself and all it had to offer the world in the lottery of a vicious and local internecine conflict? Why when the hope of bringing the conflict to a quick and decisive conclusion was everywhere dashed to the ground within months of its outbreak, did the combatants decide nevertheless to persist in their military effort, to mobilize for total war and eventually commit the totality of their young manhood to mutual and essentially pointless slaughter?[43]

Though the effects of the war and the spiritual and cultural life of the West are vast, we will emphasize two rhetorical stances that came from the war in the hope that both polarized aspects reveal something of the intensity of the experience of War. The first attitude is in the naive expectations of the war that associate war with some type of sporting event. These accounts, predominately in the beginning of the war, yet existing throughout, were primarily propaganda pieces by those who were proponents of military action. As the war went on, these accounts became calls to fight and bloodstained justifications on the need to continue the war. The metaphor of war as a sporting experience shows us both the collisions of the naive expectations of Europe and the rampant nationalism that fueled the war. This emphasis of sports and war is something we will look at in detail when we explore the wounding of Jake Barnes, but here, within the British context, we will gain an insight into the context and the world surrounding the war.

As the war slowly continued, it soon became obvious that European powers and the Western world did not have existing societal, cultural, or even religious institutions in

store to be able to provide solace or means of expression equivalent to the terror of the conflict. From these soldiers and out of the indescribable experiences of modern warfare in which men felt powerless and helpless, modern irony was born. The ironic stance provided a way for soldiers to be able to come to terms with their experiences in battle without losing themselves to its desperate, absolute horrific reality. Irony was a type of affirmation of the reality or unreality of the experience and attempted to render to keep a distance from what had happened while not ignoring the terror they had experienced. Both rhetorical spheres, the realm of sports in defense of war and the development of the ironic stance, enable us to see how these two responses represent a polarization of the experience of war; an innocence, a loss, a before, an after, an ignorance and blindness, a tragic sensitivity. Both rhetorical spheres will also help us to gain a deeper understanding when examining the greater context of Hemingway.

SPORTS

From the beginning of the conflict, the war was seen as a "sporting adventure." A 1914 British recruiting poster featured a group of soccer players putting down their soccer balls in order to follow a group of soldiers with rifles in hand. The distant soldiers are encouraging the players to follow, by waving, and smiling. On the top of the poster, we find the encouragement, "Play the greater game."[44]

The early journalistic descriptions of the war had yet to recognize the enormity of the massive numbers involved, nor the break the war represented between language and reality. For instance, in the early stages of the war, the struggle between German forces to reach the Belgian coastline and the stubborn French forces that created a stalemate

---

[43] ibid, 319.
[44] Stanley Weintraub. Silent Night: The Story of the World War Christmas Truce, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 2001), 101.

between the two was referred to as “The Race to the Sea.” These descriptions, early in the war, such as “race” or “match” were common in the journalism on the war. Fussell writes on this phenomenon,

> Rehabilitated and applied to these new events, the phrase has the advantage of a familiar sportsmanlike, Explorer Club overtone, suggesting that what was happening was not too far distant from playing games, running races, and competing in a thoroughly decent way.”[45]

The Christmas of 1914, the first of the war, shows both something of the innocence of the combatants and the unique role sports occupied in that innocence. As British and German forces were locked in a deadlock stalemate, a truce was declared. During the truce, soldiers from both sides met in No Man’s Land to exchange gifts, take pictures, sing Christmas hymns, and play soccer. Peace had suddenly, unexpectedly, broken out. Such an event would not take place again. The event took everyone by surprise and offered a glimpse into the prospect that the conflict could be avoided. British Sergeant Bob Lovell of the 3rd London Rifles recounts the day in his journal, “Even as I write, I can scarcely credit what I have seen and done. It has indeed been a wonderful day.” Reaction from the Central Forces was similar. German soldier Kurt Zehmish of the 134th Saxons describes the day and reveals the hope that both sides felt after the friendly game:

> Eventually the English brought a soccer ball from their trenches, and pretty soon a lively game ensued. How marvelously wonderful, yet how strange it was. The English officers felt the same way about it. Thus Christmas the celebration of Love managed to bring mortal enemies together as our friends for a time...I told them we didn’t want to shoot on the Second Day of Christmas either. They agreed. Towards the evening, the English offices inquired as to whether a big soccer match could take place between our two positions tomorrow. However, we told them we could not make any promise...since, as we told them, there would be another captain here tomorrow.[46]

[45] ibid, 9.
[46] ibid, 10.

The account shows the common culture both armies shared and how each side was helpless and powerless to the commanding leadership and political forces that fueled the war. The Christmas Truce of 1914 never left the memories of the soldiers who had taken part in it. The event has been memorialized in Robert Graves's short story "Christmas Truce." In William Douglas Home's play, "A Christmas Truce," we see the hope for peace between the enlisted soldiers and the realization that the men are powerless to the wishes and whims of their commanding officers. In the play, Adam Brunkner, a German lieutenant, tells Andrew Wilson his British opponent why his side is fighting in the war. Below is their dialogue.

> "Because the Kaiser and the generals and the politicians in my country order us that we should fight."
> "So do ours," agrees Andrew Wilson
> "Then what can we do?"
> "The answer's nothing. But if we do nothing...like we are doing now, and go on doing it, there'll be nothing they can do but send us home."
> "Or shoot us."
> "What, a million or two or more..."[47]

The reality of the war was that the national leaders of all sides seemed to have very little problem with sending their nations young men to earlier deaths. The tension between enlisted men and the higher commands became a constant problem throughout the war. We see this sentiment echoed by William Dawkins of the East Kents in his recollection of the Christmas Truce.

> ...the Germans came out of their protective holes, fetched a football, and invited our boys out for a little game. Our boys joined them and together quickly they had great fun, till they (I believe we were responsible) had to return to their posts. I cannot guarantee it, but it was told to me later that our lieutenant colonel threatened us with machine guns. Had just one of these

[47] ibid,111.

> Big Mouths gathered together ten thousand footballs, what a happy solution that would have been, without bloodshed.[48]

In Home's, play Adam Brunkner wonders if the generals will shoot their own men if they refuse to fight. The answer to this question according to Dawkins is yes. By looking at Homes' and Dawkins' accounts we see that victory in this war, if it came at all, would be long delayed, costly, and worthless, and perhaps a football match, after which both sides went home might be a better solution.

The "Big Mouths" Dawkins refers to are the large number of warmongers in Europe who sought the advancement of war at all cost. One such writer was the Nationalistic British poet Sir Henry Newbolt who fueled a connection of sports and war in his poetry in the late 19th century. Newbolt did not see soccer as a respite from war, but saw war as an extended metaphor from soccer. His impressions come largely from his experiences in Great Britain's imperialistic conquests in Africa and India, and were used to drum up support for the war effort and morale for the 'Great War' in Europe. It is interesting to note the role of technology and leadership in the following poem.

> The sand of the desert is sodden red—
> Red with the wreck of a square that broke;
> The Gatling's jammed and the Colonel dead,
> And the regiment blind with dust and smoke;
> The river of death has brimmed his banks,
> And England's far, and Honor a name;
> But the voice of a schoolboy rallies the ranks:
> "Play up! play up! And play the game!"[49]

There are a number of suppressed wishes in the poem. In a desperate moment of battle the rallying cry is found through a soldier who harkens back to his schoolboy days and finds the courage to "rally the ranks." This represents the desire to return to youth. Also,

[48] ibid, 113.
[49] ibid, 26.

the Gattling gun (one of the first types of the machine gun) is jammed and of no use, expressing a wish among many that the technological advances could somehow be slowed. The leadership position of a colonel also expresses a wish: he is nameless, faceless, and dead. Therefore, to win the conflict, good, old-fashioned schoolboy spirit will be required. In the Great War, the Gattling guns and the colonels were most often not the ones who suffered and such 'school-boy' spirit was by in large irrelevant when a soldier could be killed by artillery fire from miles away.

The soccer playing fields were not the only source of British inspiration in battle. According to another voice who we can characterizes in the spirit of Dawkins "Big Mouths," Lord Northcliffe's War Book notes that "Cricket is fine for implanting the right spirit, but football is even better." This spirit of soccer and cricket are then extended by Northcliffe into a larger fantasy about the nature of the war and how the war is naturally suited to the strengths of British troops. Lord Northcliffe writes,

> Our soldiers are individual. They embark on little individual enterprises. The German…is not so clever at these devices. He was never taught them before the war, and his whole training from childhood upward has been to obey, and to obey in numbers…He has not played individual games. Football, which develops individuality, has only been introduced into Germany in comparatively recent times.[50]

Northcliffe's wishful thinking about the weakness of the Germanic skill is almost humorous. At no time in the so-called 'Great War' was individuality praised, needed, or necessary, except in the rarest of occasions. The type of activity Northcliffe is romanticizing in sports takes place in an area and space cleared for defined struggle under the guise of rules and acknowledged scores. The reality of modern war was the inverse of this. Open field military action was suicidal in the war. Rules had gone the way of chemical advances in lethal gases. If there was a discernable essence that war

brought from sports, it was the destructive, illusionary, blind faith of leaders and generals in scores, numbers, and statistics. The rules of the game, the traditions of battle, were irrelevant and obscure in modern warfare. Yet, influential and popular thinkers such as Northcliffe continued to hold such theories like that of British tank crews being superior in conflict because they are, "…young daredevils who, fully knowing that they will be a special mark for every kind of Prussian weapon, enter upon their task in sporting spirit with the same enthusiasm as they would show for football."[51]

Such rhetoric before and during the war had a direct impact on how British troops envisaged their struggle. This influence of attempting to think of war as a sport is evidence that perhaps men subconsciously longed for an field where the game was played fairly, against an opponent, in a setting every one could agree on. We can definitely see this wish in the case of the Christmas Truce. Although these areas did not exist, British troops would try to create one. During the war, before battle, one way of showing the 'sporting spirit' was to kick a soccer ball at enemy lines before attacking. The 1st Battalion of the 18th London Regiment at Loos first performed this symbolic act of kicking a soccer ball towards the front lines in 1915. Quickly this action became ritual and achieved the status of a conventional act of bravado. The 'kick-off' became a tradition and was exported far beyond the Western Front.

During the bloody Battle of the Somme, before the first British wave of attacks, British Captain W.P. Nevill is reported to have persuaded his men to jump out of the trenches, into No Man's Land and attack by kicking a football towards the German lines. An eyewitness account reads:

---

[50] ibid. In an interesting note, the Great War required very little specific individual actions as Northcliffe would have liked to imagine. Overall, the German soldier was much more disciplined and apt in conflict to adapt to the conditions of trench warfare and modern war.
[51] ibid

> As the gunfire died away I saw an infantryman climb out onto the parapet into No Man's Land, beckoning others to follow. As he did he kicked off a football. It was a good kick. The ball rose and traveled well towards the German line. That seemed to be the signal to advance.

Nevill was killed instantly.

The four soccer balls are currently housed in the British Imperial War museum and with them is the following poem written in honor of the fallen:

THE GAME

A Company of the East Surry Regiment is reported to have dribbled four footballs—the gift of their Captain, who fell in the fight—for a mile and a quarter into the enemy trenches.

On through the hail of slaughter,
Where gallant comrades' fall,
Where blood is poured like water,
They drive the trickling ball.
The fear of death before them.
Is but an empty name.
True to the land that bore them—
The SURREYS play the game[52]

From the title to the last line, we see the attempt to make war conceptualized into a game that is to be played. However, unlike the schoolyard games where the enemy or opponent is human, limited, and everyone will go home after a winner is announced, these British soldiers, no matter how brave, were no match for machine gun fire and the stupid stubbornness of frontal attacks against heavily fortified positions.

The role of sports as an apology for the need for war will be looked at in detail in chapter four on the history of American football. However, as we can see from the British perspective, sports were seen as the field of training a martial and defiant spirit. A spirit

[52] ibid, 28

however, that would not prove to be much of a match against the weaponry of the industrial countries and modern armies.

IRONY

> "...the tragedies of whole lives and the long fatalities of human relationships...*remorseless, terrible, gruesome...*If there is joy…it is a joy that is long since dead; and if there are smiles, they are sardonical.
>
> -Lytton Strachey
> *The New Statesmen*, December 14, 1914

The concept of irony is not a new one in Western literature and rhetoric. It has been a part of the Western tradition since Plato's Republic, where it has approximately the meaning of a "glib and underhanded way of taking people in."[53]

Socrates, the early master of irony in the West would assume the pose of ignorance and foolishness and ask seemingly innocuous and naive questions that gradually exposed the weakness of the other's philosophical or legal case. Socratic irony looked past and through the situation with 'good-natured skepticism' and involved the conscious playing of a role, in which one must 'play at' not knowing. Irony, in antiquity could also be embodied in a person. Demosthenes regarded an *eiron* as a man who *ducked his responsibilities* as a citizen by feigning illness. Theophrastus regarded an *eiron* as one who was slippery in speech, *non-committal*: a man who does not come out in the open.[54]

In 1502 we find the first use of irony in English "yronye—'of grammare, by the whiche a man sayth one & gyveth to understande the contrarye." Within a century, Shakespeare's Hamlet, shapes and molds our understanding and appreciation of the

[53] J.A.Cuddon. The Penguin Dictionary of Literary Theory and Literary Terms, (Penguin Books, London, 1977), 458.

ironic tone. Hamlet is perhaps the master of irony in the West and his situation helps us understand the need for irony. Hamlet uses irony to attempt to exert some type of control on a situation in which he feels powerless. Clearly, the puppets are dullying in rotten Elsinore, and for Hamlet, irony represents a medium where he can exert some type of control. Through irony and playing mad he can walk freely between the world of the ghost's demand and his own existential questions before discovering what path he must take.

Kierkegaard also pointed to the need for irony in modern perceptions of reality and is useful for us here when considering the nature of the modern warfare. Kierkegaard writes, in his 1841 book, The Concept of Irony, he writes, "irony is a way of seeing things...However, it seems fairly clear that most forms of irony involved the perception and awareness of a discrepancy or incongruity between words and their meaning, or between actions and their results, or between appearance and reality. In all cases there may be an element of the absurd and the paradoxical."

Drawing of a new literary self-consciousness, the ironical stance was a common theme among soldiers and soldier-writers to combat both naïve positivism and the desperation of surviving in the hellish state of modern warfare. As we have seen, the false sense of optimism and nationalistic hubris began as soon as the war did as both the Allied and Central powers expected victory to come quickly and possibly by Christmas. This optimism, for those who actually fought in the war, soon turned into desperation, and for those who could survive, the desperation became ironic.

The unreality of modern warfare and the limitations of language used in its description, produced within the men who fought in it, a prevailing sense of irony. Part of the difficulty for any participant in battle to describe what war is like. War is a type of 'hyper-reality' and talking about the experience of war seems to betray the memories of

[54] ibid, 460.

fallen comrades. Louis Simpson writes, “To a foot-soldier, war is almost entirely physical. That is why some men, when they think about the war, fall silent. Language seems to falsify life and betray those who had experienced it absolutely—the dead.”[55]

The ability to take an ironic stance to the horror around them, allowed men to both acknowledge the desperate nature of their situation without succumbing completely to the horror of it. Irony in this sense was essential for survival. Through an attitude of tragic indifference, men could still function as men and soldiers while protesting the situation they had been thrown into.

The First World War presents a number of scenarios in which irony was needed and used. Fussell notes:

> Every war is ironic because every war is worse then expected. Every war constitutes an irony of situation because its means are so melodramatically disproportionate to its presumed ends. In the Great War ten million people were destroyed because two persons, the Archduke Francis Fredinand and his Consort, had been shot.[56]

The massive inertia of the war, the feeling of non-movement and chaotic sensory impressions when movement did occur (under the ground in trenches, caught in a hail of machine gun fire while caught in barbed wire, choking on chlorine gas which burns the walls of the intestinal tracks) led to the necessary stance of ironic acceptance. Within the ranks of enlisted men, irony could be seen on the smallest scale or in the most minute responses to events that seemed too large to be able to digest all at once. The tight lipped and understated response to the gruesome conflict permeated the soldier’s life and became the British response to the gross reality of war. In a sense, it is the response of the non-response.

---

[55] Fussell,170.
[56] ibid, 8.

Within this style or pose is the emphasis to be entirely even-tempered, calm, and composed. One speaks as if the war was entirely normal and the events of the war really did not cause a disturbance in the normal routines of day to day living. Again, we see this in the letters of the soldiers. Englishman Clive Watts writes to his sister, "It was *most interesting* being in the trenches this morning and seeing the effects of the shelling." S.S. Horsley writes home, "Got a new type of gas-goggles with rubber eye-pieces, very comfortable and useful for motoring after the war." In addition, consider the passive, detached manor a British general describes being shelled, "On my usual afternoon walk today a shrapnel shell scattered a shower of bullets around me in an *most unpleasant manner*." Robert Graves describes this rhetorical need as, "a humorous restraint in describing unparalleled horrors.' Graves goes on to explain, "nothing is 'horrible'...That word is never used in public. Things are darned unpleasant, 'Rather nasty,' or if very bad, "simply damnable."[57] Clearly, if soldiers could not control and change the conflict around them they would attempt to control their reaction to it.

The struggle between the political leadership, the generals, the ranked officers, and the soldiers who actually fought in the war was on going struggle. Eventually British officials began censoring letters home. In turn, soldiers used this limitation as an exercise in ironic appeal. Soldiers were instructed that letters home were only allowed to report on the more positive aspects of the war. Ironically, letters became 'positive' to the point they were unbelievable. We find this exercise in ironic appeal in a typical letter from late in the war from a British soldier. He writes:

> Dear Mum and Dad, and dear loving sisters Rosie, Letty, and our Gladys,--
> I am very pleased to write another welcome letter as this leaves me.
> Dear Mum and Dad and loving sisters, I hope you keep the home fires
> burning. Not arf. The boys are in the pink. Not arf. Dear loving sisters
> Rosie, Letty, and our Gladys, keep marry and bright. Not arf.[58]

[57] ibid, 145.
[58] ibid, 149.

This continues for three pages in a tone that is very cheery and very ironical making the reading exercise for the British censor official a test of endurance and in a slight way, the soldier's revenge on a gruesome policy.

Eventually the British government created a post-card boxes that were checked as to the status of the soldier after an injury. If the soldier was not dead, his injury was never too serious. The difficulty was always manageable. The reduction of communication to this 'official level' meant the elimination of the individual to a box on a post-card. This practice was rendered in Joseph Heller's Catch 22. Eventually families with single male members at war would receive post-cards with a box checked as to if it was their husband, brother, or son that was killed, injured, or captured. In Heller's work the post-card reads somewhat differently.

> Dear Mrs., Mr., Miss, or Mr. and Mrs. Daneeka:
> Words cannot express the deep personal grief I experienced
> when your husband, son, father, or brother was killed, wounded,
> or reported missing in action.[59]

The 'Great War' contained levels of irony and the richest of all is a comparison between the *intentions* of the war and the war's *results*. The 'Great War' was supposed to be the war to end all wars, instead it opened the gates of continual warfare throughout the century. The Great War also *created* exactly what it was supposed to prevent. Woodrow Wilson believed that American forces should enter the conflict in order to make the world safe for democracies. In reality, the war created the conditions in which liberal forms of government in Russia after 1917, Italy after 1922, Germany in 1933, and Spain in 1936, would fall and be replaced by totalitarian regimes. Because of the Versailles treaty and the lack of appreciation of what modern war meant, within twenty

years the Second World War would begin. When the guns fell silent in 1918 it left a legacy of political animosity and racial hatred so intense that it is impossible to think of the Second World War without recognizing it as a continuance of the first. Keegan writes, “The First World War inaugurated the manufacture of mass death that the Second brought into pitiless consummation.”[60] On September 18, 1922, a German political upstart who had volunteered for the war and had seen time in the front lines, exclaimed, “It can not be that two million Germans should have fallen in vain...No, we do not pardon, we demand vengeance!”[61] That politician was Adolf Hitler and he would bring about the death of five million more Germans. Fussell, who fought in the Second World War, notes the absurdity of this connection between the First World War and everything that came after it in a 1996 interview.

> Robert Sherwood, who used to write speeches for FDR, once noted that the cynicism about the Second World War began before the firing of the first shot. By that time we didn’t need to be told…how nasty war was. We knew that already, and we just had to pursue it in a sort of *controlled despair*. It didn’t have the *ironic shock* of the Great War.[62]

Years before the war, Nietzsche recognized the gap between any language set and reality when he wrote that all language is violence and every word is a prejudice. Every event is somehow deformed by metaphor, analogy, sentence structure, and connectives, but the reality of this gap would become a living problem for those who lived on after the war. It is common for us to use the cliche, “there are not words to express,” in a emotionally charged situation to try to express some form of sympathy, but for the men

---

[59] ibid, 154.
[60] Keegan, 4.
[61] Fussell, 3.
[62] Paul Fussell in an interview from, *Humanities, November/December 1996 (National Endowment for the Humanities)* http://raven.cc.ukans.edu/~kansite/ww_one/comment/fussell.htm

and women of the 'Lost Generation', there were literally not words to express the horror they had witnessed.

To conclude, we return to our cheery Lord Northcliffe. As the war progressed and journalistic accounts began to catch up with the war's horror, Nortcliffe persisted in arguing that the conflict was not as bad as some people believed. Even by the time American forces had entered the war, Northcliffe persisted in his dogged optimism. In an article written to American families on what to send their 'Doughboys' across the ocean in Europe, Northcliffe suggests peppermint because,

> those who suck on them will remain warm on a cold night. It also has a digestive effect that that is of small account at the front where the health is so good and indigestion hardly ever heard of. The open-air life, the regular and plenteous feeding, the exercise, and the freedom from care and responsibility, keep the soldiers extraordinarily fit and contended.[63]

Note the underlying feeling of Northcliffe's suggestions and images. Peppermint has the association of being a child and all of its sentimental and nostalgic trappings. The soldiers are like children in that we, the older statesmen, somehow know what is good for them. Peppermint has the effects of a laxative, but even that is not necessary as the men are already in a state of robust health, sunshine, and happiness. Should we even have to say, that open air, exercise, good food, and freedom *from* responsibility were not part of the soldier's experience in the First World War? Men froze to death in the trenches. Men died in their own excrement and the excrement of others. One British soldier recounts after the Somme, "We are lousy and we couldn't stop shitting because

[63] ibid, 37.

we had caught dysentery. We wept, not because we were frightened but because we were so dirty."[64]

There is no dialectical capable of synthesizing these two different views on the experience of modern war. For a generation of men like Northcliffe and leaders like Haig, war was still something of a sporting activity, the machine gun was overrated, and God was still an active and present force in the affairs of man. In his diary the night before British troops began the Battle of the Somme, Haig writes, "I feel that every step in my plan has been taken with the Divine help."

It appears as if God did not choose sides in this conflict. In fact, the traditional understanding of battle, conflict, and God would change after the war. When the conflict ceased in November of 1918, much of the overwhelming emotion was not so much joy in the Allied Victory, but relieve that the war was over. In reality, the German surrender itself was something in retrospect that seems more or less a blunder by the German politicians at home then German armed forces that were fifty miles outside of Paris. In this war, ironically, as Churchill had predicted, there were no winners, only losers on both sides, with more losers, millions more, to come. British soldier Henry Blumben captures this conflict and the birth of modern war in his journal entry after the second year of the war: "By the end of the day both sides had seen in a sad scrawl of broken earth and murdered men, the answer to the question. No road. No thoroughfare. Neither race had won, nor could win, the War. The War had won, and would go on winning."[65] Classical notions such as winners and losers, nobility and meaning, God and goodness of man were gone, perhaps somewhere in the craters of European landscapes and the scarred memories of millions of Europeans. The Christmas morning of 1914 gave us not only the tragic reminder of what could have been avoided, but its result also shows a

[64] Fussell, 88.
[65] ibid, 13.

larger ironic symbolism of the result of the war. On that 1914 Christmas morning soccer game played around the Ypres area in “No Man’s Land,” between British, French, and German soldiers no one won. The game ended in a draw.

CHAPTER 3

THE QUESTION OF A FOOTBALL MEMORY: A LOOK AT ROBERT COHN AND JAKE BARNES

> To bear pain without flinching, and to laugh at the wounds and scars of a hotly contested game, is very good discipline, and tends to develop manliness of character.
>
> *Frank Leslie's Illustrated Weekly*, 1892
> in defense of Football and its violence

> Don't talk like a fool," I said. "Besides what happened to me is supposed to be funny. I never think about it...It's funny...It's very funny.
>
> Jake to Brett, on his wound
> The Sun Also Rises

> Attempts to avoid thinking about a horrendous experience are common in trauma survivors, but are more likely to amplify, rather than lessen, later problems with persisting memories.
>
> Daniel L. Schacter
> The Seven Sins of Memory

One of the keys to understanding Hemingway's novel is in understanding the difference between Jake's memory of football with Robert Cohn's longing to play football. Mark Spilka argues in *"The Death of Love in* The Sun Also Rises*"* [66] that in order to fully understand the meaning of the novel, one must understand this relationship as Hemingway's portrayal of Jake's failure and inadequacy. For Spilka, Jake's parallel with Cohn points to Jake's ultimate failure and the reality that in the novel if there is hero, it is Romero, not Jake. While Spilka's reading gets much of the novel right, here we will

examine more closely the relationship between Jake and Cohn and attempt to see what Spilka has missed. In this chapter we will begin by looking at Cohn's character in detail and what his longing to play football represents. We will then turn our attention to Jake and see how his memory of football represents something much more complex in relation to his wounding.

Robert Cohn is somewhat of a flat character and some critics have argued that he is in fact little more than a caricature without any real development or layers. Despite any motivation or any other personal considerations in creating Robert Cohn, Hemingway's creation is primarily static. Cohn is unchanging; for example, in social situations he is consistently either saying or doing the wrong thing. He is the perennial outsider. The primary reason for this is that at the heart of Cohn's inadequacy is his devotion to a chivalric and romantic code that has not survived the war. We see this most clearly in watching Cohn fall for Brett, which does not make him unique as he joins Jake, Mike, Bill, the Count, the Drummer, Romero, and others who are in some degree taken by her.

What does make Cohn unique is the *qualities* he immediately finds in her. Jake tells us on meeting Brett for the first time Cohn stares at her and, "He must have looked a great deal as his compatriot must have looked when he saw the promised land. Cohn, of course, was much younger.[67] But he had that look of eager, deserving expectation."[68] For Cohn, Brett is the embodiment of the classical feminine virtues and more. Cohn is blind to the reality of Brett's personality and desires. His interaction with Brett up to this point has been limited and it is clear that the values he sees do not apply to Brett or the situation at hand. Cohn tells Jake that Brett is "fine and straight," a woman of

---

[66] Mark Spilka."The Death of Love in The Sun Also Rises," from, Ernest Hemingway: Modern Critical Views, ed. by Harold Bloom, (Chelesa House, New York, 1985), 107-119.
[67] an 'ironic' reference to Cohn's 'Jewishness'
[68] TSAR, 29.

“quality...and breeding,” and a woman who would never marry anyone she did not love. Jake’s response to this last assessment of Brett and marriage, “Well, she has done it twice already,” shows that Jake is trying to warn Cohn as politely and friendly as possible that the Brett in Cohn’s imagination, is not the Lady Brett in reality. Jake is simply being honest, but Cohn is ready to fight Jake for this comment and defend someone’s honor he barely even knows. This shows how outdated and comic Cohn’s chivalry is. His impressions of Brett have no basis in reality and he refuses to see the parade of lovers that come in and out of Brett’s life. Instead, Cohn is fixated on his idealistic vision of Brett and what he believes their relationship should entail.

These romantic idealizations extend beyond Brett and into all aspects of Cohn’s life. He enjoys the appearance of manhood, rather than the actual requirements of manhood. In this sense, his romantic code is also combined with a particularly modern consciousness of self-presentment. Cohn is a writer, but he does not seem to enjoy writing. He boxes in college for the notoriety and the skill it provides him to inflict pain on others who might make fun of him and damage the image of himself that he projects forward. Life, for the romantic Cohn, is always *somewhere else*. Part of his code is the romantic longing that, “somewhere else things are always better than they are here,” and if he could be there, his problems would disappear and in the process, he would learn how to be more alive.

This romantic wishing explains Cohn’s fascination with trying to convince Jake to take a vacation with him to South America. He had read about the continent in a book and thought it would be a wonderful trip. He tries to convince Jake saying, “Don’t you realize that half your life is already over.” Jake tells Cohn to let go of his romantic imaginings and focus on enjoying life here, in Paris.

After meeting Brett, we see precisely what the *idea* of romantic love does to Cohn’s character. Cohn becomes undone. He does not mind being beaten in tennis

anymore. Around Brett, his every move is planned out in an attempt to be able to be closer to her. He becomes even more self-conscious. He worries about his hair and his appearance. This behavior falls in line with the rest of his character. Cohn seems to be dominated by women, and in life's challenges he does not seem to take any real joy, rather he wants to give the appearance of being a man and enjoying himself. In playing bridge, Jake tells us, Cohn once made a lot of money. How? By being conservative, close to the vest, and holding his cards. Hemingway gives us the romantic and nostalgic displacement of Cohn in the modern world, by showing Cohn reading W.H. Hudson's The Purple Land, which is,

> a very sinister book if read too late in life...For a man to take it at thirty-four as a guide-book to what life holds is about as safe as it would be for a man of the same age to enter Wall Street direct from a French convent equipped with a complete set of some of the more practical Alger books.[69]

Cohn's inability to see that his friendly fornication with Brett at San Sebastian "didn't mean anything" provides the tension throughout the fiesta among the group of travelers. Cohn's presence and his puppy-dog following of Brett around the Fiesta, disturbs everyone especially Brett's drunken fiancé Mike Campbell and at the fiesta, Cohn's false knighthood makes the miserable Brett even more miserable.

These various group tensions eventually come to a head when Cohn beats Jake up for acting as the pimp between Brett and Romero. The violence Cohn has been looking for since the beginning of the novel is finally released in his knocking out of Jake, his one friend, and bloodying Romero. However, this is a hollow physical victory. According to the romantic code of old, Cohn must exert some form of violence against those who have disgraced the honor of Brett. What he does not realize is that Brett does not want or need his help or his definition of honor. Cohn's wish is to take Brett away

with him from the crowd and the fiesta, where he undoubtedly believes that her womanly virtues, her true self, would come forward, only if she were too *somewhere* else.

Cohn's chivalric code and his course of action, yields him nothing except the realization that romantic love between him and Brett is impossible and that it is time to go home.

As noted earlier, the first reference to 'football' occurs early in the novel in relation to Cohn. It, like many of Jake's comments seems off-hand and casual: "At the military school where he prepped for Princeton, and played a very good end on the football team and no one had made him race-conscious."[70] The comment takes on a deeper significance along with Cohn's character in the next appearance of football in the text. During a brief conversation between Cohn and the intellectually eccentric Harvey Stone, Cohn is asked by Stone,

> "Tell us right off. Don't think. What would you rather do if you could do anything you wanted?"

Cohn hesitates. The enormity of this question must be taken under consideration. We must pause like Cohn. The question frees Cohn from the now: from his dreadful wife, his shameful past, his uncertain, limited future, and his 'friends' like Stone. This is precisely the type of question that Cohn would enjoy brooding on. With this question, anything and everything can be his. Cohn, a character fascinated with the "somewhere else" has been given all the options in his imaginative world. Stone encourages him,

> "What comes to your head first. No matter how silly it is."

---

[69] ibid, 17.
[70] ibid, 12.

Note briefly that Stone states, “what comes to your *head* first.” Already Hemingway is suggesting the psychological implications the sport will later have. Cohn responds,

> “I think I’d rather play football again with what I know about handling myself, now.”[71]

This seems to be a silly, if not childish, response. Stone immediately gives Cohn’s diagnosis, the one Spilka follows, by announcing that Cohn is a case of “arrested development.” An entire world of opportunity is open to Cohn and he is drawn to a time to the past, to a game played by boys. On the surface Cohn’s answer does seem absurd. But it is imperative to note *why* Cohn wants to play. He thinks that he can now “handle himself.” It is not that Cohn either has a new strategy for playing the game or that he has acquired a new physical prowess and ability. Instead, his response suggests he believes he has achieved a degree of self-knowledge and emotional understanding that he did not have previously as a player. He can handle himself better. He has attained a new level of self-awareness.

Cohn takes Stone’s question seriously and out of *all* the things in the world to do, he would seriously want to play football again.

We must ask ourselves if Cohn’s answer is a reflection of his limited consciousness or does it reflect something of the demands of what it meant to play football successfully in this era? Or, does it perhaps tell us something of both?

For Cohn the ability to play football again represents something of those amorous adventures he wished to have in South America. Both are exotic and on the other side of the Atlantic. Both are dangerous and represent a place where one’s

manhood can be tested and proven. The problems with the trip to South America are manageable. The obstacles can be overcome: the trip's price, the location, and the act of leaving Paris which might be the hardest, since it would require Cohn convincing his disgruntled girlfriend Frances to let him go. The problem with the imaginary football games is much simpler and more concrete. Those games are "irrecoverable." Robert Cohn cannot go back in time and play again and it should be clear to us that his longing to play football is representative of his larger failure to see what life's possibilities hold now for him in the present. Both Brett and the desire to play football are connected to Cohn's inability to see. This prevailing failure is the result of Cohn's outdated code and for Cohn, the longing to play football represents a futile search to have some defining experience of manhood. Futile, because it is a game that is now *over*.

Jake Barnes is not seeking a war or any test of manhood to prove himself. He has escaped the war and though he has survived, an aspect of his manhood has not. Cohn is somehow clumsily *playing at looking for* a test. Jake *has been* tested. For Cohn, football represents his inability to understand the present and the limitations of the past. For Jake, football represents a threshold experience of memory in which he will re-live his wounding and pain of the past in a compounded and complex way.

When the various tensions over Lady Brett reach their climax at the Fiesta and Cohn punches Jake into a brief state of unconsciousness, we see simultaneously the fall of both Cohn and Jake. For Cohn, it is the end of the fiesta and the realization that he can not be with Brett. It is time to go home. For Jake it is the fall into his subconscious mind and the realm where his wound is an active presence. This fall is not just a symbolic fall into the depths of his psyche. It is also the fall of Jake's moral character and integrity.

---

[71] ibid, 50-51.

Jake has betrayed the code of Montoya the bullfight devotee and in the process, he has seen yet another man, Romero step into the role he was supposed to occupy. What is worse, he has made sure that Brett and Romero find each other. His has betrayed himself and he has betrayed the code of the *aficionado.* When Jake arouses from the punch and begins walking back to his hotel room he begins to feel extremely strange. The images that strike Jake during this walk reveal the links for us to see Jake's past and the needs of his future. We will give the account in full and then turn our attention to the question of Jake and memory. First we must see Jake on his "strange walk across the plaza." Hemingway writes,

> Walking across the square to the hotel everything looked new and changed. I had never seen the trees before. I had never seen the flagpoles before, nor the front of the theatre. It was all different. I felt as I felt once coming home from an out-of-town football game. I was carrying a suitcase with my football things in it, and I walked up the street from the station in the town I had lived in all my life and it was all new. They were raking the lawns and burning leaves in the road, and I stopped for a long time and watched. It was all strange. Then I went on, and my feet seemed to be a long way off, and everything seemed to come from a long way off and I could hear my feet walking a great distance away. I had been kicked in the head early in the game. It was like that crossing the square. It was like that going up the stairs in the hotel. Going up the stairs took a long time, and I had the feeling that I was carrying my suitcase. Bill came out and met me in the hall.[72]

Why does Jake Barnes have a memory of a football game? And why does he think that he is back there, in his youth, on his way home?

[72] ibid, 196-197.

JAKE'S PROBLEM

"Heaven and earth, Must I remember?"
Hamlet, Act I, Scene 2

In Paris, during the first part of the novel, we have seen Jake in the light of day trying to be "hard-boiled" and stoic. He is able to go through the routines of daily life without having to think of his wound. His "friends" reinforce this ability, or more precisely, this inability. However, at night, when alone, something else lies in wait. At night, Jake does *think* and remember. In the day, Jake gives the appearance of being fine. He tells Brett that he does not think about the wound, but instead he laughs at it. He does not confide to anyone else about his horrific dilemma. However, when faced with himself, at night, in bed, in the darkness, Jake is forced to reconcile his longing and memories with his reality of being wounded. Jake's actions and thoughts that in the day carry one tone hold a much different association at night and in the darkness. These forces reappear for a wounded Nick Adams in "Now I Lay Me" and for the older bartender who has encountered nada in "A Clean, Well-Lighted Place." For all three, while working in the day, life carries on as they focus their attention and energy into their work. At night, the deeper parts of the psyche begin to work returning inevitably, to questions of wounding and meaning.

The nature of Jake's wound is revealed through these nighttime scenes. Subsequently, the specific demands of the wound and its potential for healing are found within Jake's interaction and memories of sports. As we saw in the first chapter, Hemingway critics have noted sports and the outdoors as the primary means by which protagonists in Hemingway's fiction heal and reconstruct a world of meaning. Through the physical and ritualistic interaction of sport, the demands of his wound are met. Communion with the earth, with nature, exposure to elements of danger, and interaction

with its forces creates the “the good place,” for Nick Adams and “the good country” for Jake and Bill. For the individual wounded by the gross mechanisms of society, the outdoors, and sports, provides a potential place of meaning and re-collection.

Spilka believes that the primary role of football is to demonstrate that Jake and Cohn are *both* victims of a limited consciousness. This does seem to make sense on one level. Both Cohn and Jake mention the sport and for both it seems to be of vital importance as Cohn wishes above anything else to play again and Jake literally re-lives a scene from his youth of coming home from a game. In a novel as terse and tight in economy of language, images, and structure, a sport mentioned only three times must carry with it a certain symbolic significance. In each instance of Cohn and football, something crucial to the psyche of Cohn is revealed. Because of this, Spilka believes that what it reveals for Cohn, “arrested development,” is also what it is signifies for Jake. Spilka goes so far as to say that Jake, in his inability to deal with his wound, is an “emotional adolescent,” much like the naive, quixotic Cohn.

Although this interpretation coheres with much of the surface symbolic content of the novel, Spilka’s subsequent interpretation of Jake’s “emotional adolescence” misses much of the significance that Hemingway gives the symbol of football.

Jake and Cohn *are* linked by a psychological handicap. For Cohn it is the inability to see that his romantic code of honor and shame has expired with the war. For Jake, it is not an inability, but *a refusal* to see his own situation in full. Jake’s failure is definitely evident, but it is also somewhat forgivable, considering the severe nature of his injury and its torture. It is hard to dismiss Jake as an emotional adolescent. Because of his wounding and suffering, Jake is emotionally complex and nuanced whereas Cohn is simply stuck on the past.

Cohn and Jake are linked in another vital aspect. Both want something from Brett that she can not give them; something that neither can have and it is here we can

also see the clear difference between Cohn and Jake. Coming to terms with his inability to be with Brett will cost Cohn his dignity. For Jake, coming to terms with the inability to be with Brett will give him *back* his dignity.

This is the crucial difference Spilka misses and it takes us back to the question of football. The *longing* to play football is Cohn's desire. Not Jake's. Cohn is fascinated with images of manhood and assertions of manhood. Football, for Cohn represents a status of eternal youth. There he can handle things better and become more popular. There he can also have an experience, or continue to have an experience in which the demarcations of what it means to be a man are clear.

Football, as we will see, represented a type of experience in which the American community at the turn of the century would recognize your skill, intelligence, and bravery. Besides war there was no other experience that could provide such a cognitive and dramatic stamp of manhood. However, it seems clear that Cohn has not been in the war and if he has its meaning and terror have been lost on him. Cohn seems to be the type who would have lustfully read Northcliffe's articles on the 'healthy benefits of the front,' just as he reads Hudson's accounts of South America. For Cohn the notion of 'noble conquests' has not yet evaporated in the ex-partite Parisian air.

While Cohn has yet to come to terms with the crisis of his generation, Jake, *embodies* this crisis. The reality of Jake is also that he does see and does think about his wound. Throughout the novel Jake begins to develop his own sense of code as his awareness of his wound and its meaning slowly emerges. The tension between Jake's repression of these forces and his insight on what it means to "live in it" is the primary tension of the novel. Without opposition, there is no tension and Hemingway reveals these tensions throughout the novel with images of light/dark in relation to not-thinking and remembering.

As noted, Jake is observant to the world, the behaviors and the codes of others around him. Out of these observations a conflict of values and morals emerge. Through this process he is eventually able to identify the needs of his wound. Jake's physical handicap is final. His psychological wound, the refusal to see, the resistance to thinking and finding connections, is not fixed. There is still a chance he may be able to find the balance between memory and "active forgetting."

Jake's limitation exists in this tension between the old code which tells him to laugh and "not to think" of his wound and continue living as if nothing has happened. This code is in conflict with his emerging sense of dis-placement and the need for a different way of living. This conflict represents the tension between a false stoic endurance of not thinking and acting in relation to his wound and genuinely opening himself to the process of memory. Though Jake's mind does go back to a football injury of youth, this does not necessarily represent regression or retreat as Spilka argues. In fact, the memory is essential to Jake's recovery and future health.

The football wound and the wound from the war reside on the same psychological fault line for Jake, and to come to terms with one, he must also deal with the other. Both wounds represent something particular only to Jake, and it is the wound that painfully and obviously separates him from Cohn and all others. The wound, the disaster isolates Jake. It makes him unique. Both wounds are solely his own and if he is to experience a transformation and create his own healing, it will be out of the raw material out these wounds. Therefore, the wound sets Jake apart, and though it has taken something away, it can give as well. Again, another paradox of the disaster: Blanchot captures it, "The disaster is the gift."[73]

The football wound points to conceptions of manhood, injury, and healing. The perspective Cohn gives the image of football is akin to a man having dull pangs of a mid-

life crisis and longing for yesterday. For Jake, the football image is one of an emerging and *approaching* crisis. He must come to terms with his feelings for Brett and what the two of them can and cannot be for each other. In a very real way, Jake is holding Brett captive. By dealing with the football wound, Jake may be able to come to terms with his present and permanent wound of impotency.

In the beginning of the novel, we see that Jake refuses to accept their love and its limitations. He gropes. He pleads. He, like Cohn, wants to move away with Brett into the country and does not seem to hear her stern warning, "You know that I can not." He wants to keep Brett in his room and kiss her. By not accepting the fact that they cannot be lovers, Jake provides Brett an excuse and reason for her promiscuity and feeling of "misery." It is only by no longer holding Brett emotionally hostage that Jake can grant himself and Brett the ability to find some sense of meaning and integrity.

In Book One Hemingway begins to give us the images associated with Jake's wounding and his healing; images that will be essential to our understanding of the memory of the football and the swimming scene at San Sebastian. In an early scene in the novel, Jake gets the vague "sentimental idea that it would be nice to eat with someone," and dines with a prostitute, Georgette. On the cab-ride to the café after the meal she makes an advance towards him which he refuses, explaning something about the war. "That damn war," Georgette replies. The ride to the café and the interaction with Georgette build up to a paradoy of "romantic love" at the bar, where Brett arrives with a group of homosexual men who eventually dance with Georgette, leaving Brett with Jake, who can not dance at all. He can only watch. Jakes's subsequent frustrated anger is easily understood but it is in the final exit of Jake and Brett from the cafes and the ride back to Jake's room where we see him, not so much angry, but desperate. He procedes to kiss Brett, asking her to stay, but she tells him, "You know that I can not." Brett

[73] ibid, 43.

trembles and leaves. She returns to the cafe crowds. Jake, spurned by Brett, knowing that in a larger context somehow he will always be spurned, goes back to his room. The night becomes symbolic of Jake's total, frustrated impotence. In bed, Jake begins to reflect on his desires.

> I lay awake thinking and my mind jumping around. Then I couldn't keep away from it, and I started thinking about Brett and all the rest of it went away. I was thinking about Brett and my mind stopped jumping around and started to go in sort of smooth waves. Then all of a sudden I started to cry...It was awfully easy to be hard-boiled about everything in the daytime, but at night it is another thing.[74]

These tensions appear throughout the Hemingway canon, but not quite to the same degree of an impotent man trying to learn how to focus his mind amongst the pressures of sexual desire. Often, in Hemingway's fiction we see characters who stress the importance of "non-thinking." This should not be associated with the general misunderstanding of Hemingway as an "anti-intellectual." Rather, this method of "not-thinking" can be also be stated as "pure concentration in pressure situations." We find this mental practice in The Old Man and the Sea when Santiago is testing the limits of human endurance by going farther out into the sea. We see this also with the doctor in "Indian Camp" who must realize that the yells of pain from the Indian woman in labor are not important because they will distract him from the surgery. For Hemingway, to perform in action one must block certain things out to be able to do certain other things well. However, here in Jake's bedroom, the pressures are different. Jake knows that thinking about Brett will bring a severe emotional and physical disturbance. However, because he has yet to deal with the wound in full, Jake can not prevent his mind from

[74] ibid, 111-114.

jumping around. He has yet to come to terms with what his relationship with Brett means and he has yet to find something else to compensate for his longing of romantic love.[75]

If we are tempted to think of Jake's memory of a football game from his youth as childish because it seems somehow too sentimental, we should remember that for Hemingway, youthful memory and the experiences of youth, are a part of the experiences a writer needed to see reality clearly. There exists a need throughout Hemingway's work for a character to reflect on a certain series of memories to set them into a type of frame where they connect in a greater relation to the whole of life. Often for Hemingway's protagonist this is done primarily through the process of writing and giving narrative form to memory. We should not forget in the context of the novel that Jake Barnes is a writer who is telling a story. In fact, in the early drafts of the novel, Hemingway portrayed Jake as writing down these experiences with his friends with self-conscious reflection trying to make sense of the situation. Fitzgerald later encouraged Hemingway to cut the opening and he did by some twenty pages. Hemingway began a sequel to The Sun Also Rises in which Jake returns to Paris and the scorn of his friends because he has exposed them in a book. The emphasis on writing and narrative is important for us as it points to the fact that Jake is telling a story in order to understand an event of great personal depth. In doing so, he is looking for events that connect and explain who he is and what he has been through. He is looking for memories that gather a certain momentum and will tell him the story of himself. The writers who are protagonists in Hemingway's fiction tend to reflect on childhood as a source of meaning, questions, and tensions that later manifest themselves in manhood. This is the voice of

[75] This is no small task. Which is why the story is, as Hemingway described it, "so damn sad." Spilka's interpretation of Jake's emotional adolescence does an injustice to Jake and does not take in full the magnitude of his wound. Wallace Stevens writes: *The greatest poverty is not to live/in a physical world, to feel that one's desire/Is too difficult to tell from despair.* Wallace Stevens. "Esthetique Du Mal," from Stevens: Collected Poetry and Pose, (The Library of America, New York, 1997), 286.

dying writer Harry Walden in “The Snows of Kilmanjaro:” “Of the place where he had been a boy he had written well enough. As well as he could then.” This is a point of satisfaction for a writer who is feeling that so much of his career has been a failure. It also reminds him that he could have continued to tell the stories he needed to tell if only he had kept on working. For Hemingway, youth and youthful trauma is important as it reveals how far a character has or has not come in relation to the past.

For Hemingway, youth and youthful experiences with mortality are essential in the make-up and character of the adult psyche. Jake’s wound in the head from football is connected with his sense of mortality and death. We can see this focus throughout the Nick Adams stories. Beginning with “Three-Shots” we see a young Nick Adams, alone in a tent, temporarily abandoned by his father and uncle, who sends three shots into the air, as the call for help and the sign of trouble. The trouble?—Nick is overcome with a great fear.

> He was not afraid of anything definite as yet. But he was getting very afraid. Then suddenly he was afraid of dying. Just a few weeks at home in church, they had sung a hymn, “Some day the silver cord will break.” While they were singing the hymn Nick had quickly realized that someday he must die. It made him feel quick sick.[76]

The fear now has a source: death, a theme and fear we will catch echoes of throughout the Hemingway canon and Nick Adams. The fear usually relates directly to a war veteran who oscillates between despair when sober, drunkenness, all in an effort to combat having to deal with the memories encountered at night.

When Nick Adams in “Now I Lay Me” cannot find sleep, he forces his memory to work on certain grooves, running on selected tracks, avoiding certain thoughts, avoiding the encounter with the dark, because there he will have to encounter the depth of his

[76] ibid, 14.

psyche and his wound. He thinks about fishing instead. With great attention to detail, he retraces the different places he had fished because it could hold his concentration and prevent him from falling asleep.

> I myself did not want to sleep because I had been living a long time with the knowledge that if I ever shut my eyes in the dark and let myself go, my soul would go out of my body. I had been that way for a long time, ever since I had been blown up at night and felt it go out of me and go off and then come back. I tried to think about it, in the nights, just at the moment of going off to sleep, and I could only stop it with a very great effort.[77]

For the boy Nick Adams it is the fear of death that keeps him up. As a young man, Nick Adams can not go to sleep because he has seen death, the fear of his childhood, so closely. We can see this connection in the nature of the wounding throughout Hemingway's fiction. Perhaps one of the most striking elements of the wounding and the psychological trauma the disaster creates is in Hemingway's consistent descriptions of the wounding. Hemingway describes these events in a similar vein. We find throughout a description similar to the one from above in "Now I Lay Me," with "the soul and the life going out of me and go off and then come back." The passage bears resemblance to Jake's remembering of the football wound in which he was walking across the square and "everything seemed to come from a long way off." This wound is also similar to Fredric Henry's wounding in A Farewell to Arms.

> I ate the end of my piece of cheese and took a swallow of wine. Through the other noise I heard a cough, then came the chuh-chuh-chuh—then there was a flash, as when a blast-furnace door is swung open, and a roar that started white and went red and on and on in a rushing wind. I tried to breathe but my breath would not come and I felt myself *rush bodily out of myself and out and out and all the time bodily into the wind*. I went out swiftly, all of myself, and I knew I was dead and that it had all been a mistake to think you just died. Then I floated, and instead of going on I felt myself slide back. I breathed and I was

[77] ibid, 362.

> back. The ground was torn up and in front of my head there was a splintered beam of wood.[78]

All three have survived the blast but now they must encounter the fear of the wound, recalling the horror of near extinction, and re-collect as much as possible the fragments of themselves in order to live again. Hemingway captures this by showing the wound somehow taking out the self and bringing it back. This horror as we have seen in Jake is most easily dealt with in the day, in the light, where it is not dealt with at all. Or as Nick Adams tells us, "If I could have a light I was not afraid to sleep because I knew my soul would only go out of me if it were dark."[79] The tension between the soul rushing out of the body represents a dis-cognitive experience. But for Nick in "Now I Lay Me," and Fredric in A Farewell to Arms, there is always the chance of romantic love to eventually help one through the night. Jake does not have this luxury.

Jake searches throughout the novel for a way to live in it and for a way to heal. Healing, for Hemingway, is somehow earned and like everything else, it has a certain price. Each wound contains its own specific requirements and as the novel unfolds, we are slowly given Jake's. For Hemingway's protagonists, a state of grace, an atonement of the fractured pieces of the self, requires that virtue, discipline, *a new way of being*, must be discovered and maintained. We can see clearly that for his characters who suffer from deep wounds, for healing to occur, something must be brought back and rediscovered. The individual, if he is able to find the process for healing will then be changed, stranger perhaps to himself, yet transformed, and renewed.

But how will Jake encounter the wound without being overcome by it?

Alphonso Lingis comments on this ability which is the inability to be paralyzed by memory,

---

[78] Ernest Hemingway. A Farewell to Arms (Scribner Publishers, New York, 1995), p.54.
[79] ibid, 362.

> What then, is characteristically noble is the ability to forget: not merely to forgive one's hurts and humiliations, one's impotencies, but what is more to forget them, to be able to pass over the past to welcome rushes of what comes in the present.[80]

Here we see the double nature of the process of negation and affirmation Jake must use to bring about a change in his consciousness. To forget, to truly forget, and to not simply suppress an emotion or fear, Jake must earn the right and find the ability to pass over and "welcome the rushes of what comes in the present." In this dual process of negation and affirmation, he must find a way of life that somehow opens him to the reality of the present and its various manifestations. Jake's method of "not-thinking" about the wound will not work. Rather, to get to the point where the past no longer has a claim on the present, Jake must open himself in an authentic way in the hope that in doing so, "the ghosts and phantoms of the past will dissipate before the light of the present."[81] Yet, to be able to rid himself of these ghosts, he must first see them, sense them, and attempt to locate where they are. This is why the football memory occurs first.

The football memory is directly linked to the wound of the war and within the psyche of Jake Barnes they are intertwined. It is imperative to note that after the fight with Cohn and the strange walk across the plaza, exactly what Jake's feels as Cohn is offering his pathetic apology. Spilka believes that the essence of this scene is in Cohn and Jake shaking hands thus fortifying their union of emotional adolescence. However, if we pay close attention to the scene we can see that Jake's mind is elsewhere.

After walking away from Mike and his new "friend," Jake comments, "I heard them talking from a long way away. It all seemed like some bad play." He tells them not to follow or help him back to the hotel room; instead he wants walk and be alone. It is then on the way back to the hotel where everything becomes

---

[80] Alphonso Lingis. "The Will to Power," from, The New Nietzsche, ed. by David Allison, (MIT Press, Cambridge, 1999), 54.

"strange...new...just like it was coming home from an out of town football game." Jake makes his way up the stairs and then is told by Bill to go and see Cohn, who seems to have had a tough time of it. Jake says, "I stood by the door. It was just like this that I had come home. Now it was a hot bath that I needed. A deep, hot bath to like back in."[82]

Cohn is in the room crying on the bed and is obviously distraught, but all Jake can ask of him is, "Where's the bathroom? "[83] Cohn persists in describing his problems to Jake and Jake persists in his need for water. "I did not care. I wanted a hot bath. I wanted a hot bath in deep water."[84]Cohn seems oblivious to Jake's indifference and instead continues,

> "I just couldn't stand it about Brett. I've been through hell, Jake. It's simply been hell. When I met her down here Brett treated me as if I were a perfect stranger. I just couldn't stand it. We lived together in San Sebastian. I suppose you know it. I can't stand it anymore."

Jake, who could tell Cohn exactly what it means to be in hell with Brett does not become sentimental or confessional with Cohn. Instead, Jake, in turn, offers this "consolation" and "sympathy" to Cohn:

> "Well," I said, "I am going to take a bath."
> "You were the only friend I had, and I loved Brett so."
> "Well," I said, "so long."[85]

The repetition of "well" shows that Jake is distracted. Yes, he has been knocked out and he is drunk, but the important aspect here is that Jake responds to nothing Cohn really says. He is set on finding some water. He needs a hot bath to lie back in. A bath like he had as a child when he was coming home from an out of town football game. Jake leaves Cohn and goes looking for a bathtub:

---

[81] TSAR, 196.
[82] ibid
[83] ibid, 197.
[84] ibid, 198.

> I could not find the bathroom. After awhile I found it. There was a deep stone tub. I turned on the taps and the water would not run. I sat down at the edge of the bathtub. When I got up to go I found that I had taken off my shoes. I hunted for them and found them and carried them down-stairs. I found my room and went inside and undressed and got into bed.[86]

Why a bath? What relationship might it have to a football memory?

To see the importance of the football memory and the future swim at San Sebastian, we will take a brief look at the psychological condition known as "persistence" from Daniel L. Schacter's recent book, The Seven Sins of Memory. Schacter's analysis provides a valuable perspective for us on the condition of Jake's memory, the *need* for the football memory, and how the memory of the injury opens Jake to the potential for redemption at San Sebastian.

The sin or experience of 'persistence' is a close description of what Jake seems to be suffering from. The condition takes many different forms and they are most often found in "those who have survived a traumatic experience: war, violent assaults, rapes, sexual abuse, earthquakes, natural disasters, torture, brutal punishment, and motor vehicle accidents."[87] One of the major forms of persistence is the avoidance of thinking about a harmful wound and disaster. This avoidance occurs especially immediately after the event. This avoidance can in turn lead to future more dramatic and harmful intrusive memories. This seems to be what Jake is experiencing in the walk across the plaza. Schacter writes, "The overwhelming pain of a traumatic experience and associated intrusive memories naturally leads people to want to avoid reminders of the incident and if possible suppress trauma related memories and thoughts."[88] It is clear that the

---

[85] ibid
[86] ibid, 199.
[87] Daniel Schater. The Seven Sins of Memory: How the Mind Forgets and Remembers, (Houghton Millfin Company, Boston, 2001), 175.
[88] ibid

memory of the football injury is a type of intrusive memory for Jake as it seems to come from some unexpected source and makes its presence felt without Jake's conscious effort.

These intrusive memories within persistence thrive in an emotional climate of disappointment, sadness, and regret. These emotions can obviously stem from a number of different sources, but in the case of post-traumatic stress disorder, the memories are often suddenly surprising and vividly disturbing. For veterans, the memories are often too real and arrive abruptly recalling in vivid detail the moment of violence against the subject. In most cases, some minute or detailed image associated with the experience can trigger an intrusive memory. These intrusive memories are not recalled in a state of rumination or conscious imagining. Rather, the survivor actually feels as if they are re-living the event. The danger of the past suddenly becomes an immediate threat again. This explains both Jake's fear of falling asleep and most importantly the complex reality of his strange walk across the square.

We have seen that one feature of persistence is that it provides a way of dealing with a memory by not thinking about the memory of a traumatic wound. However, there is another form of persistence that is the persistent *thinking about* the memory. We can see hints of this in Jake's behavior at night while brooding on the wound and Brett. Jake's attempt to convince Brett early in the novel that he does not think about it and in fact laughs at the wound, is perhaps a reflection of just how much he does think about it.

In the form of persistence where victims are chronically thinking about the memory, another condition known as 'counter-factual thinking' develops. This type of thinking seeks to regenerate the past in order to create various scenarios *other* then the actual event in order to prevent the disaster. Counterfactual thinking works in the realm of what could have happened, what should have happened, what ought to have happened and carries the constant signifier and distinction "if only." This state is

sometimes subconscious and has the tendency to freeze an individual's psyche to the point where thoughts, memories, and emotions are stuck on the single event of the past with everything else in life assuming a numb or dull quality. Psychologists have noted that this state of counter-factual thinking increases the pain and the memory of the pain by continually perpetuating its associations in the same cycle of hurt. At no point does this psychological and emotional circle and exercise lead outward. The mind becomes 'locked in' and can never free itself, as both mind and body are within the same perpetual non-movement.

Schacter is careful to note that for all of its disruptive power, intrusive memories can serve a healthy function. The events we need to confront come to mind with a force that is hard to ignore. As noted, the cases of persistence most often occur in individuals who are war veterans, victims of sexual abuse, survivors of natural disasters or accidents. Jake Barnes, in a very real way, is a survivor of all three of these experiences. In the era of Hemingway, the world of psychiatry was just beginning to come to terms with what we now refer to as post-traumatic stress disorder. In this era, the condition was more commonly known as "shell-shock." The concept originated out of curiosity by British officials' at the large number of soldiers who were shot for "cowardice" during the First World War. After an investigation, speculation began about the psychological health of these soldiers and the role modern warfare situations played in producing these states. Studies continued throughout the Second World War, but it was only after Vietnam that the condition was described as post-traumatic stress disorder.

Jake does not seem to have a severe case of shell-shock nor does he think counter-factually, longing to go back and do something different, as much as he lives counter-factually. He continues to hold onto Brett despite the fact he knows the relationship will not work. This incongruency points to the repression, which will bring

about the intrusive memory of the football scene. What is most important for us is the nature of Jake's intrusive memory and its power. Patients most often recount that these memories themselves occur as a vivid pictures in crisp detail. Schacter notes that sometimes patients account experiencing a series of frames almost as if the memory is an extended series of film-clips. Sometimes the intrusive memory can be generated by a smell, a sound or bodily sensation. For Jake, it is a punch in the head. As Jake walks across the stage, recovering from his blow from Cohn, his senses are heightened. He senses a heaviness in his arms. He feels as if he can smell leaves burning and he feels the need for a hot bath to lie back drives Jake to an empty tub where the faucets do not yield water. What is important for us is that Jake *feels* these series of sensations. He feels the need to put his suitcase down, he feels the need for a bath, "it was just this way...it was just like this," he keeps repeating. Clearly, the persisting force of memory is taking over Jake's attempt to "not think about it." He will not be the same after this night of violence, self-betrayal, and failure.

Another aspect of persistence that Schacter points to which we find in Jake is the *sense of persistence* Jake feels throughout the novel. If we look closely, Hemingway has been preparing us for this moment, this slide into Jake's inner world by suggesting that Jake is at breaking point. The memory of the wounding forces itself on Jake and its pull and sway is felt in other contexts throughout the novel. These forces primarily represent a larger context of Jake not being able to control or prevent the inevitable. We have seen this earlier in the novel. When Brett loses the mask of free hilarity and sinks into Jake's arms in misery, he confesses, "I had that feeling of going through something that has all happened before." Also we see Jake saying: "I had this feeling as in a nightmare of it all being something repeated, something I had been through and now must go through

again."[89] Then as the fiesta wears on: "It was like certain dinners I remember from the war. There was much wine, an ignored tension, and a feeling of things coming that you could not prevent happening."[90] Clearly, the pressure of the wound and the trauma of memory is making itself felt on Jake with growing force throughout the novel. The 'ignored tension' refers to on one level of the triangulation of love affairs among the group with Brett, but also applies to the deeper ignored tensions running through the novel—Jake's wound.

Schacter notes that recovery is often a long, but it is an attainable process for victims of persistence. Therapeutic solutions vary but most often in a therapy setting, the doctor will encourage the patient to *recreate* the experience in the context of the relatively safe environment of a clinical situation. Perhaps not surprisingly, then, therapeutic attempts to counter persistence in trauma survivors almost invariably focus on allowing patients to re-experience the traumatic event within the confides of a guided setting. In therapeutic settings, this is done primarily through "imaginal exposure therapies" where the patient attempts to recreate the experience. Through this process and the repetition of this process the 'sting' of the traumatic event is lessened in an attempt for the patient so see the event more clearly. By seeing the event in this setting, the individual is less likely to become overcome by the onslaught of immediate memories that contain the past forces of trauma.

The punch by Cohn has released the football injury that represents the not so distant football injury. Something essential happens to Jake's wounded psyche in this scene. A memory is discharged. Space is opened and Jake is able to identify the need for water and the specific subjective requirement of the wound's healing. Jake needs some form of water and with this knowledge, the inner, existential dilemmas of how to

[89] ibid, 70-1.
[90] ibid, 150.

live with the wound is becoming clearer to Jake. In the walk across the square, Jake goes through the inner workings and bypasses of trauma; he hears its echoes. The intrusive memory frees up the psyche to be able to be redeemed and healed in San Sebastian.

Persistence is a virtually inevitable consequence of difficult experiences. According to Schacter, confronting, disclosing, and integrating those experiences we would most like to forget is the most effective way to counter to persistence. The swim at San Sebastian is Jake's confronting and integrating his trauma. This integration is evident in Jake's subsequent return to Brett. This return does not represent reunion. Rather it is Jake's final test to see if he has made terms with his 'dreadful certainty.'

The memory of football in the novel is a complex issue. For Cohn it represents a realm of manhood, and secret longing, perhaps a world where things made better sense. He wants to play again but cannot. However, it would be hard to describe Jake, as Spilka does, as secretly longing to play again. It would be more fair to say that he deeply desires and needs some form of healing, a feeling of health, of wholeness, and relief from the kick in the head, and the phallic wound.

At the time of The Sun Also Rises, the cultural and nationalistic powers which had forged the sport were those most closely related to values associated with war: training, discipline, sacrificing individual concerns for the collective whole, men working together to protect against and inflict violence. We noted briefly before looking at football in the text that Cohn's primary psychological limitation is that he wants to go back to this game of his youth. His decision is a conscious one. For Jake the problem is more complex. His "re-calling" of football is an experience not chosen, springing from places he cannot immediately identify within his psyche. He does not share his experience with others, just as he does not speak much about the other injury. This unspoken force, the memory of wounding both in war and football represents Jake's need to begin to find a

way or method in which to live with his injury. To see this and understand football's relationship to war in Hemingway's era we will take a detailed look at the nature of American cultural atmosphere at the time of the war. This will give us an idea of what these games looked like that Cohn and Jake played in. It will give us insight to why Cohn might want to play again and why Jake must confront this memory first to find his healing.

CHAPTER 4

THE BIRTH OF THE AMERICAN GAME

> In a 1942 interview, Hemingway commented on his experience in the First World War, "I was an awful dope when I went to the last war. I can remember just thinking that we were the home team and the Austrians were the visiting team.
>
> -Carlos Baker, Hemingway: A Life[91]

> It was all different. I felt as I felt once coming home from an out-of-town football game. I was carrying a suitcase with my football things in it, and I walked up the street from the station in the town I had lived in all my life and it was all new...It was all strange.
>
> -Jake Barnes on his walk across the plaza

To understand the necessity of Jake's memory of football in its relation to the war he has escaped and the swim he will take at San Sebastian, we must take a closer look into the context of football in the era of Hemingway. By looking at this game, we cannot dismiss Jake as limited or childish. For football players in this era, there was nothing child-like about these games. Longing for a time in the past that is inaccessible may be childish, but the sport of football in this era was not child-like. Brutish yes, but not childish. At the core of the novel, there are two primary reasons why we might miss the full weight and ramifications of these football references. The first is Hemingway's succinct, polished, "ice-berg" prose. We read "football" and associate it with the late twentieth century game. We might stop at "football" recognize its surface similarity to war in terms of violence and other metaphors, but we will still see it primarily in our own context. The tone, the violence, and *the moral associations of football's violence*, in

[91]Carlos Baker. Hemingway: A Life Story, (Macmillan Library Reference, New York, 1990), p. 38.

Hemingway's context, are strikingly different than ours. We must take his meaning of football, not ours, and not Spilka's of the late 1950's, into fuller consideration when trying to get at the existential and psychological implications the sport has in relation to Jake's wound. In doing so, we can see that Jake's wound can be compared to a nation's wound. For Jake, as for America, football became a symbol of a post-Civil war tension and transition. America was within a changing new world, a modern world that was facing the effects of a gruesome encounter with morality, identity and meaning. For America, football was a microcosm for empire. For Jake, a symbol of the self. To fully understand how the conclusion of the novel is Jake's moment of tragic affirmation, we need to look backwards with Jake, into his memory and his culture's memory of the game of football. There we can see not only the nature of Jake's psyche, but also the American cultural psyche. In short, we can glean what Hemingway was looking to generate with these football references. We will see a sport that was not quite a game, but was a cultural event, a violent event that unlike its current manifestation, was one in which young men did often encounter death and its threat.

In 1931, Hemingway was correct when he wrote in Death in the Afternoon that American games had no equivalent to bullfighting. American football in 1931 had changed. Because of cultural, civic, and political pressures, it had to. In the era of the early 20th century, the sport Hemingway uses but does not describe in The Sun Also Rises, did deal with mortality, national honor, and individual moral values much like the Spanish bullfights. Football, however, was not an event in which one man stood alone in a ring with a bull. It was a different type of sport. A sport and event with "trenches," "flying wedges," "concussions," and "death-rates." In short, it was a contest absent of the grace of the bullfighter and in lacking modern football's sophistication, it more closely resembled the war in which Jake, wounded, has survived.

Bullfighting, fishing, boxing, hunting, are easily definable as existential sports because of their extreme solitary nature. In these activities, man is alone and pitted against the elements or one other man with only his own skill and prowess to rely on. American football in this era is also an epitome of another existential condition. The modern emphasis on the "group" and of men massed together in a collective, systematic, bureaucratized activity where one is virtually unable to establish the terms of his own existence represents an aspect of modernity that existentialists such as Camus, Heidegger, Sartre, and before them Kierkreggard and Nietzsche would rail against.

Jake's memory of football in the novel does not represent, as critic Mark Spilka has suggested a case of emotional adolescence. Spilka understands that football does represent a psychological threshold connected to the war that Jake must overcome, however, he reads Jake's memories of football as signs of Jake's continued emotional adolescence. For Spilka, Jake does not cross the threshold from his youthful holding onto illusions to a mature acceptance of his injury. Spilka sees the young bullfighter Romero as the hero and the sign of the "good life" that will out-live the lost-generation. Hemingway would not call Jake a hero, he identified the earth as the hero. If, however, we give up looking for a specific hero and instead focus on the what the text generates we can see how the ending of the novel can be read as Jake's moment of tragic affirmation.

Jake finds a way to live in it, by redefining his horizons and by the acceptance of a dreadful certainty, his impotence. Jake's process in this light is comparable to what is often noted to be the goal of psychoanalysis---it is most often not the quest for answers to the questions, but the quest to ask better questions.[92]

[92] This theme seems to fit the pragmatic, existential Jake Barnes, who does not wish a metaphysical answering to his suffering, he simply wants to know how "to live in it."

We will attempt to read the cultural symbol of football by putting the football of Hemingway's era in its context. In doing so, we will see that Jake's memory of the "game" is paralleled to the violence of war. The memory of being "kicked in the head" becomes the psychological threshold Jake must cross in order to be able to remember and live on good terms with the violent wound he has already experienced in war. From there, we will look at some of the persistent questions of war, football, arrested development, regret, and longing for youth, by looking at Hemingway's professional and personal relationship with F. Scott Fitzgerald.

We must first look backwards into the world of early American football. There we will see something of what Jake, Cohn, and Hemingway played in and what readers of this era felt, saw, heard, what images, what moral associations, presented themselves with the mention of *football.* An isolated strand in the poetic prose of The Sun Also Rises requires such reconstruction. As Linda Wagner Martin has told us, "The Sun Also Rises is a difficult book to read correctly, until the reader understands the way it works; then it becomes a masterpiece in concentration, with every single detail conveying multiple impressions, and every speech containing both single character and complex relationships."[93] To see anew in order to experience again, it is essential for each new generation of Hemingway readers to attempt to understand exactly what lies beneath the iceberg's surface.[94] To see what historical movements, and cultural forces move *with the ice.*

It is always difficult to gauge the impact of personal experience on an author's work. Biography can be useful only up to a point and until that point we should exhaust the

[93] Linda Wagner Martin, "One Debt to Imagism," from Critical Essays on: The Sun Also Rises, ed. James Nagel, (Prentice Hall International, London, 1995), 63-74.
[94] In an interview with George Plimpton for the *Paris Review* in 1958, Hemingway used the metaphor of an 'ice-berg' as an explanation of his prose style. "I always try to write on the principle of the iceberg. There is seven eighths of it under water for every part that shows.

resources we can in trying to come to a deeper understanding of a text. Jake Barnes is not Hemingway. But Jake is a reflection of his age and a reflection of the American experience in the war. Because of this legacy, as we will see, Hemingway was suggesting a complex world when he associated Jake with football. Hemingway himself played in high school at Oak Park in his junior and senior years. His performance was average. He played as a lightweight his junior year and as back-up interior linemen his senior year. His career was far from spectacular as were his athletic exploits in any other sports. But in those two years, Hemingway played a position, interior lineman, that was one of the most violent and most turbulent on the field in a sport that was quickly becoming the most violent in the history of the American experience.

A BRIEF HISTORY OF FOOTBALL FROM TS ANCIENT PAST TO THE AMERICAN PRESENT

"Football" is as old as society and as old, if not older then war. Hieroglyphic records in Egypt reveal a game like soccer, involving tackling, advancing a ball to a goal line that was played in accordance with fertility rites. The Chinese had a similar "ball-game" which was played using a ball of stuffed hair. In ancient Greece, a closer form to the eventual sport of American football was played. The game was known as *harpaston* (hand-ball) and involved two teams, each trying to move a ball-like object across a goal line by kicking it or throwing it. The Romans adopted the Greek game, and in the spirit of

---

Anything you know you can eliminate and it only strengthens your iceberg. It is the part that doesn't show."

Roman imperialism adapted and changed some of the rule structures as well as its name—Latinizing 'harpaston' to *harpastum*.[95]

It is believed that Roman legions spread the game through Europe and the British Isles. In England the game assumed the name "mellay." The game was the precursor to rugby and was marked by its chaotic, communal violence and the sense that the game was a collective expression of the community's autonomy and strength. Legend has it that the English football game was played with the head of a Danish private. Obviously, the game did not forget its violent Roman origins.

Mellays eventually became part of the community life and medieval festivals throughout Europe. The synthesis of communal expression, celebration, football, and religious rites might best be seen in the medieval English, Roman founded-village of Chester (from the Latin *castra*, meaning, camp). On Shrove Tuesday the people commemorated the defeat of the legionnaires, when as legend has it, the townspeople formed a great wedge in the center of the city and pushed the Roman invaders outside the wall of Chester. In commemoration, on the day before the official beginning of Lent, all work was halted and the townspeople of Chester and the farmers from surrounding villages meet on an open field to play "football."

The game spread throughout England and became part of the pre-Lenten celebrations as neighboring townships would face off and compete in a game which, in the words of Whittingham, "resembled a raucous mix of kickball and hand to hand combat." The ball that was used went from being pigskin to becoming the production of the village shoemakers who created the balls from animal, primarily cattle hides.

Churches and city governments eventually demanded that rules and regulations be introduced so that the "event" would become a sport. By the eighteenth century it

[95] Richard Whittingham. The Rites of Autumn: The Story of College Football, (The Free Press, New York, 2000), 28.

resembled the modern version of soccer and had become popular among secondary schools in both rural England and at more famous institutions like Eton and Harrow. The "event" was associated as being one for the "commoners" and more high-breed aristocratic classes saw the sport as undignified. But because of its popularity in school playing grounds, among both classes, the game became more accepted on all social levels. As rules were introduced, one regulation would be the center of much debate and eventually bring about the birth of a new sport. The rule was that the ball was not allowed to be touched or carried in the arms when advancing.

The debate began in 1823. During the final seconds of a football match at the Rugby School, when Rugby student and player William Webb Ellis, frustrated by his team's approaching defeat and desperate to prevent it, caught a ball in mid-flight in his arms and began a frantic dash to the opposing team's goal. Darting through defenders, and astonished, raucous fans, Ellis scored an illegal goal, and the point was not allowed. However, because of the level of excitement the play generated, a debate was among fans and players ensued and out of this debate, Rugby was born.

Rugby is the father to American Football and soccer. In today's vernacular war and football, are often tied together with just a vague sense of their true connection and relationship. Football has been a part of the American mythic structure since 1890. It has provided a rite of passage for young men and a collective ceremony for fans and supporters for decades. In looking at the early history of American football it is essential to establish that this foundation grew *out* of a war-torn nation, but grew *up* with Manifest Destiny, the end of Western expansion, the beginning of aggressive imperialistic foreign policy, urbanization, industrialization, and the "scientific and rational" quest for profit. America was making its shift from an agrarian economy to an industrial, urban one. With these changes the need to test old definitions of manhood against new venues emerged in an effort to maintain a sense of traditional manhood in the age of the machine. To be

able to reconcile the current scientific and industrial age, with the traditional values of old, social organizations looked to sports and particularly football. As America was redefining itself as an emerging world power, it looked backwards, and forwards. Backward to it's martial past and legacy in the Civil War, and forward with its industrial, imperialistic hopes for the future. Football provided a link to the past, a look to the future, and an outlet for cultural and regional expressions.

To understand the cultural phenomenon of American Football we must first look at what the game looked like on the field. And already we have made a critical mistake. Football was not quite a game and it definitely was not recreation. Today the world between sport and entertainment can be easily blurred but in the early twentieth century, football was something strikingly different than entertainment. Interest in professional teams was minimal and instead college teams carried the "contests" and high school level competition later developed in preparation for juniors and seniors. In other words, like war, the primary participants were not quite boys and not quite men.

In contrast to our modern game, protective gear was sparse. As the number of spinal, neck and head injuries, concussions, and deaths, rose; players were forced to wear leather helmets. The strategy of the game in its early years was so different that it would perhaps be unrecognizable to modern eyes. Teams were not spread across the field in wide formations. Instead, eleven men on each side drew near each other in mass and crowded together. At the start of each play, the quarterback would toss the ball behind him to a running back who would then try to follow his blocks and avoid on-coming tacklers, in an attempt to gain yardage. The forward pass was not made legal until 1905 and even then it was not used widely until after the First World War. Mass plays and wedge formations, depended upon grouping together and breaking the opposing team at their "weak-point." Many of these concepts, and the names of the

plays, came from military handbooks. With no forward pass, the game resembled a mixture of rugby and soccer. However, what gave early football its most famous or infamous stamp was what occurred *after* the play. Often times opposing players would hit each other late after the play, or piled in a group secretly bite, pinch, and sucker punch in the huddled mass. But subtlety was not required for this violence. It was just as easily done in the open. Many times players would be allowed to engage in short, impromptu boxing matches after the play was over.

In modern football terminology, offensive and defensive linemen are said to play in the “trenches.” This is the area around the line of scrimmage, often unnoticed to the eye of the television viewer, where players fight hand to hand, and body against body for the advantage of a few feet. It is here, in the trenches, even in our own era, where the game is most violent. Its goals and methods are simple but executing the objective is not. In the modern game, the task of the offensive line is to protect the quarterback in order to give him time to throw downfield to one of his receivers. On running plays the line must create a specific lane, a space, a hole, an opening, for the running back to run through. The goal of the defensive line is just as simple in concept—penetration, break the line, and “sack” the quarterback or running back. These battles on the line of scrimmage are crucial to the game, but as noted, they are most often unnoticed as the attention of the viewer is focused on the agile, star running back, fleet-footed wide receiver, or million-dollar quarterback. Endorsement dollars control television cameras. And we miss the feel, the constant impact, each and every play, which occurs on the line of scrimmage. That is why it is imperative to note that the football of this era consisted only of these pitched battles in the trenches, without the modern day protection of equipment and rule enforcement. It is also within these trenches, playing interior lineman, where Hemingway experienced the sport. The scores of this era, most often single digit, or scoreless ties, reflect the nature and tone of a game without space,

without distance.

In the trenches of this game, the consequences of "playing" were severe. As noted, slugging, fighting, mauling, biting, all took place and was even encouraged by coaches. A player could be tackled, and as he was lying on the ground receive a knee drop to the collarbone. From the late 19th century until 1905, this violence went often unchecked. However, protest grew as the amount of casualties rose. Football historians point to 1905 as the decisive year in the early history of American football. The year was marked with 18 deaths, and over 160 serious injuries.[96] Public outrage from citizen groups, political humanists, and clergy forced the hand of Teddy Roosevelt (also one of the major apologists for football), to call a national meeting of top football officials to demand rule changes or the abolition of the sport.

The changes that followed consisted of moving the first down distance from five to ten yards creating more distance. Each game now would have four more officials and therefore greater enforcement. Time was divided into four quarters to allow greater rest for the players. The forward pass was also made legal in an effort to encourage teams to 'open the game up.' Still within these rules, an incompletion resulted in a turnover and the defense was free to make contact with the receiver before he received the ball. There were thirty changes in all, but most teams resisted them, especially the eastern schools that represented the football Establishment. The traditional powerhouse teams saw the change in tactics as watering down football. Change represented a breaking away from the ideal of manhood proved in the heat of competition. Change represented a violation of freedom coming from Washington.

Though these changes took place, it is interesting to note that the public outcry was not a majority voice and many saw the measures as futile. The passing game that

[96] Allison Danzig. The History of American Football, (Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, 1956), 134.

was supposed to open the game up was rarely ever used. Teams and coaches saw it as an unnecessary risk and the old-guard saw it as an act of cowardice. It would not be until after Knute Rockne's Notre Dame team shocked and defeated Army, by using the pass, that teams would begin to take notice. However, before Notre Dame's upset the rules still exposed the receiver to immanent danger as defenders were allowed to hit him as he waited for the ball. Even after the meeting in Washington, the dangers of the game were still a reality. In the year 1909 alone the death toll rose to thirty-three. Though more changes were needed, the public outcry was not as loud as it had been four years earlier. There were no widespread demands for the abolition of the sport. Football, for better or worse, was here to stay.

To understand America's fascination with early football—both aggressive support and virulent opposition—we will look briefly at two factors. The first is a national press, which was the major factor in creating the sport in the collective American imagination. In this creation, football was painted with elaborate and exaggerated colors, but such colors sold newspapers. The second main factor (which also greatly influenced the first) was the complex range of socio-economic forces of the Establishment, which merged, with the newspapers to defend and define the "sport of American football." As we will see, the merging of these two forces, the Establishment and the newspapers of the day, assumed the colors and strong tones of red, white, and blue.

The popular conception or more precisely misconception of football was fueled primarily by the newspapers of the day.[97] The sensationalized narrative structure of newspaper accounts during the time, shaped and maintained by the monolithic entity of William Randolph Hearst's, depicted football as a type of modern day "gladiator match." References to war in exaggerated mytho-poetic language dominated the press'

description of football and in an era of little photographic journalism, and pre-moving pictures, an era in which mass media *was* newspaper, Hearst and others had a blank slate on which to draw its neo-primitive, romantic visions of football. For many of the first generations of fans, these accounts were their first exposure to the sport of American football.

Without a first-hand knowledge of the game or limited exposure, new readers could easily be swept into such accounts of football's mystique. Newspapers of this era had no qualms with creating and extending these misconceptions and exaggerations. The *New York Journal's* headline of the Yale-Princeton game in 1896 read,

"*Rome Brought Up To Date as Gladiators Battle in an Arena before Patricians and Plebeians*."[98]

The headline for the 1903 Yale-Harvard game in Chicago at Soldier Field announced,

"Scene like One in Ancient Rome." [99]

The *World* compared the audiences of a 1892 game to the one that "stormed the walls of Babylon or charged with Bal-hazzar through the gates at Antioch." Note, in the tradition of historical communal violence that it is the crowd who is storming and charging. During these early contests crowd control often became riot control at the end of many games between rivals. In fact, the Penn-Princeton series was suspended for

---

[97] For a detailed look into the relationship between Newspaper and the formation of early American football see Michael Orchid's Reading Football: How the Popular Press Created An American Spectacle, (University of North Carolina Press, Chapel Hill, 1993).
[98] ibid, 185.

much of the 1890's because of the post-game, annual brawl between opposing fans. An 1887 Thanksgiving crowd of the series is compared to ancient crowds. Those in attendance are similar to what "maybe Caesar or Pompeii saw...when they brought home brand-new lions and captives and throngs to Rome."[100]

The synthesis of battle, social event, and folk ritual, gave fans not only the chance to watch, but to also participate. If they had a grievance against an opposing team or a cross-town rival fan, well, then, it could be settled after the game. This atmosphere may seem out of control and chaotic but early football enjoyed the benefit of the protective aura of being set in the context of universities and institutions of higher education which harkend back to the ancient Greek world. This setting gave the game an even greater echo of an ancient, epic, romantic contest. As we will later see, such references to the greatness of Roman Imperial strength would fall on ready and attentive ears within the American political climate of this time. Again from the *World*, this from the Yale-Princeton game in 1891:

> It was a royal battle of gladiators, such as were fought in the days of Hector and Ajax. Surely, here were the old Roman kings circiling in their clattering chariots gloating over the running fight, and satiated with death; here was the arena, the sharp clash of spear and buckler of grave and cuirass, and the dull, trampling roar of legion of lictors. Here were the lovely maidens of ancient days turning down their pretty thumbs with ever mangling scrimmage, and shrieking with delight at every thrust and parry...Think of Ulysses as a centre rush, of Menelaus as guard or of Paris as a quarterback; why Heffelinger and Riggs would eat them up, armor and all.[101]

If an emerging sensational press provided the new sport with popularity, it also added impetus to the opponents of football who opposed the game both on humanistic and religious grounds. For the Yale-Princeton game in 1889, *The World* "provided" two

---

[99] ibid
[100] ibid, 183.

ambulances, four stretchers, an “expert army surgeon” available on call. In the next day the paper focused on the large amount of medical presence at the game which it itself had provided. During the 1897 season, Hearst-controlled papers such as *The Journal*, the *New York Herald*, *The World*, *The Evening World*, published, along side scores and standings, the season’s mounting death toll. Also during this season, because of mortal injuries suffered on the field, the Georgia state legislature and the city of Chicago proposed legislation to ban the sport. Hearst papers thoroughly covered both events. Hearst papers also ran “interviews” with boxers and bullfighters who bemoaned the violence in football claiming that the tone and nature of violence in football was worse and much more dangerous than their own respected sports.[102]

Finally, coverage in *Harpers Weekly* from 1893 on the Princeton-Yale game reflected how football was not quite a game, but was becoming more of cultural event, and something of a cultic rite, full of ritualistic pomp, ceremony, and spirit. The pre-game parade which would end entering into the stadium is described:

> ...like the sounds of the bugle calls and the coach horns and rifle-like cheer of Yale and the sky-rocket yell of Princeton...like the advance of any army going forth triumphantly to war.

During the game fans sang songs, chanted, in honor of their favorite players like, "the ancient Goths in their war-songs.” After the Princeton victory *The Evening Sun* describes the scene in the locker room, “naked, covered in muck, blood and perspiration,” the Princeton players sang the doxology that allowed for a sight which “...was great and how serious is the joy of victory for those who conquer.”[103]

The journalism of the day was all too ready to provide sensational accounts of these football battles. And Americans were anxious to read about fearless men who strode into battle against enemies, who struggled, fought, and eventually experienced

---

[101] ibid, 185.
[102] ibid, 216.

'the joy of those who conquer." These early associations of football with war both reveal a truth about the game as much as it conceals the truth about this game. While there was exaggeration, there was also an audience that wanted and perhaps needed this exaggeration. Where the truth existed is hard to determine. Football quickly was becoming part of the "American Century," and this legacy was solidified and defended by the "Establishment." The same establishment which would defend the cause of manifest destiny, imperialism, and eventually world war. As we will see, this connection was vital for football's birth, growth, and survival.

THE DEFINITION OF EARLY AMERICAN FOOTBALL: THE ESTABLISHMENT, GOOD SOLDIERING, SOCIAL DARWINISM, MUSCULAR CHRISTIANITY AND WAR AS MORAL EXERCISE

> "...this outdoor game is doing for our college-bred men, in a peaceful way, what the experiences of the war did for so many of their predecessors in 1861-1865."
>
> Walter Camp

To understand how American football was able to defend itself against the charges of useless, senseless violence, and the sensationalized media accounts which sparked both its meteoric popularity and fierce opposition, we must look at what forces forged the foundation of American football. These forces represented the dominant political, economic, and cultural pressures that were beginning to emerge in the United States.

In the 1890's, as European powers expanded, the U.S. saw the closing of its own Western Frontier. Manifest Destiny had run its course within the continental U.S., and

[103] ibid, 94.

was now looking for other froniters to further the ideal of the “democratic republic.” Within its own frontiers the country was quickly changing. Cities were now the center. Industrialization, fueled by scientific modes of operation and structure expanded capitalism which ran virtually unchecked. With this free reign and the realization of opening foreign markets the desire for profit and gain furthered the expansion of industrial capital. The U.S. began to see itself as a world power that was losing out to its European ‘neighbors’ across the sea in the race across the globe. Because of this the U.S. quickly looked to expand. In 1893 Hawaii was seized. In 1895, U.S. forces threatened British forces in Venezuela. And by the end of the Spanish-American war in 1898, the U.S. had control over the Philippines, Cuba, Puerto Rico, and Guam. In short, with global expansion and the development of industrialized military power, America was going to become more and more dependent upon generations of soldiers, military leaders, governors, and business leaders. Men who needed to learn what it meant to work with others, give orders and take orders for the good of the team.

The first major football stadium in the United States was Harvard’s Soldier Field. Its construction, funding, and moral vision encapsulates much of the forces of the establishment that went into the foundation of American football. In this era higher education the aims and goals for men often carried religious, civic, and business duties. The atmosphere of universities and ‘The Academy’ at the turn of the century might be described as a boy’s club with religious roots in an esteemed tradition of the ancient past, in order to maintain the pursuit of American supremacy on the grooves of a well-oiled economy. Harvard, Princeton, and Yale, were the elite teams as well as the elite schools of this era. Together they formed the Eastern Establishment of football. Outside of Harvard’s Soldier Field a monument was erected in honor of the men who gave their

lives in “the war of 1861-1865 in defense of the Republic.” [104] The monument still stands and eulogizes “its 1200 sons who answered their countries call in the Great War of rebellion.”[105]

The tie with the Civil War, America’s mythic yet not so distant past, was felt just as much but with a decidedly different tone in the South. Southern teams saw the sport and as a chance to continue “the fight” and renew the struggle for the “lost cause” of their forefather’s. In 1910 before a game at Yale, Vanderbilt University coach Dan MacGugin, delivered a pregame speech in which he told his team, “It is the South versus the North, Confederate against Yankee. Remember the campfires of your fathers and forefathers.”[106] Southern teams harkened back to their own military past to install a sense of regional pride and the opportunity of revenge for the economically inferior South. MacGuin and other Southern coaches used this motivational approach when Southern schools faced Northern opponents. Again, MacGuin as Vanderbilt was poised to take on the University of Minnesota,

> Men, those people in the stands out there haven’t heard of Southern football. When they think about the South, they think about the Civil War—pain, suffering, and death. Many people have no idea what Southern manhood is all about. Today we can show them...your mothers...wondered when the time would come when you could bring honor to the South. That time has arrived.[107]

At the University of Virginia, the uniforms, in honor of the Confederate past, were gray with red trim. When Southern teams began to feature the forward pass with great success and defeat Northern schools, it was compared to the “Southern calvary” which throughout the first half of the war had been superior to their Northern counterparts. In

[104] ibid, 199.
[105] Gems 214
[106] ibid, 166.
[107] ibid, 168.

1917 when Ohio State visited Montgomery, Alabama to play to play Auburn University, *The Birmingham News* stated, in typical newspaper rhetoric of the era,

> ...the game will be fought in the proud shadow of the Confederacy, and the grandfathers of these southern boys...were the men that hurled back those Yankee invaders as gamely for four long years in the 1860's.[108]

When VMI beat Penn in Philadelphia in 1920, 27-7, the VMI band played "Dixie" after each score. This playing of 'Dixie' spread throughout the South when its teams played Northern counterparts and became part of football tradition throughout the South.

As the veterans of the actual war were disappearing towards the turn of the century, football became a new venue in which to honor soldiers on both sides. With the end of the century and the emerging martial and nationalistic forces that were emerging at this time, football became a link to the mythic American past. This was the era in which the wounds of the war and Reconstruction were healing throughout the nation in the form of reunions, re-enactments, Memorial Day, and Confederate Memorial Day all of which featured soldiers from both sides who met again and were praised.

Stephen Crane, who had no actual war experience as a soldier, wrote *the* American novel on the soldier's experience with The Red Badge of Courage, published in 1895. The story of Henry Fleming and its psychological realism represented a break with romantic depictions of the war. These were not King Arhtur's Knights dashing off to attack or save Vicksburg or sack Richmond. Rather, Crane explores the questions and meanings of anxiety faced by a soldier in a time of war. The psychological account was written with such vermisilitude and vivid detail that initial commentators believed Crane was drawing from his actual Civil war experience. The *Saturday Review* of January 11, 1896 marveled at Crane's,

[108] ibid, 167.

> ...personal experience of the scenes he depicts...his knowledge, as we believed acquired in war, has been assimilated and become a part of himself...if his book were...unbased on personal experience, his realism would be nothing short of a miracle.[109]

This miracle existed in Crane's abilities of creating a narrative based on the recollections of Revolutionary War stories told by his ancestors and from his own personal experience in playing football. For Crane football was a point of literary and personal interest. Beyond The Red Badge of Courage, Crane worked as a reporter for the *Journal* in 1896 covering the Harvard-Princeton game and the Harvard-Carlisle game as well. In his contributions for the youth magazine *St. Nicholas,*[110] Crane focused many of his short stories around tales of athletic heroics.[111] But for us here, it is primary to note that Crane's literary immorality is due to his portrayal of the complex emotions and contradictory actions of the human experience when encountering mortality on the battlefield. The insight produced and yielded personal, believed as personal, was based largely on Crane's experience in a "game."

The Civil War was a point of pride for both Northern and Southern schools. It is not a tenuous link with America's martial past, but rather the very ground, the foundation, out of which "American football" was created. Social, economic, and political pressures in both regions were looking for new outlets by which to experience and maintain older values. Casper Whitney, who along with Walter Camp is considered one of the founding fathers of American football, saw the game as a "mimic battlefield on which players reconnoiter, skirmish, advance, attack, and retreat in good order." Governor Wolcott of Massachusetts saw football as preparation to answer the "country's call as did our

---

[109] Pacal Covici Jr. Introduction to The Red Badge of Courage, (Penguin Books, New York, 1983).
[110] Michael Orchid. Reading Football: How the Popular Press Created An American Spectacle, (University of North Carolina Press, Chapel Hill, 1993), 73.
[111] In an interesting note, Grace Hemingway who left detailed recordings of her children as they grew up, noted that *St. Nichols* was young Ernest favorite magazine and reading material. In "The

fathers and brothers in 1861-1865."[112] But the link with the past of the Civil War was simply the bedrock. If the game grew *out* of the mythic past it grew *up* with Manifest Destiny, the end of westward expansion, the beginning of aggressive foreign policy and imperialism. American foreign policy during this era became aggressive, reflecting the merging of the spirit of the "white-man's burden" and Manifest Destiny with the scientific, capitalistic revolutions which were occurring in American cities. These various forces—nationalistic, social, and economic, found a unique home and cause within football.

As noted, football came under much civic scrutiny because of the violence found in the game. Defense for the game came from within the academy. The social Darwinist school of Herbert Spencer and "the survival of the fittest" along with the ideal of capitalistic fortitude found a rallying point within football. As the game continued its rise in popularity American power-structures became fascinated with the moral, social and ethical potentialities of the game to become the true "American sport." This is evidenced from the social Darwinist rhetoric that came from this era in defense of football. Often divergent, multiple "logics" were layered on top of each other in the name of football. Consider this statement from Henry Cabot Lodge in 1895:

> ...the injuries incurred on these playing fields are part of the price which the English speaking race has paid for being world-conquerors...victories...are the manifestation and evidence of a spirit which is all important...this great Democracy is moving onward to its great destiny. Woe to the men or nations that bar its imperial march...[113]

Notice that the defense begins with injuries that were happening to *real* boys on *real* fields, and by the end these boys are playing "games" on other fields against foreign nations and opposing football squads in the name of Democracy. This was not the first

---

Last Good Country" Nick Adams refers to the magazines and says they are too sentimental but he still enjoys them.

[112] Gems, 63.

[113] ibid, 26.

time football's essence was correlated with American essence. At the foundation of the rules of the game there was a split from the European concept of rugby. This split was seen as "progress." Walter Camp wrote of the change: "Our players have strayed away from the original Rugby rules, but in so doing have built a game and rules of their own more suited to *American needs*."[114] These unique American needs can be seen in the comments of James Knox of Harvard who later explained, "Football embodies so many factors that are typically American...virile, intensive, aggressive energy that makes for progress is the root which upholds and feeds American supremacy and American football."[115]

Football was seen as an extension of American-Anglo superiority. Cameron Forbes, the longtime coach at Harvard, saw the spirit of football as the expression of race. "Football is the expression of the Anglo-Saxon. It is the dominant spirit of a dominant race, and to this it owes its popularity and its hopes of preeminence."[116] If football was seen as the expression of a dominant race, in a dominant country, which was bent on expansion (Destiny), then football could become the moral training ground. Football soon became the American sport because it extended American imperial interests and was pervasive as a cultural item for civic enjoyment and participation at all levels. As Teddy Roosevelt and the Rough Riders were taking to the hills in Cuba, *Outing* magazine, in July 1898, put forth the value of "play."

> Sport is merely artificial work, artificial adventure, artificial colonizing, artificial war...Those were hard games we played against the Indians, against fierce nature, against England, and against one another in the 60's.[117]

[114] ibid, 20.
[115] ibid
[116] Gems, 97.
[117] ibid, 77.

Games are not played for enjoyment, but for preparation, training in order to face other opponents. As the magazine reflects, the athletic-football spirit was meshed with the martial-imperialistic sense in such a way that this spirit, if it could not go across the seas to find challenge, its participants would take trains, from college to college, awaiting the call for battle.

The Social Darwinism and the imperialistic overtones of this rhetoric also came from the university, which defended the game on moral grounds. Despite the fact that some of football's most ardent detractors came from University administrations who saw the game as unnecessary, unruly and unsafe, the academies also produced a number of defenses for the game. Yale professor Eugene Richards stressed the need for "personal encounters" to develop moral character for a "virile race." J. William White and Horatio Wood professors at the University of Pennsylvania stated that football's element of "personal danger" was valuable training for "all the struggles of life." Illinois professor Edwin G. Dexter believed that football's violence answered the "Call of the Wild" in college youth.[118]

As the American moral and philosophical landscape changed with evolutionary science and the rise of industrial technology, religious groups also began defending American football, on similar grounds. This unique combination of both current emerging scientific and traditional religious values of the American past shows the comprehensive sweep and influence football had in this era.

Within Christian circles, football gradually changed from being barbaric and taking away from Sunday's church attendance to becoming an actual extension of Christian ethics. This represents an American cultural tradition from the 19th century of "Muscular Christianity." From the muscular Christian circles the cry went out that,

[118] Michael Orchid. Reading Football: How the Popular Press Created An American Spectacle, (University of North Carolina Press, Chapel Hill, 1993), 206.

"Football is rough, but Christian manliness demands stern virtues." The discipline, the authority of a coach, adherence to rules, submission, all came together in football, in religious and social as a force which children could long to participate in, young men play in, and older men to look back with a sense of personal and civic pride and say that they had been a part of.

This civic sense of a moral training ground saw its way into the ministry itself. Syracuse players were trained for football just as much as they trained for the ministry. "No less than seven candidates for the ministry were on the varsity, each one rated as a 'scrapper.'[119] John A. Hamilton, later a distinguished clergymen and Doctor of Divinity, was considered to be "the hardest fighter of them all." George Hares states, "Football served my religion well and my religion came in handy as a restrain influence versus fistic encounters and swearing."[120] Muscular Christianity and the Evangelical movement saw athletic fields as an untapped potential for furthering their missions.

This was evidenced by the popular success of fundamentalist preachers like Billy Sunday (1863-1935), who reflected this muscular tone by saying that "Jesus was the greatest scrapper who ever lived." Sunday led over three hundred revivals throughout the U.S. and attracted audiences estimated at over one million million. These numbers mark Sunday as the leader of the largest revivals by one person before the use of television broadcasting. Sunday was also a leader in the Prohibition movement and his largest revival, held in New York City in 1917, was organized explicitly for that cause.[121]

The impetus of this ethic was furthered by Christian organizations such as the Boy-Scouts and the YMCA. Many coaches and administrators of early American football had close ties with the YMCA. Alonzo Stagg, the legendary player and coach, worked as

[119] ibid, 237.
[120] Gems 74

[121] Gems 86

YMCA secretary at Yale and spent summers with Dwight Moody's evangelical movement before later becoming coach at the University of Chicago.[122] The impact of Muscular Christianity, which strove to show the will of God in terms of success on the playing fields, also looked for success in the business arena as well. In the business world during the early 1920's, one of the best selling books was The Man Nobody Knows. In the book, Jesus is depicted as an "up and comer, a popular dinner guest...Jesus set out to snag customer interest by making his message "simple and brief" and acting "above all sincere" and that marketing strategy led to "the greatest achievement story of them all." For Barton, Jesus was not afraid to mix it up in a fight, and he also was not afraid to go out and sell, sell, sell. In an interesting note, Barton was a minister in Hemingway's hometown of Oak Park, Illinois, and would later criticize Hemingway's prose and its apparent glorification of "secular messages."

Emerging definitions of football and American manhood might best have been crystallized in one man of this era: Teddy Roosevelt. Roosevelt saw football as part of his vision for emerging manhood and "the strenuous life." In an era of industrialization and the end of westward expansion, he became American icon for the "new manhood. " Roosevelt saw football as being able to produce for a country generations which had,"...the virtues which go to make a race of statesmen and soldiers, of pioneers and explorers...of bridge-builders and road-makers, of common-wealth builders."[123]

Within this realm of sports and its nationalistic virtues stood football. Synthesizing the forces of Social Darwinism, Muscular Christianity, and American imperialism, Roosevelt stated in the same article:

> "...athletic sports...minimize dissipation...and fight against debauchery and former athletes do their duty well, both to the State and their own

[123] ibid, 88.

families...Of all these sports there is none better than football.[124]

After 1905 this sport had survived criticism and in a sense itself. Its defense of its violence occured by referring back to an "American essence." By doing so it was able to sublimate critics into its own circle. After one of thirty-three deaths took place of 1909 at the University of Virginia the player's death was justified as a type of "sacrifice." School President Edwin Alderman stated, "In dealing with this game you are dealing with our national characteristics." [125] This comment, it should be explicitly noted, was in *defense* of the game. And if the foundation of American football was uniquely tied into this sense of "American essence" and "our national characteristics" then the stage, which the various forces of the Establishment set in motion, was set. America was special. It was a set above. It had proven this in battle. It had divine sanction. If battle would not present itself it would prove itself in sport. If America was looking for a fight it would soon have one. These questions and those statements about "American essence" soon found their answer and their chance to prove themselves with the outbreak of World War One. Stated shortly, if not crudely, Billy put down his ball and went and got his gun.

ON OTHER FIELDS ON OTHER DAYS

While elite athletes from the two other major American sports of this time, baseball and boxing, opted out of service, most notably in baseball Babe Ruth and in boxing Jack Dempsey, the majority of the entire Harvard, Yale, and Princeton football teams enlisted immediately. In 1916 all of the lettermen from the Harvard team

[124] ibid, 89.
[125] ibid, 83.

enlisted.[126] Once again, it is imperative to note that professional football on a national level was non-existent. Club teams of men existed here and there, but the pulse of the game, its lifeblood, was in the colleges and especially among these eastern Ivy League schools. These were the primarily elite teams of the day, along with, not coincidentally, the service academies of Navy and Army. Within the service academies, football heroes were marked with distinction and expectation as they later went off to battle. Among the participants in the 1918 Rose Bowl between Army and Navy half of the thirty-two players later died in battle months later in World War One or in years later in the Second World War.[127]

This connection was evident even during the war itself. Military brass and top officials looked to the game as an alternative in a soldier's free time to induldgence in both drink and prostitutes. During the war, the navy hired one of the founding fathers of American football, Walter Camp. At the same time the army hired Dr. Joseph Raycroft, and both men worked to insert football as a fixture on bases. For a time, at the navy, football was an offical part of its physical fitness program.[128]

The vast number of players who served in the war solidified the connection between American football, the American war effort, and "American essence." Now that a generation of football players had seen "real battle" the link between football and war in America became even less metaphorical.

After the war, many who had played and served became coaches to a new generation. Wisconsin Coach Harry Studhldreher claimed that "stamina, teamwork, and coordination football men are getting on the gridiron will help make them better soldiers."[129] Legendary University of Tennessee coach Robert Neyland, who worked with

[126] ibid, 79.
[127] ibid
[128] ibid, 98.
[129] ibid, 100.

Douglas MacArhtur at West Point, compared football deftness with military skill, stating that, “The same cardinal rules apply to both.” Neyland was on active service for twenty years as a coach. Also, after the war, upon his return to West Point where he was a manager on the 1903 team, MacArthur became commandant at West Point. One of his first acts was to have engraved on the West Point Gymnasium, on the way to the practice field, the inscription:

> Upon these fields of friendly strife
> Are sown the seeds
> That upon other fields on other days
> Will bear the fruits of victory

The generation of coaches, battle worn, battle ready, continued to instill the values that had been a part of football’s essence from the American Civil War to the stage of World War. Among them in the Army Chief of Staff were General George C. Marshall, Dwight Eisenhower, Omar Bradley, Joseph Stilwell, and James Van Fleet all played football. Eisenhower himself who played at Army in 1912, once said, “ I would prefer that the entire staff be composed of ex-footballers as they were the men who he could be sure would fill the leadership roles demanded of them in the army.”[130]

In the span of almost a century, 1860 to 1960, football had gone from a rudimentary form of rugby to part of the American collective history and national, authoritative structure. The game had survived the turn of the century where the mortality rates in football posed its greatest threat. As we saw, the Establishment’s definition of what football was about, its moral foundation, its moral aims, provided its defense. This defense worked on levels that uniquely combined economic, cultural, religious, nationalistic, and imperialistic forces. These forces, this foundation lead to the flourishing of football despite its continued violence.

[130] ibid

The continued criticism of the inherent violence of the game was no longer heard. Football had become essential to America and was seen as part of the Establishment. Embedded within the socio-political phenomenon of American football was a code, an ethic of how to live with pain, deal with pain, and fight through injury. Part of this code was working players past the point of exhustation. Cameron Forbes at Harvard refused to allow for timeouts. He kept all team doctors, all pills, and medication out of view from players lest they think they needed it.[131] Coach Bill Reid spoke of a player who returned to the lineup after appendicitis, playing with a rupture, vomiting daily at practice: "the fact that he is willing to undergo this punishment everyday shows...his desire to play."[132] The ability and capacity to laugh at a wound, a scar, was championed and seen as the litmus test of real manhood, *American* manhood.

This definition went beyond mere individual moral training. From foreign policy to the local high school team, national identiy and football had become part of the collective American psyche. This psyche can be seen in a statement by Jimmy Conzelman coach of Chicago Cardinals who was also a Navy Commander in World War I:

> For years we've [football coaches] been on the defensive against attacks from reformers who regard us as muscle-bound mentalities...Football has been under fire because it involves body contact and it teaches violence. But that's all over now. The bleeding hearts haven't the courtesy to apologize to us, but they're coming around and asking our help in the national emergency...because the college commencement classes...find the customary challenge of life a pale prelude to the demands of a war at world...the graduates suddenly have become defenders of a familiar way of life, of an ideology, a religion and of a nation. They have been taught to build. Now they must learn to destroy...*The young man must...become accustomed to violence. Football is the No.1 medium for attuning a man to body contact and violent physical shock*. It teaches that after all there isn't anything so terrifying about a punch in the puss.[133]

Football was not just a sport; rather, at its foundation was a link to America's martial past, America's nationalistic aims, and America's "hard-won" moral lessons from

[131] ibid, 78.
[132] ibid

its conquests at home and abroad. This code of conduct, which saw football as a nationalistic and moral training ground for young men, would not be as prevalent in the American psyche after the 1960's. Star players such as Jim Brown used the game as a vehicle for social change, and others like Joe Namath used the game to give the American counter-culture an icon. Also, after Vietnam, the code of conduct which Lodge had spoken of would be meet with collective disdain within the U.S. In the modern context, football would become synonymous with the American Establishment and linked with massive military potential for destruction. Football became part of the lexicon of the nuclear age and nihilism in the American context. Within the angst of the modern world's sense of dis-placement and dis-enchantment, we find a sense of foreboding at the massive potential for violence humankind now possessed. This was perhaps seen earliest by Freud.[134] In Civilization and Its Discontents (1930), Freud captures the modern sense of nuclear anxiety,

> The fateful question of the human species seems to me to be whether and to what extent the cultural process developed in it will succeed in mastering the derangements of communal life caused by the human instinct of aggression and self-destruction. In this connection, perhaps the phase through which we are at this present moment passing deserves special interest. Men have brought their powers of subduing the forces of nature to such a pitch that by using them they could now very easily exterminate one another to the last man. They know this—hence arises a great part of their current unrest, dejection, their mood of apprehension.[135]

Every generation lives with the shadow of death, but no generation possessed the shock to see death on such a large scale as the civilians and soldiers of the "Great War." The war marked the paradoxical summit of the forces of progress and barbarism

---

[133] ibid, 98.
[134] Freud's legacy and value to the humanities and scientific worlds is debatable. A consensus of his value and an end to this debate is not in sight, and perhaps this debate will be his legacy. However, for us what is crucial is his prognosis of the modern situation, not so much his diagnosis.
[135] Sigmund Freud. Civilization and Its Discontents, (

within the West. While the currents of the Enlightenment brought incredible scientific advances, part of its legacy is this extended shadow and paradox: an ironical self-consciousness, an unruly sense of power, the loss of any power, a helplessness, lack of meaning, *loss* of meaning, loss of the traditional, the sudden unknown, *nada*…*unrest, dejection, apprehension*…*the iron cage*…nihilism.

As we have seen throughout this chapter, football, in many ways serves as an extended metaphor for modern violence, suspended development, and aggressive nationalism. This metaphoric relation is also a statement on the loss of potential meaning in human motion in the shadow of modernity. For Jake, football represents a certain type of movement and activity that would come to dominate the modern, technological, and bureaucratized world. Its motion and construct for activity is collective, highly organized, and systemized. Men are reduced to numbers, those numbers to formulas, and the formula applied to garner efficient results in group orientated tasks. This motion, or more specifically, this lack of individual, spontaneous, creative motion, brings a sense of suffocation.

Within the American context, the shadow of modernity in the atomic age dominated post-World War Two concerns. In this era, ironically, football became an arena where societal energies both exhibitionist and paranoiac were exercised.[136] Leaders became enamored with the sport and the image it projected. John F. Kennedy made sure that video cameras were there to witness his tossing a football on the lawn at Martha's Vineyard. Richard Nixon was reported to watch Washington Redskins games and films of previous games on television during the height of Vietnam War protests outside the White House in Washington. Ronald Reagan often preferred to be called the

[136] The following anecdote might crystallize American cold-war sensibilities and obsession with football best. Green Bay Packers center Jim Ringo somberly advised Dave Meggyesy: "Dave in football, the Commies are one side and we're on the other. That's what this game is all about. Make no mistake about it." (Faulidi, 188).

"Gipper" a largely mythological football figure in reality, whom Reagan played in the even more mythological realm of a Hollywood movie. Susan Faulidi captures this strange synthesis of aggression, American "*espirit*, and global destruction":

> With the American century upon it, the nation seized upon a game that seemed to be all about triumphal leadership—or, to the less enamored overweening imperialism...As a metaphor, pro football entered into the new imperial language of power and power holders in America. Not for nothing did football come to be termed "The Establishment Game": not for nothing did the briefcase holding nuclear missile launch commands come to be called "the football."[137]

In 1926, Hemingway was tapping into a metaphoric relationship with football, collective destruction, and the limited capacity for individual action in ways he hardly could have seen or fully anticipated.[138]

But before our era of football, the 'sport' had already been a game with moral, political, and cultural meaning. It defined itself as a moral sport. Fit for training men. And if one was hurt, wounded by the game, one could know from previous experience, that the best way to deal with it, the pain, was to not think about it. To grin, to laugh, to bear it.

---

[137] Susan Faulidi. Stiffed: The Betrayal of the American Man, (Perennial, New York, 199), 157.

[138] Consider the following from an April 2002 New York Times interview with Condezzela Rice, advisor to President George W. Bush on international affairs and one of the top voices in the White House and NSC on the Middle East and America's "War on Terrorism." Rice served as an expert and part of the George H. Bush cabinet on U.S. and Soviet relations during the 1980's. Rice, a longtime football fan is commenting on what the sport and game has meant to her through the years and of her wish to one day be Commissioner of the NFL: "That's absolutely right," she said, "though not immediately and not before Paul Tagliabue is ready to step down. "I think it would be a very interesting job because I actually think football, with all due respect to baseball, is a kind of national pastime that brings people together across social lines, across racial lines. And I think it's an important American institution. "I find the strategy and tactics absolutely fascinating. I find the evolution of the game really interesting. Again, as it relates to military history. Military history has swung back and forth between advantage to the offense and advantage to the defense."

CHAPTER 5

JAKE'S RESTORATION: SWIMMING, SLOWLY, IN THE SEA AT SEBASTIAN

San Sebastian is the central location of Jake's wound, even more then the Italian front where he was wounded. The Italian front is a scene, like football that we never see in the novel. At San Sebastian, Jake's wound becomes magnified and his limitation is felt most powerfully. San Sebastian is the site of Brett and Robert Cohn's friendly fornication early in the novel. It is also the location of the layover for Brett and Mike Campbell on their way to Hotel Montoya to join the Fiesta. In short, San Sebastian is the site where the ramifications of Jake's impotency is felt most deeply.

Earlier in the novel when faced with news of San Sebastian and the rendezvous of Cohn and Brett, Jake slips and loses the tight grip of his emotional control. When Jake reads the telegram stating that Mike and Brett are staying in San Sebastian, the place of Cohn's earlier sexual triumph, Jake responds, "I was blind, unforgivingly jealous of what had happened to him [Cohn]... I certainly did hate him."[139] This confession from Jake should not completely surprise us. When he first received the news from Brett about her sexual encounter with Cohn in San Sebastian he also lost his normal stiff-upper lip stoicism when Brett tells Jake that she stayed with Cohn because she thought it would do him some good. Jake cynically responds, "Congratulations...You should take up social service."[140] These reactions reveal that the daylight "hard-boiled" nature in Jake is beginning to become undone. His feelings for Brett are trying to find some conclusion.

[139] TSAR, 105.
[140] ibid, 89.

Therefore, San Sebastian is both the physical location and the psychological area where the wound has its greatest effect and impact.

Forces beyond Jake's control have sealed his fate. If not for the wound, he would be with Brett in San Sebastian. Without the wound, Jake could fulfill his wish of taking Brett away, into the country, and assume his natural role as Brett's lover. Jake should be Robert Cohn and Jake should be Mike Campbell. In short, Jake should be with Brett. San Sebastian is synonymous with the reality that Jake is trying to avoid, namely, the reality a relationship with Brett is impossible. But as it is, Jake, wounded by the machinery of war, must stand passively back and watch as others go through the motions and gestures of intimacy with Brett.

The images Hemingway uses to describe Jake's feeling about Cohn and San Sebastian are revealing. Jake is not only "unforgivingly jealous," he is also "blind." For Jake, to lose control of his emotions is equivalent to losing the ability to see clearly. When the wound begins to exert itself in anger or jealousy, Jake feels that he is losing his bearings. Blinded by jealousy, the wound, and the frustration of impotency, Jake retreats into using sarcasm with Brett, "deviling" Cohn, drinking, and attempting throughout the Fiesta not to think about "it." The description of "blind" Hemingway uses is crucial because we see it again before Jake goes to San Sebastian.

Before leaving the Fiesta and Pamplona, Jake's failure of extended impotency has been completed. He has betrayed his sense of the aficionado code with Montoya by not protecting Romero from Brett. He is also now without Brett. Though the loss of Cohn seems incidental, Jake's handling of the situation reveals his general incapacity and resignation. It is important to watch Hemingway's descriptions of Jake during this time as the Fiesta winds down.

Jake is "drunker that I ever remembered having been,"[141] and as he walks into Brett's room he finds Mike, alone and drunk, waving a bottle on the bed. Mike asks Jake,

> "Are you blind? I'm blind?"
> "Yes,' I said, 'I'm blind."[142]

Blind, Jake goes to his room and tries to pass out in bed. Mike comments that Jake is blinder then a "tick." Going to bed provides no relief for Jake. The bed begins to go "sailing off" and Jake must sit up and focus on the wall to center himself. Spinning, Jake lies there and pretends to be asleep. Jake is again, going through the motions of action and at this point even sleep must be pantomimed. Within these motions, however, are images we have seen before in Jake's unconscious and subconscious mind, images associated with pain, water, sight, and healing. These images will reappear in Jake's swim at San Sebastian.

Earlier, in chapter three we looked in detail at the first nighttime scene of Jake's memory. It is worth looking at this section again to see the images associated with Jake's impotency. After the evening with Georgette the prostitute, Brett and the group of homosexual men, Jake rides backs with Brett to his flat. When they arrive, Jake begs Brett to come upstairs and she refuses and leaves. Jake lies awake in bed. He is not drunk. But he describes his mind moving like "waves."

> I lay awake thinking and my mind jumping around. Then I couldn't keep away from it, and I started thinking about Brett and all the rest of it went away. I was thinking about Brett and my mind stopped jumping around and started to go *in sort of smooth waves*. Then all of a sudden I started to cry…It was awfully easy to be hard-boiled about everything in the daytime, but at night it is another thing.[143]

[141] ibid, 227.

The sequence is important. Jake can not have Brett come up to his room and engage in acts of intimacy that we can assume would be torturous for both. We have signs of this in Brett's nervous shaking in the car ride and her declining of coming up stairs or going out to the country with Jake. In thinking about Brett, Jake is trying to find some form of comfort and the comfort is not merely psychological. Jake feels the desire for Brett in the force of the smoothness of waves yet this feeling dissipates immediately into tears. Here through images of water we see the forces working on Jake. The most obvious is the physical desire he feels to be with Brett, symbolized by the primordial waves and moon tides forces of the ocean. The other image of water is found in the reality of his wound and the impossibility of being with Brett actualized by Jake's tears.

The waves at the ocean and the tears are not the only water images associated with Jake. We have also seen after the punch from Cohn, Jake's desire to lie back in a hot bath. The bath Jake longs for is a reminder of the wound he suffered as a child in the game of football which itself, as we have seen, is an immediate link to the wound sustained in the war. The water imagery of Jake's altered state of consciousness and "sailing off" again reveals Jake's psychological and physical need for a body of water. This is a need from deep within Jake's psyche, springing from sources that have been working since his childhood.

Instead of more fiesta-ing with Bill in Paris, Jake decides to go to San Sebastian. Traveling to San Sebastian, alone, possess a limen and mysterious quality. Limen is used here in the broad sense of Victor Turner's definition in The Ritual Process. Turner establishes that the "liminal experience" is a transformative experience in which an individual crosses a threshold or a frontier. The boundary crossed can be social or psychological, collective or individual, and the essential quality of the experience is in the

---

[142] ibid
[143] ibid, 111-114.

intensity that the experience creates for the individual. After the experience, the individual sees time as viewed from the perspective of "before" and "after" the liminal act. We should clarify here that Turner's limen is not simply a rite of passage or a phase that one undergoes as part of societal function. Turner allows the experience to be extremely individual in nature, occurring on the margins of society, and even being subversive to societal custom and ceremonies. It can be an act of protest and a turning away from society or the "tribe." Therefore, the war is a limen experience on one level for Jake. His generation has undergone this transformation. The trip to San Sebastian, however is liminal for Jake alone.

This contrast is revealing when we consider the inability of Jake's social or religious community to create a place of healing for his wound. In that light, Jake must find the necessary outlet for what Turner describes as the limen's ability to provide a "creative space of experience." Romero provides Jake with the inspiration of the beautiful act, the "pure line of motion," but Jake must create his own space for virtuosity in action.

Turner describes the limen as, "a realm of pure possibility whence novel configurations of ideas and relations may arise."[144] For Jake, seeing these configurations, connections, and links of his present to his past has been the gradual process of learning how to live in it. The limen is a zone where he will experience the bath and the cleansing he has been seeking. Here he will also be able to incorporate the motions of Romero into his own sphere. The limen activity reduces the overwhelming complexities of memory and culture to its fundamental elements or in Turner's terminology its "alphabet." Within the liminal zone, exists the cognitive space many modernists, were seeking for the human body and creative spirit. This is a place where

[144] Victor Turner. The Ritual Process, (Aldine Publishers, Chicago, 1969), p.97.

the emotions and habitations of modern living are sublimated into a more fundamental reality.

When we consider the body in the sense of it as a 'being of embodied culture' and Jake's desire for water and swimming, we can approach the scene of the swim at San Sebastian more in depth. The limen experience occurs in different places throughout Hemingway's canon, but perhaps it is rendered most powerfully and subtly in Jake's experience at San Sebastian. The limen in Hemingway is often representative of an individual removing himself from society shortly in order to find some sense of restoration or renewal. One of the more poignant occasions of the limen in Hemingway, which might prove insightful to compare with Jake's experience, is the experience of Nick Adams in the short story, "The Big Two-Hearted River." In the story, Nick Adams, a war veteran returning home, a seeks an experience of convalesce and simplicity in motion.

In "The Big-Two Hearted River" Nick enjoys the ritual and the repetition of making camp, fishing, and eating. In the story, Nick Adams returns home injured from the war and can not find solace in the community and must re-collect the fragments of himself in an area or space in which he can achieve a larger degree of control. The two parts of the short story act as an allegory on the violence Nick has just escaped in the war and the lingering effects of that violence in his psyche. In the context of the story, it is clear that Nick Adams retreat into the woods is not a mere societal escape into an outdoorsmen hermitage. Rather the trip provides the means by which Nick can create a place of healing, penetrate the wound of his psyche, and return to civilization transformed.

Just as Jake's wound is not mentioned in his swim at San Sebastian, so too the wounded psyche of Nick is not given a direct reference throughout the short story. It is, however, present at every moment. The wounding of both Jake and Nick lies under the

surface of the text. It is only through a concentrated reading of Hemingway's selection of detail that we can gain a sense of the deeper levels of the wounded psyches encountered in each trip. The details provide clues, glimpses, and echoes of the war, violence, and injury in each context. In A Moveable Feast, Hemingway recounts writing the short story in Paris.

> I sat in a corner with the afternoon light coming in over my shoulder and wrote in the notebook. The waiter brought me a cafe creme and I drank half of it while it cooled and left it on the table while I wrote. When I stopped writing I did not want to leave the river where I could see the trout in the pool, its surface pushing and swelling smooth against the resistance of the log-driven piles of the bridge. The story was about coming back from the war but there was no mention of the war in it.[145]

The novel and the short story also contain differences and they are vital to understanding the totality of Jake's limen experience. Unlike Nick Adams in "The Big Two-Hearted River," Jake is not completely alone in his retreat from society. He does not share Nick's isolation and his escape is not from "Others," but from a specific group of others. Here, away from his "friends," Brett and the emotional complexes she represents, Jake can begin to regain a certain sense of calm and direction. The balance between solitude and being with others continues throughout Jake's short stay in San Sebastian and in that regard, the trip takes on a much different dimension than Nick Adams camping and fishing expedition in "The Big Two Hearted River." Jake's ability to undergo the limen experience while still interacting with others suggests that his convalescence will be complete and that he will be able to re-enter society.

After leaving the fiesta crowd, Jake, like Nick Adams in "The Big Two-Hearted River" begins to enjoy the slowness and stillness of his solitude. Before reaching San Sebastian, and while having dinner in France, Jake says, "It was pleasant to be drinking

slowly and to be tasting the wine and to be drinking alone. A bottle of wine was good company."[146] Gone is the collective drunkenness and like Nick Adams he is taking his time. As we saw, the limen experience marks time and its passage differently by its intensity and the feeling of "before" and "after." Eventually, a feeling of tremor, awe, and mystery shade the sense of time's movement within the limen. However, here we are seeing that Jake's awareness of his actions and their consequences are increasing.

When Jake leaves the slowness of the solitude in France and embarks towards San Sebastian, the threshold experience, he "feels like a fool for going back into Spain" where "you could not tell about anything."[147] This sense of life out of boundaries and chaos reflects the deepness of the wound and the self-betrayal Jake has experienced with Montoya, the Fiesta, and Brett. It also expresses the coming potential for significant action to take place. As we have seen, San Sebastian is the center of wounding in the novel. Jake is going back to the physical and psychological area of his most acute vulnerability. Jake, as Donald Daiker has noted,[148] is performing a feat similar to Romero. He is allowing for the maximum of pressure in the situation to see if he can pass the test completely.

We also see this sense of time's movement changing as time literally moves backwards. In going to San Sebastian, Jake crosses time zones and goes back an hour. He both regains time and goes back in time. Hemingway chooses the description for this carefully. Jake says, "I had *recovered* an hour by coming to San Sebastian."[149] Time, its backward quality, as well as the potential for recovery, points to the potential for the limen experience for Jake in San Sebastian.

---

[145] Ernest Hemingway. A Moveable Feast, (Scribners, New York, 1995), 76.
[146] ibid, 236.
[147] ibid, 237
[148] Donald Daiker. "The Affirmative Conclusion of The Sun Also Rises," From Critical Essays on Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises. ed. by James Nagel, (Prentice Hall International, London, 1995), 74-88.

The limen for both Nick Adams and Jake involve leaving society in light of the experience of senseless death and war. Both Nick and Jake must make the first break of the initial societal limit that will open oneself to nature and its powers as one exposes oneself to the natural world and the terror within one's psyche. But after this recognition another recognition must occur. We can call this realization the "acknowledgement of limits." The first limit is into solitude and away from society. The second boundary and the acknowledgement of limits are less visible. This second boundary and knowledge is the deep mortal awareness both have acquired after the war. For Jake this mortal knowledge is evident in the constant shadow of his wound. This awareness of both soldiers is that the world is inherently violent and amoral, and that though, man must risk and open himself, he must also know his limitations. This is what the experience of the war has taught them. This theme of Hemingway's is echoed later in The Old Man and The Sea and Santiago's going out too far. For us here, in the context of a young war veteran returning home after the war, we can see this awareness represented in the "swamp" for Nick Adams. This psychological landscape is shown in the final passage of "Big Two-Hearted River: Part II" when Nick encounters the swap:

> He did not feel like going on into the swamp. He looked down the river... He did not want to go in there now. He felt a reaction against deep wading with the water deepening up under his armpits, to hook big trout in places impossible to land them. In the swamp the banks were bare, the big cedars came together overhead, the sun did not come through, except in patches in the fast deep water, in the half-light, the fishing would be tragic. In the swamp fishing was a tragic adventure. Nick did not want it. He did not want to go down the stream any further today.[150]

Nick has had enough of tragic adventures. Entering the swamp violates the terms of space and control that Nick has been carefully establishing throughout his trip. In cooking, preparing the camp and choosing the right places to fish, Nick is no longer a

---

[149] TSAR, 238.

fragmented product of the machinery of war and society. He regains a sense of his manhood through the deliberate focused interaction with the elements around him. He is no longer without effect or consequence. He is no longer artillery fodder. Actions now carry meaning, sovereignty, and consequence. Transgressing the second liminal boundary of the swamp represents a realm which Nick would suddenly be thrust back into a tragic field where things occur that one cannot prevent from happening.

This field where one feels that one can not control the events around one is the place Jake inhabits throughout the novel. It is related directly to his sense of persistence in his memory of having a feeling of "a*n ignored tension*, and a feeling of things coming that you could not prevent happening...Under the feeling of wine they seemed like such nice people."[151]

As Jake sardonically notes, the fact is that "they," with the possible exception of Bill Gorton, are like the partygoers and the accidental people, Nick Carraway meets at Gatsby's parties in The Great Gatsby. Their carelessness and lack of existential direction and value will not offer Jake the form of community that he needs to be able to create a place for redemption and healing. For that, he must encounter his own personal darkness and anxiety, represented in San Sebastian.

To be able to see the importance of the swimming scene and its liminal quality in totality, we will turn our attention to another scene in the novel that is often overlooked. As Turner notes, the limen is often a threshold experience where one makes the transition from innocence to experience. We are given this dimension and signs to other links in the novel with the conversation on the train between Jake and the family from Montana.

---

[150] Ernest Hemingway. "Big Two-Hearted River: Part II," The Short Stories, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 1995), 231.

THE GOOD PLACE

It is an understatement to say that a sense of 'place' was important in Hemingway's fiction and life.This "state" has different names and a double meaning. It is at once the"good country," the 'clear country,' the 'good place,' and" the "clean-well lighted place." These places are just some of the locations of states of clarity Hemingway's protagonist, in their best moments, experience. It can be said that these places also represent literal locations Hemingway sought in his life. In an unpublished section of Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway notes three geographical areas which led to his eventual fascination with bullfighting and throughout his writings he would return to all three; Michigan, Italy, and Spain. Hemingway viewed these locations as sources where life could be lived with physical and psychological clarity.

As a boy, Hemingway spent his summers in the edenic outdoors, of northern Michigan fishing, swimming, hunting, and camping. In the passage from Death in the Afternoon, Hemingway recounts that this was the "good place" until the logging industry, clear cutting, and the expansion of roads overran it. After the encroachment of industry, the fishing was no longer good. The place therefore, was no longer good. The country was no longer real country. For Hemingway, country can rarely be merely scenic instead man must interact within it and experience its forces. Northern Italy for a time served as the "good country" where Hemingway could encounter nature unspoiled, until Italy was overrun by Fascism. In Spain, the people, the bullfights, and fishing, were all "excellent" and it became a new home for Hemingway. He writes to his friend James Gamble in December of 1923:

---

[151] TSAR, 150.

> Spain is the very best country of all. It's unspoiled and unbelievably tough and wonderful. There is swell fishing...the greatest country you ever saw and right on the edge of the only trout fishing that hasn't been ruined by motor cars or railroads...You can only live once, Carper, and this is as good as the best of the best days we ever lived on the Black and Sturgeon...But Spain is the only country left that hasn't been shot to pieces...Spain is the real old stuff.[152]

There were a few other good places for Hemingway besides Michigan, Italy, and Spain. In A Moveable Feast, Hemingway memorializes Paris, its culture, scenery, and people. The sun-drenched beaches of Key West, Florida and Cuba were essential to his writings and life, as were the desolate and mountainous areas of Ketchum, Idaho, Wyoming, and Montana. Also outside of the American and European context, Hemingway found another 'home' in Africa. Hemingway loved Africa for its variety of landscape and wildlife. In The Green Hills of Africa Hemingway sought to capture the land, the people, whole.

Idaho, Wyoming, and Montana share the various similarities and distinctions in climate and fishing, but also in these three locations in the extreme American West there is an overwhelming sense of natural wilderness still left in the United States. The same sense of the wide-open "unspoiled and unbelievably tough and wonderful yet to be ruined by industry" country that Hemingway found in Spain, he must have felt a similar sensation in his travels in the American West. Seeking the last bastion of American frontier, Hemingway spent a good amount of time in Montana in the 1920's and towards the end of his life he spent much of his time in Ketchum, Idaho.

Traveling to these various locations across the globe provided change in location, cyclical, seasonal movement which became essential to Hemingway. His time in Europe made his perspective on the U.S. sharper and more distinct in terms of what

[152] Ernest Hemingway from Selected Letters of Ernest Hemingway 1917-1961 ed. by Carlos Baker, (Charles Scribner's and Sons, New York, 1981), 130-1.

places were essential for him to work and live in and what larger themes were important to the "American" identity.

The American Western landscapes offered Hemingway an exposure and openness to nature that he could not find anywhere else. These places in his life and his fiction represented youth and unspoiled American landscapes. These themes congealed and came together most dramatically for Hemingway in his unfinished Nick Adams story "The Last Good Country." Hemingway began the story in 1952 and it offers a dark view of America's future relationship with its land. At the end of the story, armed game wardens are hunting Nick Adams and his sister through forests for violation of Federal law. The landscape itself however makes Nick and his sister feel "strange" and "solemn" and "awfully religious" like he "ought to feel in church."[153] Reverence for the land, its open spaces, and the conservation of its terrible beauty was essential to Hemingway. The short story offers us a glimpse at Hemingway's perspective on youth and the environment in the fact that Nick Adams, though just a boy, seems wiser, more aware of his environment and the larger sense of life that the wilderness provides then the game wardens who are pursuing him.

The significance Hemingway gives to landscape and places of natural wonder is seen throughout his writing. The question of place becomes particularly important as we seek to understand the end of The Sun Also Rises as Jake's moment of tragic affirmation. To understand place and the importance of the swim at San Sebastian in the end, we must identify the importance of another location named earlier in the novel.

[153] Ernest Hemingway. The Nick Adams Stories, (Simon and Schusters, New York, 1996), 89-90.

OTHER SHADOWS OF JAKE: A BOY FROM MONATANA, THE PATRON SAINT, AND THE WRESTLER WHO PREVAILED

Understanding the significance of Hemingway's search for a place 'unspoiled' and the importance he gives youth, we shift our attention to the American West. Here we can turn our attention to Jake and Bill traveling to Burgette by train when they strike up a conversation with a family from America. The conversation seems simple. Impressions are shared as both the family and Jake and Bill acknowledge the presence of another large group of Americans on board from Dayton, Ohio. The larger group is making a pilgrimage to "Rome, Biarritz and Loudens," traditional Catholic sites. "So that is what they are. Pilgrims. Godam Puritans,"[154] remarks Bill full of irony and pity. But what follows is not mere irony nor pity. Rather, it is Hemingway giving the one of the many clues on how to read the swimming scene at San Sebastian and the end of the novel.

The family sitting across and facing Bill and Jake is from Montana. When the father of the family discovers that Bill and Jake are going on a fishing trip, he says, "There's plenty that do out where I come from, though. We got some of the best fishing in the State of Montana. I've been out with the boys but I have never cared for it."[155]

The importance of fishing in a good country and the 'State' of Montana should point our attention to the symbolic potential this encounter seems to have. There is something of a mirroring occuring here. The family is from America on their way through Europe from Montana, a western landscape, unspoiled, still full with meaning and life; a state where, among other of life's bounties, there is still good fishing.

The conversation then turns to how the mother believes the father and his friends went not to fish but to drink. The father, undisturbed, winks at Bill and Jake.The family

[154] TSAR, 234.

eventually goes to the dinning cart and in their absence, we are given a parallel physical and psychological landscape between Europe and Montana through Jake's perspective. Jake describes the outdoor scene from his window,

> We ate the sandwiches and watched the country out the window.
> The grain was just beginning to ripen and the fields were full of poppies.
> The pastureland was green, and there were fine trees, and sometimes,
> big rivers and chateaux off in the trees.[156]

As the train comes to a stop at Tours, Jake and Bill get off and buy another bottle of wine and when they return, the mother, the father, and the son, Hubert, have returned from the dining car. It is interesting to note that amongst this family, only the son, Hubert, is named. This fact gives Hubert an identity and importance. We are supposed to remember his name and this scene as Jake remembers only his name to tell us. The family is sitting "comfortably," when Hubert asks Jake,

> "Is there good swimming in Biarritz?"

An American boy, from Montana, a good place, wondering if the swimming is good, points to a psychological doubling between Jake and Hubert. His question if the swimming is 'good,' seems to be in the same context of 'good' as in the "good place" young Nick Adams experiences in "The Last Good Country." Before Jake responds, the mother offers an insight both into Hubert and Jake and affirms the psychological doubling which occurs in this scene. She says,

> "That boy's just crazy till he can get in the water," his mother said. "It's pretty hard on youngsters traveling."

---

[155] ibid, 154.
[156] ibid, 93.

As we have seen, traveling from home has been pretty hard on Jake as well. In fact, he too seems to be going crazy until he can get in the water. Jake, speaking to Hubert directly, ignoring the comments from the mother, responds,

"There's good swimming," I said. "But it's dangerous when it's rough."[157]

By responding directly to Hubert and to the question of swimming, Hemingway shows the link between the two. The question of swimming and the family from Montana acts as an extended metaphor for the entire text. A young American boy, traveling in Europe, where traveling has its dangers, can make a young man go crazy, until he can find some water, until he finds some relieve. Jake echoes part of this sentiment by stating that the swimming is good but 'dangerous when rough.'

Through a small conversation piece, early in the novel we see Hemingway's gift for organization as well as the compact and unified quality of the novel. Because of Hubert's question, the location of his home, and the comment made by the mother, we can see that Hemingway establishes some of the early images of the limen experience for Jake. Hubert represents a child from the 'good country,' youth and its Eden element. Swimming for Hubert is something that will also bring deep enjoyment form the perils of traveling. Jake, an experienced swimmer of dangerous European waters, lets him know when swimming should be avoided All of these elements create the conditions of Jake's later limen experience in San Sebastian.

The traveling young boy from Montana seeking to swim is not the only place Hemingway gives us names to signify the reality of Jake's convalescence. The swim itself takes place in Jake's central location of his wounding and within this theme of wounding we find that the name of San Sebastian gives us insight as to why Hemingway

chose this location. Hemingway has carefully chosen these details and images to prepare for us the swim at San Sebastian.

The name of the town itself, San Sebastian, is named after the early Catholic saint and martyr Saint Sebastian. As we have seen, San Sebastian is the central location of Jake's wounding and disaster more so then the unknown spot on the Italian front. This is where the incapacity of his wound is felt most keenly. The town's name should give us an insight into what Hemingway was looking to generate with the themes of pain, suffering, endurance, and overcoming. The legend of the saint is worth our attention:

> A Roman martyr who suffered under Dioletian in the late 3rd century. A soldier who enlisted in 283 at Rome and strengthened the confessors Mark and Marcellian in prison.... *served as captain* of the pretorian guards...after Dioletian discovered he was a Christian, he was ordered to be *shot with arrows*. Sebastian *recovered*, confronted the Emperor for his cruelty and was beaten to death with clubs...The most famous representation of the saint comes from the 15th century, supposedly because it gave Renaissance artists opportunities to portray a *young and sometimes effeminate male nude* in an ecclesiastical context. *Sebastian became the patron of archers....and soldiers*; he also had a widespread patronage against the plague, due either to his invocation in a particular cessation of the plague or to his *courage* in facing arrows which enabled him to immunize his devotees against it.[158]

Sebastian's role as a soldier and comforter to others, his survival, and his asexual rendering offer us direct parallels to Jake's experience. In the context of Jake's 'rotten Catholicism' and his attempts to find solace in the church we can see why the image of the saint would attract Hemingway who writes, in A Farewell to Arms, "It is only in defeat that we are Christian." Hemingway's use of Catholic images and impulses begins here in The Sun Also Rises and is found throughout his work.[159] Sebastian's

---

[157] ibid
[158] David Farmer.The Oxford Dictionary of Saints, (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1997), 353.
[159] For a detailed look at some of these images see H.R. Stonebeck's *"From the rue Saint-Jacques to the Pass of Roland to the Unfinished Church on the ege of the Cliff."* Stonebeck

experience of having been shot and surviving the wounding must have appealed to Hemingway, as well as the tradition of the saint's role as patron to soldiers. Also Jake's description of himself as "pretty religious" and his consistent trips to mass and attempts to pray should cause us to reflect on some of the ramifications of Hemingway's choice of San Sebastian.

At this point, we can also consider Jake's name and its larger role in the text as it suggests wounding and a spiritual healing as well. Hemingway draws our attention to Jake's name early in the novel and its possible importance with Brett's comment, "You've a hell of a Biblical name, Jacob."[160] Remembering the wounding and survival of Saint Sebastian, we should look briefly at this biblical name Jake shares. In the Hebrew Bible, we are given the account of another sleepless night, a wounding, and survival. Genesis 32:24-31 recounts the sleepless night of the Patriarch Jacob:

> Jacob was *left alone*; and a man wrestled with him until *daybreak*. When the man saw that he did not prevail against Jacob, he struck him on the hip socket; and Jacob's hip was put out of joint as he wrestled with him. Then he said, "Let me go, for the day is breaking. " But Jacob said, "*I will not unless you bless me*." So he said to him, "What is your name?" And then he said, "Jacob." Then the man said, "You shall no longer be called Jacob, but Israel*, for you have striven with God and humans and have prevailed.*" And *there he blessed him*. So Jacob called the place Peniel, saying, "I have seen God face to face, *and yet my liife is preserved*." *The sun rose upon him* as he passed Penuel, limping, because of his hip.

Jake Barnes will not have a direct, beatific vision of God. In the Modernist context, Jacob Barnes can only hope for a blessing in some form of healing and convalescence. In that light, Jake Barnes and Jacob from Genesis offer striking parallels. The isolation of the biblical Jacob and his sleepless night, in his refusal to

---

carefully reconstructs the various statues and roads our travelers follow in the novel and argues that they fall in the Catholic tradition of a pilgrimage motif.

[160] TSAR, 30.

submit to disaster, while later walking away with a wound, all point towards Jake Barnes. There are a number of differences as well. Jake's wrestling at night with himself will not yield immediate results and in fact, Jake will undergo an experience of self-betrayal before he can begin to find healing in San Sebastian. In San Sebastian Jake will discover his own blessing and its physicality or acting out will not occur in the form of a wrestling match, but in an early morning swim.

By looking at the names and the histories of Saint Sebastian and Jacob, we see not only the parallels of a wounding and a survival but also of a gift or blessing which follows. Jake's redemption will not occur in the confides of a church. He has tried this. Or more accurately, he keeps trying to achieve this traditional means. Just as the young Nick Adams in "The Last Good Country" recounts how he feels "solemn," and "in awe," being in the outdoors, "like one ought to feel in church, so too Jake Barnes will have to go outside the traditional means to create a place of healing and wholeness. Through the use of the names and the collective cohesion of water imagery, youth, and memory, we see that Hemingway has carefully organized the novel in a manner as to suggest a moment of convalescence in San Sebastian.

"DIDN'T YOU SWIM?": THE NEED FOR SWIMMING IN THE WATERS AT SAN SEBASTIAN

We have looked in detail at the potential echoes and tremors a body might hold onto in the association between football and war. As we have seen in the previous pages, it seems clear that Hemingway is also trying to show a connection in Jake's consciousness with swimming and healing. Swimming itself, the physical activity, was a constant activity of Hemingway's throughout this life. When Hemingway lived in Key

West and Cuba, he would often swim half-mile a day in the ocean. As we have seen, in high school, Hemingway played football, but he was also on the swim team. He managed the team and his event was the “plunge,” which was a relay of swimming underwater for distance. It is interesting to note that this is precisely the type of swimming Jake will be doing.

As we have seen, American football, in Hemingway’s era, represented a social organization which brought young men together and trained them in a system of movements coordinated in series of organized, violent, gestures in which youth was rushed headlong into martial, nationalistic manhood, destruction, and eventually the war. Jake’s injury represents the potential consequence of such a cultural creed. Swimming is different.

Swimming is done alone in a world of submersion, the rhythm of one’s own movements, with occasional interruptions at the surface for breathing. One needs others to play football. One can swim with others, but one does not need others in order to swim. The motion and activity of swimming is not directed against someone or something. Rather, swimming requires the ability to move *with* and *through* water. If it is in a competitive context, it is a contest against the self and the water. In non-competitive swimming there are no chalk lines, no out of bounds, no scoreboard, no coach, and no crowd--just water. American football at the turn of the 19th to the 20th century contained a number of social and political forces that made the game a part of history and therefore limited in time. These forces and connotations are tied into the recent phenomenon of American history. Swimming, however, is different. Its tones, rhythms, and motions are somehow universal and touch the mysterious foundations of our being. Swimming is done in the womb. In all wombs.

In longing to swim throughout the novel, it should be clear that Jake does not seem to long for a return to innocence as Cohn sentimentally desires. His advice to

Hubert from Montana reflects that. We can restate Jake's advice to Hubert, "The swimming is good, but dangerous when it is rough," in the following terms: "You must navigate your own waters. Life is good, but the waters can be dangerous when the forces and currents bring conditions that put you in a position where you are no longer able to establish your own boundaries of action. Once you have lost control or exercise of autonomy, you have lost yourself." This advice to young Hubert, who is sitting across from Jake, offers us a glimpse into the means which Jake will create a place for healing.

The sense of pending danger at the bullfights is given in Hubert's mother's advice, "Be careful at those bull-fights." This warning proves prophetic for Jake because the fiesta paradoxically provides both his place of betrayal and is the location of the vision of Romero. While Pamplona and the Hotel Montoya become the places of Jake's self-betrayal and dissipated impotency, the character of Romero will provide a model of behavior and existential clarity of motion. The fiesta contains descending and ascending forces for Jake who, afterwards, must discover his own "pure line of motion." To do that, he must first find his own field of activity and motion. Jake will not train to become a bullfighter, nor we he be able to experience this motion through the passion of love. However, the body has its time, its memory, and its subjective requirements. In other words, the raw potential for healing and finding meaning must lie within Jake's own experiences. As we have seen, Hemingway has created the links within the novel to point to swimming being the place for Jake to earn some type of redemption.

Foucault, writes at length in his essay, "Nietzsche, Genealogy, and History" about the memory of the body. Though we can engage his work in its full context, he does offer us an insight to the body that will help us think about the distinction between football and war for Jake Barnes. He writes, "The body is molded by a great many distinct regimes; it is broken down by the rhythms of work, rest, and holidays; it is poisoned by food or values, through eating habits or moral laws; it constructs

resistance's."[161] What has Jake been molded by? The football wound represents a very distinct regime. A regime and nationalistic impulse that brought upon his wound to the head and eventually the phallic wound. When wounded as a boy, Jake found solace in a swim. It is out of this experience that he will draw the resources to re-create a new form of healing. The relationship between football as war and swimming as healing should be clear. Jake's has been shaped the echoes of violence (football and war) and the healing found in water (bathing and swimming). Jake's subconscious and conscious experiences hold these echoes, and Hemingway captures this through a masterful use of images and their careful organization.

We have seen the implications of water with swimming, bathing, youth, experience, and injury, but there is another instance in which all elements come together with direct relation to Jake, Brett and San Sebastian. Here we can see the psychological and spiritual 'cleansing' Hemingway suggests in swimming and bathing.

When Brett immediately returns to Paris from San Sebastian and her "not frightfully amusing" fling with Robert Cohn, she runs into Jake and Bill Gorton on a curbside beside a taxi. The dialogue and what *does not* take place is important:

> "Beautiful lady," said Bill. "Going to kidnap us."
> "Hullo!" Brett said. "Hullo!"
> "This is Bill Gorton. Lady Ashley."
> Brett smiled at Bill. "I say I'm just back. Haven't bathed even. Michael comes in tonight."
> "Good. Come on and eat with us, and we'll all go and meet him."
> "Must clean myself."
> "Oh, rot! Come on."
> "Must bathe. He doesn't get in till nine."
> "Come and have a drink, then, before you bathe."
> "Might do that. Now you're not talking rot."[162]

[161] Michael Foucault. "Nietzsche, Genealogy, and History," The Focault Reader, (Pantheon Books, New York, 1984), p.55.
[162] TSAR, 80.

Brett's desire for a bath after the trip to San Sebastian is a symbolic gesture of her wish to 'wipe out' Robert Cohn. She needs to get rid of the affair before her reunion with her fiancé Mike Campbell. Possibly, she feels she must bathe before she is around Jake again. Either way, no matter her motivation, she does not bathe. It is interesting to watch the hierarchy of Brett's needs in the passage above. She feels that she needs to wash away Robert Cohn more then she needs food. She insists that she will eat later, but now she must bathe. However, when Jake and Bill suggest a drink, she forgets about the bath and agrees. Drink takes precedence above all else. This represents a different type of washing away in an attempt to forget about Cohn. After the drink, Brett tells Jake and Bill to meet her and Mike at ten at the Select for more drinks. She gets in a taxi, returns to her room and Bill and Jake eat dinner at Madame Lecomte's restaurant. When we see Brett again with Mike, at the Select, she is, "sitting on a high stool, her legs crossed. She had no stockings on."[163] Mike, who has just arrived in town and is admittedly drunk (tight), remarks to the others, to himself, to Brett, to anyone who will listen, how Brett is "a lovely piece." Mike makes the comment four times and he refuses to join Bill and Jake at the Ledoux boxing match because he has "a date with this thing here."

Brett, her body, her beauty, and her sexuality, is a thing, an object to Mike and others. She is considered "a piece' and a physical commodity to be possessed for Mike Campbell. Brett often seems to be an object of value seeking value, but whose functions are performed without any reciprocal feeling involved. From Robert Cohn to Mike Campbell and eventually to Romero, Brett prolongs her "misery," while Jake as an emotional voyeur, and the one who could bring her some degree of intimacy, is ultimately unable to fulfill love's natural desire and expression. She feels that between lovers she must experience some form of cleansing to make a clean transition. However,

[163] ibid, 84.

even after her dinner and night with Mike Campbell it is imperative to note what has not happened.

The next evening Jake stops by the Select again to see Brett and Mike. There it is decided that Brett and Mike will join Bill and Jake in Pamplona. Before they make their way out of the bar, Mike decides that he needs a haircut and Brett announces to Jake, "I must bathe…Walk up to the hotel with me, Jake. Be a good chap."[164] Brett still has not bathed and she speaks to Jake as if he was a little boy. This is important. The bath that was supposed to take out the presence of Cohn, the bath that took precedent over food, but not over drink, and the bath that also could not wait for Mike Campbell, still, has not happened. Meanwhile, Jake follows after Brett like a dog or a child. For Brett, there has been no ritual break or cleansing between Cohn and Mike. Everybody is becoming everybody else.

It is in this walk to the hotel, where the unclean Brett makes her confession to Jake about being in San Sebastian with Robert Cohn. The expressed need to bathe and her procrastination of bathing between her various lovers reveal Brett's inability to come to terms with her promiscuity and its meaning. Jake's response to Brett's confession is 'Congratulations.' After Brett says that she thought it would be rather good for Cohn, Jake says, 'You might take up social service.'[165] As we have seen earlier, these comments while showing Jake's cynicism and loss of emotional stoicism also reveal that if Brett is not struggling to come to terms with her promiscuity and lovers, at least he is.

Before her confession, in the middle of all of this drinking, not bathing, and talk about San Sebastian there is another vital piece of dialogue in a comment Jake makes to Brett in their initial reunion scene with Bill Gorton after Brett has returned from San Sebastian. Jake asks her questions about her trip.

---

[164] ibid, 88.
[165] ibid, .89.

> Brett looked at me. “I was a fool to go away,” she said. “One’s an ass to leave. Paris.”
> “Did you have a good time?”
> “Oh, all right. Interesting. Not frightfully amusing,”
> “See anybody?”
> “No, hardly anybody. I never went out.”
> “Didn’t you swim?”
> “No, didn’t do a thing”[166]

Here, Jake expresses an urge of his own. There is no other precedent to think that Brett and Jake share in the activity of swimming, and Jake’s question reveals more about what he wants to be doing and what he needs. Brett’s claim that she never went out is a half-truth. She did not go out because she was with Robert Cohn. Jake’s question—“Didn’t you swim?”—sticks out immediately and again reveals something essential to Jake’s psyche. Swimming is an unrealized and unarticulated need with which he has yet to come to terms.

“IT FELT AS IF...”: THE SWIM IN THE WATERS OF SAN SEBASTIAN

With the various meanings of the symbolic names and conversations that anticipate Jake’s swim at San Sebastian, we can now turn our attention to the actual swim. Mike and Bill have gone back to Paris and Jake heads to a small town on the French side of the border and then to San Sebastian. After settling into the hotel at San Sebastian Jake goes for a swim at the beach, The reader is reminded of Brett, who never went swimming and Hubert, the traveling young boy from America who went crazy until he could get into water. As Jake enters the water, the tide is going out, the waves are not high, not too threatening. It is not “too rough,” and Jake is able swim under the

water, under the waves using the “slow weight” of the water. On a raft, he pulls himself up and lies down noticing at the other end a girl, lying on her stomach with the top strap of her bathing suit undone, tanning her back. Lying next to her is a boy. Their interaction is simple. She laughs at the things he says. Jake notes this and then dives several times into the deep waters with his eyes *open*, before going back to shore. The imagery here reflects both a primordial sense of origin as well as a psychological level of interaction: “I dove deep once, swimming down to the bottom. I swam with my eyes open and it was green and dark.” [167] The fact that Jake now has his eyes open and can see clearly is meant to show the clear contrast between his condition now and his status of being ‘blind’ when he left Pamplona.

The baptismal and psychological suggestions and the ritual motion, of going down to the bottom and coming back up are obvious as well as the emphasis on seeing and vision. As noted earlier, Jake is “blinder” then he has ever been before when he leaves Pamplona. Now, he is swimming with his eyes open. In an early section of the novel that was later edited out by Fitzgerald’s suggestion, Jake speaks about blindness and relates it directly with Brett and drunkenness:

> But when Brett had been drunk she always spoke of it as having been blind. ”Weren’t we blind last night, though?” It was short for blind drunk, and the curious part was that she really became, in a way blind. Drinking...real drinking...affected Brett in three successive stages. Drinking, say whiskey and sodas from four o’clock in the afternoon until two o’clock in the morning Brett lost her power of speech and just sat and listened, then she lost her sight...[168]

The early manuscript shows the link not only between drunkenness and blindness, but also between these two elements and Brett. It is painfully clear at this point in the novel that Brett and Jake can not have a healthy relationship. His impotency

---

[166] ibid, .81.
[167] ibid, 239.

magnifies and becomes a pervasive impotency and ineffectual passivity in which Jake is driven to drink and resignation. His continued hope for a relationship with her despite his injury in turn provides Brett an excuse for her promiscuity. She can not be with the man she loves, so she in turn seeks satisfaction from other men whom she does not love. As long as Jake provides the illusion of a possible future love, Brett has the reason to continue to search for reciprocity.

We see Jake's subconscious projection of Brett in the images at San Sebastian. The boy and girl on the raft represent a certain type of character interaction throughout Jake's brief stay in San Sebastian. That night at dinner, Jake dines with a number of cyclists who are a part of a bicycle race. Everyone on the bicycling teams is enjoying themselves and the interaction between teams after a long day racing is communal and non-competitive. The conversation is candid, but they refuse to repeat certain stories and jokes when asked by two French girls. Open crudeness of the Mike Campbell variety is not part of their interaction. Instead, it is simple. One of the riders receives a smile from one of the girls at the end of the table. He blushes. Would anyone in the charmed and sophisticated circles in Pamplona or Paris be capable of a blush? The bicycle riders and the French girls, like the sunbathing boy and girl, simply enjoy each other. Jake's perspective is limited and his position as an outsider might not let us into the complexities of the group, but in this context, these images offer a striking contrast to the various decaying relationships at the Fiesta.

Hemingway's choice of image and detail is essential throughout the scenes in San Sebastian. We can see their most careful usage during Jake's second swim. These details, carefully chosen, all point to and suggest Jake's convalescence. The first swim provides Jake with open eyes and clarity. The next morning when he goes to the beach

---

[168] Found in Stonebeck's essay "From the rue Saint-Jacques to the Pass of Roland to the Unfinished Church on the ege of the Cliff."

for another swim, we see through those clear eyes and the images they process. The bicycle riders have left, and Jake decides to go down to the beach where,

> *Nurses* in uniform and in *peasant costume* walked under the trees *with children*. The Spanish children were *beautiful*. Some bootblacks sat together under a tree talking to *a soldier*. The soldier had *only one arm*. The tide was in and there was a *good breeze* and a surf on the beach.[169]

The nurses in uniform represent what Brett *once was* during the war and the fact that they are with children represent what Brett *will never be* after the war. Brett's motherly instinct only goes as far as, "I do not want to be one of those bitches that ruins children," after the affair with Romero is over. The peasant clothing, the simplicity, the order, and the maternal aspects offer a stark contrast with jerseys, jet-set styles, and short hair cuts. The term "beautiful" does not exactly describe the children, nor is it supposed to; instead it generates a sense of their interaction with the nurses, with the landscape, with each other is like. What *is* described is the soldier who is one-armed, injured, but who, sitting against a tree, in a state of repose, interacts naturally with his environment, despite his handicap. So too will Jake after his swim.

Jake gets into the water and the waves are rougher then the day before. Jake is unable to swim directly through them, so he must dive from time to time. But once he makes it to the calm, "quiet" waters he turns and floats on his back seeing only the sky and feeling the force, the give and take, back and forth, of the waves under him, holding him up. Jake goes swimming out to the raft, in the middle of the high tide. Now Jake is in a different psychological landscape. In the first nighttime scene of the novel, Jake was only able to stop his mind from jumping around when he focused on Brett. This focus produces a sensation of his mind moving "in sort of smooth waves."[170] After this, the first

[169] ibid, 280.
[170] ibid, 112.

nighttime scene of smooth waves, Jake then breaks down and starts crying. We have also seen the image of water in relation to the psyche during the last night in Pamplona when he felt he was "sailing off."

But now there are no tears and no drunkenness. Instead he is swimming with the sensation that "you could never sink." Now the importance of the bath, which never came after the punch with Cohn, becomes clear. The bath he had as child, "a deep, hot bath, to lie back in deep water..."[171] which comforted him after the wound to the head, is cleansing him now.[172] Also now Jake's advice to young Hubert seems clear. In rough waters, swimming must be controlled. Here Jake is enacting the code of Romero of grace in action.

The most significant action in the novel is this second swim and Jake's liminal experience. Here the fragmented parts of himself are able to meet in an accord. Jake's swimming gathers a momentum that points to his psychological and spiritual convalescence. Here, in full, is Hemingway's description of the second swim (emphasis mine):

> I swam out, trying to swim through the rollers, but having to dive sometimes. Then in the *quiet* water I turned and floated. *Floating* I saw only the sky and felt the drop and lift of the swells. I swam back on the coast and coasted in, face down, on a big roller, then turned and swam, trying to keep in the trough *and not have a wave break over me*. It made me tired swimming in the trough, and I turned and swam out to the raft. The water was buoyant and cold. *It felt as though you could never sink*. I swam *slowly*, it *seemed like a long swim* with the high tide, and then pulled up on the raft and sat, dripping on the boards that were becoming hot in the sun...The raft rocked with the *motion of the water*. On the other side of the narrow gap that led into the open sea was another headland. I thought I would like to swim across the bay *but I was afraid of cramp.* I sat in the sun and watched the bathers on the beach. They looked very small. After a while I *stood up*, gripped with toes *on the edge* of the raft as it tipped with my weight, and dove *cleanly and deeply*, to *come up through* the lightening water, *blew the salt water out of my head*, and swam *slowly* and *steadily* to the shore.[173]

.

[171] ibid, 224.
[172] ibid, 244.
[173] ibid

Jake, like Nick Adams refuses to push himself past exhaustion. Just as Nick identified fishing the swamp as a tragic adventure, so too Jake after having "tragic sensations" at the bullfight knows not to swim out to the other headland in fear of cramp. This takes us back to the mortal awareness that Jake has achieved. He knows his limits and instead of swimming for distance, dives for depth. The analogy should strike us cleanly as Jake dives, "*cleanly and deeply*," and then comes up through "the lightening water" and *blows " the salt water out of my head*." This scene suggests ritualistic baptism, cleansing, and psychological renewal for Jake. The dive ends with Jake blowing salt water out of his "head." This, of course, is the same head that was kicked in the football game, punched by Robert Cohn, and the head that is the locus of Jake's capacity to make a significant change in his life in regards to Brett. Jake swims to shore. This is another image of Jake somehow coming home, to safety after having gone "sailing off." The images associated with water and healing have now come to a completion. With Jake's experience of a psychological renewal, we can see after a careful reading, that he is ready for the challenges of life and being wounded.

His convalescence is tested immediately. The interruption of Brett's call for help, the return to see Brett, is going to put a short end to a six-day experience. But it also seems to interrupts *the* significant action of the text. The swim has shown Jake's progression and yielded an experience of how to live in it with conscious awareness, without fake laughter and with a new code. Critics such as Spilka see Jake's return to Brett as an act of weakness and surrender. However, the text seems to suggest something else. Like Romero, Jake is experiencing his own "pure line of action" through "maximum exposure." To make his inner journey complete, he must see Brett again and confront the desire and desperation that has long held him captive. He must return to

Brett without sacrificing to her his self-respect or dignity, which he has seemed to recover at San Sebastian.

Another reason Jake goes back to see Brett is that he simply can not ignore the telegram. Jake is a good friend to most, even Cohn, throughout the novel. His primary concern when Brett leaves with Romero is that Mike has not left her with any money. Jake must see her now without Cohn, Mike, or Romero but on his own terms. With that in mind, it is necessary to note where Brett's telegram is coming from. Brett's telegram reads,

COULD YOU COME HOTEL MONTANA MADRID
AM RATHER IN TROUBLE BRETT.

Again, we find mention of the name of Montana. This should trigger for us a number of reflections. First of all Hotel Montana, sounds similar to Montoya who owned the hotel in Pamplona, but who also, and more importantly, was the keeper of the code Jake had betrayed. Though Jake has betrayed this code, he seems to have won back a degree of autonomy through the swim at San Sebastian. By placing Brett in a hotel with a name similar to the house of Montoya, we see reflections of the limen experience Jake has undergone at San Sebastian and the test he must undergo again. The second immediate association Brett's location Hotel Montana, conjures for us, is the image of young Hubert from Montana looking to swim, trying to find water, before he goes crazy. Montana reminds us of Hubert's longing and Jake's warning to avoid dangerous waters. Jake's swimming at San Sebastian and Hemingway's use of Montana immediately following the swim, should draw us back into the conversation between Hubert and Jake and remind us of the potential healing powers of water.

Like Romero, Jake must expose himself to the greatest possible danger. This danger, the complexity of his desire for Brett, has been the situation he has been unable to control throughout the novel. Upon his arrival in Madrid, Jake finds Brett's room in "that disorder produced only by those who have always had servants."[174] Another sign of disorder and chaos in which Brett fits into the background. Jake finds Brett on the bed, miserable, shaking, trembling, and crying. She falls into his arms and feels "small." Brett's sudden shrinkage in size is a revealing image. She is no longer the large, center of gravity in Jake's consciousness. Rather, she is light, small, and of no burden. Jake allows Brett to talk about the affair with Romero just as much as she wants to. Brett tells Jake that Romero "wiped out that damned Cohn" for her. But what Brett does not know is that Romero and the swim at San Sebastian has wiped her out of Jake's consciousness. In this scene, we are shown Brett in a moment of desperation and honesty. She admits that she is going back to Mike Campbell because he is her sort of thing, "nice and awful." As Jake goes to pay the bill at the Hotel Montana he finds that he cannot. It has already been paid. Romero has paid the bill. He, like the count, has learned how to get his money's worth. After leaving the hotel and going to the Bar at the Palace Hotel, Brett tells Jake that she does not want to talk about it and then insists on talking about it. "He was born in 1905. I was in school in Paris, then. Think of that," she tells Jake. "Anything you want me to think about it?" Jake asks. The subsequent conversation with Brett and its tone, distanced, cynical, represents Jake's attempt to provide companionship for Brett during her misery while at the same time not becoming miserable himself. This tension of the shifting balance in the relationship is seen throughout but is clearly evident when Brett says, "You know it makes one feel rather

[174] ibid, 283.

good deciding not to be a bitch...It's sort of what we have instead of God." Jake responds, "Some people have God...Quite a lot."[175]

We see this shift again at the lunch up stairs at Botin's, which is "one of the best restaurants in the world." Jake's appreciation of the things of the world, satisfaction with slowly enjoying meal and drink and company, is evident. Jake has learned the value of things like the count before him. He is also finding the metaphysical encouragement of Ecclesiastes, which finds that there is nothing "There is nothing better for mortals than to eat and drink, and find enjoyment in their toil.[176] Jake enjoys his meal. He drinks three bottles of rioja alta by himself. Brett eats very little and is astonished at Jake's capacity to eat. "My God! What a meal you have eaten." These contrasting images of the healthy, rejuvenated Jake and the sickly Brett continue. Jake asks her if she wants some desert. She declines and then Hemingway writes, in a short, imagistic, declarative sentence that has the effect of a jab or a quick punch, "Brett was smoking." These contrasting images of health show how far Jake has come in a very small amount of time. Jake is hungry and is being satisfied. Brett is sickly and still miserable. There is now a decided gap between Brett and Jake both in terms of health and in their understanding of each other. This is shown through the subtle shifts that occur throughout the conversation.

> "You like to eat, don't you? she said.
> "Yes, I like to do a lot of things."
> "What do you like to do?"
> "Oh," I said, "I like to do a lot of things. Don't you want a dessert."

Jake distances himself from Brett without being rude or unseemly. Jake orders another bottle of *rioja alta* and Brett pathetically pleads with him that he does not have to get drunk. She does not understand Jake's pleasure in drinking the wine. It is no longer

[175] ibid, 287.
[176] Ecclesiastes 2:24

an escape for Jake. Rather, it is an aspect of his life in which he has learned to appreciate the value. He finally tells her that they can take go for a ride around Madrid, a city, like San Sebastian, that she has not seen because she has spent all of her time inside. Before they leave the restaurant Jake says, “I’ll finish this.” A direct reference to both the wine and the relationship with Brett.

Jake and Brett find a taxi that turns out onto the *Gran Via*, the Great Way, a metaphorical suggestion of the highway of life. Both Spilka and Drakier are able to read the images and the scene correctly here. Here we will recount Hemingway’s final masterful lines of the novel,

> “Oh, Jake,” Brett said, “we could have had such a damned good time together. “
> Ahead was a mounted policeman in khakis directing traffic. He raised his baton. The car slowed suddenly pressing Brett against me.
> “Yes,” I said, “Isn’t it pretty to think so.”
>
> THE END

The images here are revealing. We are back to the beginning of the novel with Jake and Brett in the backseat of a car. However, a mounted policeman in khakis, representing both sexual overtones and the authoritative structures from the war, raises a baton, another sexual image that also reflects the state authority of throwing people together. Brett is literally pushed up against Jake. Here we see the images of the war, of potency, of desire, and Brett all come together in the moment of greatest pressure, but Jake performs gracefully. He does not grovel. He does not beg. He does not surrender to sentimental, wistful, longing and imagining. He also does not respond in anger or resentment. In an interesting note, Hemingway originally had the last line read, “Its nice as hell to think so.” However, this line would have in turn suggested that Jake was somehow still bitter and resigned. However, the line “pretty to think so,” reveals how far Jake has come. The desire of Brett is no longer able to torture or hold sway over his

actions. The first line of “nice as hell” carries with it the tone of violence, a threat or the echo of a past grievance. The second holds finality with a gravity that is not hostile, but it is cutting. Jake sees the relationship not only as a platonic friendship, but also the thought of a romantic relationship in a platonic form. It is somewhere in the world of ideals and essences. This world no longer holds Jake Barnes hostage. “Yes, it would be nice to think about, in the realm of ideas,” Jake seems to be saying. However, Jake Barnes world no longer exists in the realm of ideas or imaging.

It is a triumphant line and a line of sad recognition. Jake is no longer blinded and he is no longer holding Brett hostage. Hemingway’s ending also carries with it another significance. Just as Jake’s proclamation, “I’ll finish this,” resonates with the conclusion of his relationship with Brett, so too does Hemingway’s placement of “THE END” directly following the last sentence of the novel. Hemingway placed the line directly under the last line of dialogue, giving the impetus and momentum of the reading experience a conclusion to let us know also that this is THE END in another sense. Brett and Jake will no longer live under the illusion of lovers, damned lovers, fate-stricken lovers, lovers in thought, lovers in imagination or lovers at all. That is over for Jake. Where Romero wiped out that damned Cohn for Brett, the relationship of Jake and the two men is more complex. Cohn brings out the football memory for Jake. This begins the process of coming to terms with the illusion of romantic love with Brett. Romero also provides the crucial example of the code and the epitome of the grace in action. However, for all his grace, courage, and youth, Romero is not the hero of the novel as Spilka insists. For that to be the case, Jake’s conclusion must point to an emotional state beyond repair. Jake is not beyond repair as evidenced by his time in San Sebastian. Jake’s time there is evidence that he can still interact with the world around him. Just as the maimed soldier on the beaches of San Sebastian, sat in a state of relaxation with the nurses and children, the boy and girl, around him, so too Jake’s interaction with Brett points to a

restoration of Jake's health and perspective. Jake has wiped out Brett through the process of swimming in the waters of San Sebastian. These waters, as we have seen throughout this chapter, resonate with healing and redemption for Jake. San Sebastian was the place of his impotency where Brett's force and his inability to act were felt most deeply. However, it is through swimming slowly and controlled that Jake creates his own redemption and healing. Jake has come to terms with his wound through negating the ways of life that will continue his torture and affirming the image of Romero the need for purity of motion. Through this process, Jake emerges, at the end of the novel transformed, changed, newer to himself, and ready for a life lived no longer *in spite of* his wound but *because* of his wound.

CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSION

The Sun Also Rises *is* a difficult book to read correctly. Hemingway's polished prose gives the narrative a momentum that is deceivingly simply. However, by looking at the complex system of images in relation to Robert Cohn and Jake Barnes we can begin to read the novel with greater appreciation of Hemingway's careful, imagistic craftsmanship. By looking at the nature of these images, we have seen how the ending of the novel should be read. Through looking at the relationship of football with war and manhood within the psyche of Robert Cohn and Jake Barnes we see the essential differences of their struggles. For Cohn, this relationship points out the flaws of his romantic code in regards to Brett and his existential potential. He seems to be in a early form of a mid-life crisis. Jake, on the other hand, is undergoing a different type of crisis. Jake is not seeking to have *more* experience rather, he is trying to come to terms with the experience of trauma that he is re-living and re-experiencing.

By looking in depth at the history of American Football, we have seen that the relationship between football and war is clear. Jake' s reliving of the wound in the context of a football memory is normal for trauma survivors. Daniel Schacter's work on the functions of memory reminds us that Jake's strange walk across the plaza is typical for victims of traumatic accidents. As Schacter notes these memories, though painful and often frightening, can also serve a healthy function of allowing powerful forces in the psyche to be dealt with. Hemingway accomplishes this psychological unfolding by using complex and subtle images. In order to see how Jake changes we must pay attention to how Jake speaks, acts, eats, swims, and most importantly, *what* he remembers and *where* he remembers it. By looking at these details closely, we can see how Jake

achieves his convalescence. Jake has accomplished a particularly modern sense of healing in the waters of San Sebastian. The church could not provide solace or comfort and neither could his group of friends. Instead, Jake had to create his own healing. For Jake this means returning to San Sebastian and exposing himself to the elements of physical and psychological danger. Doing so, he finds his own pure line of motion; a line he is able to maintain in his greatest test—the return to Brett. At San Sebastian Jake discovers something akin to what we find in the words of Nietzsche when he writes, "You must learn how to emerge out of unclean situations cleaner, and if necessary to wash yourself with dirty water." [177] Jake, in the end, emerges renewed through his ability to encounter the darker facets of his memory and pain. At the end of the novel, we realize that Jake like young Hubert from Montana was going crazy until he found a body of water: this is a body of water that he has been searching for some time.

With the affirmative conclusion of The Sun Also Rises, Hemingway offers a response to the prospect of finding healing in the modern world. This healing is shown through both the powers of negation and affirmation. This process is particularly modernist. In a larger scope, for Hemingway, the death of God, is also the death of the omniscient author and narrative voice.[178] This death would be marked in different and distinct ways. For James Joyce it is in the use of stream of consciousness and intertexuality, for William Faulkner it is the use of fragmentation within narrative voice. Hemingway, though affirming the reality of nihilism, does not leave us there. As we have seen, Hemingway's solution is complex.

---

[177] Friedrich Nietzsche. Human, all-too Human: A Book for Free Spirits, trans. by R.J. Hollingdale, (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1996), 230.

[178] In a letter to Maxwell Perkins, Hemingway reflects on his aesthetic and philosophic reasons why he keeps the tightness of his style and literary vision." I don't want to write it like Tolstoi and the book seem larger, wiser, and all the rest of it. But then I remember that was what I always skipped in Tolstoi...I don't want to write it like God. It is only because you never do it, that the critics think that you can't do it.") Ernest Hemingway from Selected Letters of Ernest Hemingway 1917-1961 ed. by Carlos Baker, (Charles Scribner's and Sons, New York, 1981), p.544.

For Hemingway, in The Sun Also Rises and throughout his prose, there is an emphasis on re-constructing the wounded body. This modern body, which has been wounded either through an anti-natural metaphysic,[179] a government eager and ready to send soldiers to die,[180] or the basic inevitable wear and tear of old age and death,[181] is the locus of meaning for Hemingway. Addressing the body's concerns, expressing the body through art and activity becomes a process of affirmation and courage. This process, as we have seen, is a response to both original nihilism and the nihilism particular to the modern world. Because of this, throughout Hemingway's prose, we are always within the world of an intense individual experience and set of problems. For Hemingway, the encounter with nihilism can only be overcome through a reconstruction of meaning by the body and the creation of a new code that radically affirms *this* existence within its limits. The voice of this project is similar to the one we find in the opening lines of D.H. Lawrence's poem "For the Heroes are Dipped in Scarlet:" [182]

> Before Plato told the lies of ideals
> men simply went like fishes and didn't care
>
> They had long hair like Samson,
> and clean as arrows they sped at the mark
> when the bow-cord twanged.
>
> They knew it was no use knowing
> their own nothingness:
> for they were not nothing.

Re-establishing the *something* which man is, in light of original nihilism, will take

[179] The short story "God Rest You Merry Gentlemen" gives the story of a young boy who overcome with the tension of his feeling of "awful lust" and its "sin against purity...against our Lord and Savior," castrates himself on Christmas Eve.
[180] The complexity of National governments, revolutions, and modern war is a theme which is found throughout Hemingway's work and is perhaps rendered best in the longer novels For Whom the Bell Tolls and A Farewell to Arms.
[181] The Classic The Old Man and the Sea which serves not only as model for man's limitation with age, but also man's existential limitations and potentialities
[182] D.H. Lawrence. The Collected Poems, (Penguin Publishers, New York, 1993), "For the Heroes are Dipped in Scarlet," p.688.

place within a wounded body that strives to recognize and affirm its wound and this world. Because of this, Hemingway's strength as a writer is not in showing a number of characters with conflicting desires in socially complex and charged situations. He is not an epic writer. He is a lyrical writer, in his best moments a poet, and it is the intensity by which he renders a select reality and individual reality, through which we meet him. As we have seen, this is not just an aesthetic expression, but is also a philosophical and 'spiritual' one in light of the reality particular to the nihilism of the modern world. Jake Barnes offers us a unique vision of overcoming and convalescence. This is accomplished through the focus on the wounded body and its potential for meaning and healing. This process will provide the means for reconstructing meaning in a world which has witnessed the death of God.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ernest Hemingway from Selected Letters of Ernest Hemingway 1917-1961 ed. by Carlos Baker, (Charles Scribner's and Sons, New York, 1981).

Carlos Baker. Hemingway: A Life Story, (Macmillan Library Reference, New York, 1990).

Susan F. Beegel. "Eye and Heart: Hemingway's Education as a Naturalist," from A Historical Guide to Ernest Hemingway, ed. Linda Wagner Martin (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2000).

Maurice Blanchot. The Writing of The Disaster, translated by Ann Smock, (University of Nebraska Press, Lincoln, 1995).

Harold Bloom. Modern Critical Views: Ernest Hemingway, ed. Harold Bloom, (Chelsea House Publishers, New York, 1985).

Pacal Covici Jr. Introduction to The Red Badge of Courage, (Penguin Books, New York, 1983).

J.A.Cuddon. The Penguin Dictionary of Literary Theory and Literary Terms, (Penguin Books, London,1977).

Allison Danzig. The History of American Football, (Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, 1956).

John Ellis. Eye-Deep in Hell: Trench Warfare in World War, (John Hopkins University Press, Baltimore).

Susan Faulidi. Stiffed: The Betrayal of the American Man, (Perennial, New York, 1999).

Michael Foucault. "Nietzsche, Genealogy, and History," from The Focault Reader, (Pantheon Books, New York, 1984).

Paul Fussell. The Great War and Modern Memory, (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1975).

Martin Gilbert. The First World War, (Henry Holt and Company, New York, 1994).

Ernest Hemingway.

-The Sun Also Rises, from The Hemingway Reader, ed. by Charles Poore, (Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1960).

-The Green Hills of Africa, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 1935).

-Death in the Afternoon, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 1960).

-The Nick Adams Stories, (Simon and Schusters, New York, 1996).

- A Farewell to Arms (Scribner Publishers, New York, 1995).

-A Moveable Feast, (Scribners, New York, 1995).

-"Now I Lay Me," from The Collected Short Stories of Ernest Hemingway, (Scribner Publishers, New York, 1998).

John Keegan. The First World War, (Vintage Books, New York, 2000,)

D.H.Lawrence. The Collected Poems, (Penguin Publishers, New York, 1977).

Alphonso Lingis. "The Will to Power," from, The New Nietzsche, ed. by David Allison, (MIT Press, Cambridge, 1999).

Linda Wagner Martin, "One Debt to Imagism," from Critical Essays on: The Sun Also Rises, ed. James Nagel, (Prentice Hall International, London, 1995), 63-74.

James Mellow. Hemingway: A Life Without Consequences, (Perseus Books Group Publishing, New York, 1993).

Albert Murrary. The Blue Devils of Nada, (Pantheon Books, New York, 1996)

Friedrich Nietzsche.

-The Will to Power, translated by Walter Kauffman.(Vintage Publishing, New York. 1968).

-The Twilight of The Idols, translated by R.J. Hollingdale, (Penguin Books, London, 1990).

-Human, all-too Human: A Book for Free Spirits, translated by R.J. Hollingdale, (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1996).

Michael Orchid's Reading Football: How the Popular Press Created An American Spectacle, (University of North Carolina Press, Chapel Hill, 1993).

Richard L Rubenstein. The Cunning of History: The Holocaust and the American Future, (Harper and Row, New York, 1975).

Daniel Schater. The Seven Sins of Memory: How the Mind Forgets and Remembers, (Houghton Millfin Company, Boston, 2001).

Jonathan Shay's Achilles in Vietnam: Combat Trauma and the Undoing of Character, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 1995).

Mark Spilka."The Death of Love in The Sun Also Rises," from, Ernest Hemingway: Modern Critical Views, ed. by Harold Bloom, (Chelesa House, New York, 1985), 107-119.

David Farmer.The Oxford Dictionary of Saints, (Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1997).

Wallace Stevens. "Esthetique Du Mal," from Stevens: Collected Poetry and Pose, (The Library of America, New York, 1997).

Victor Turner. The Ritual Process, (Aldine Publishers, Chicago, 1969).

Richard Whittingham. The Rites of Autumn: The Story of College Football, (The Free Press, New York, 2000).

Warren Wilden. "Trout Fishing and Self-Betrayal In The Sun Also Rises," *Arizona Quarterly* 37, no. 1 (1981).

Jane E. Wilson. "Good Old Harris in The Sun Also Rises," Critical Essays on Ernest Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises, ed. James Nagel, (Prentice Hall International, London, 1995), 185-191.

Edmund Wilson. "Hemingway: Gauge of Morale," from, The Wound and the Bow, (Ohio University Press, Columbus, 1997).

Stanley Weintraub. Silent Night: The Story of the World War Christmas Truce, (Simon and Schuster, New York, 2001).